The Journal of Contemporary Development and Management Studies (JCD&MS) is a national peer-reviewed journal dedicated to connecting research to practice. JCD&MS recognises the value of qualitative, quantitative and mixed/interrelated methods in analysis of data. The journal seeks to be relevant both to a core disciplinary constituency of Alternative Providers of education, of Universities as well as a broader readership. It is the official research journal of London Churchill College (LCC) and actively encourages contributions from individuals and other educational institutes.

Manuscripts published in JCD&MS are reviewed by accomplished scholars in the subject area of the manuscript and in the disciplinary approach used.

Disclaimer

The Publisher, LCC and Editorial Panel cannot be held responsible for errors of any consequences arising from the use of information published in JCD&MS. The views expressed by the contributors are not necessarily the views of LCC.

Copyright and copying

JCD&MS is published annually in one, two or three issues. It is free of charge at point of delivery for both print and online versions. JCD&MS places no restriction on copying or sharing any published material.

Delivery terms and legal title

Application may be made for print copies to be delivered to UK addresses. Normally a small charge would apply for postage and packing.

Back issues

Occasionally print versions of back issues are available on request. Online versions are available via LCC’s website: www.londonchurchillcollege.ac.uk/jcd&ms
## Contents

**Introduction** ........................................................................................................................................... 4  
Tommie Anderson-Jacquest, PhD, Principal Editor

**Contributors** ........................................................................................................................................ 8  
Tommie Anderson-Jacquest, PhD, Principal Editor

**Editorial. Surviving and Transiting 2020: A Year like No Other Years** .................................................. 12  
Nick Papé, PhD

**The Immoral Superego: Conscience as the Fourth Element in the Structural Theory of the Mind** ........ 15  
Donald L. Carveth, PhD

**The Colonial Politics of the Plague: Reading Camus in 2020** ................................................................. 28  
Nasser Amin

**Globalization and the New Realities in the Muslim World** .................................................................... 39  
Mohd Abbas Abdul Razak and Sayed Sikandar Shah Haneef

**Literature Review: The Use of Technology in International Markets** .................................................... 55  
Sisi Wang, Mehfuzul Haque and Golam Faqruzzaman

**Literature Review: Challenges and Opportunities of Entering International Markets** ....................... 60  
Sohel Rana

**Literature Review: Evaluation of Delivery Strategy Standardization; Adaptation within the Framework of International Strategic Marketing** ................................................................. 68  
Md Shohidul Islam Rajeb

**Literature Review: Talent Management** .................................................................................................... 80  
Sraboni Sikder and Don Dulari Wijesuriya

**Literature Review: Education and Social Class, A Focus on Marxist Ideology** .................................... 88  
Golam Faqruzzaman and Tasnim Jahan

**The Perceptions in France of Higher Education Programmes Taught in English** .............................. 94  
Nicolas Verger

**Transformation Experiences During the Covid-19 Pandemic: Higher Education Institute (HEI) Case Study** ........................................................................................................................................ 113  
Nick Papé PhD, Rahaman Hasan and Mazharul Islam

**Theory for and as Social Practice of Realizing the Future: Implications from a Transformative Activist Stance** ........................................................................................................................................... 119  
Anna Stetsenko, PhD
Introduction

Tommie Anderson-Jacquest, PhD, Principal Editor

In February 2021, London Churchill College still grapples with uncertainties occasioned by the outset of a global pandemic that continues to impact adversely upon teaching, administrative and research activities. Nevertheless, I am very pleased to report that contributors have risen to the challenge and responded positively to ensure the publication of interesting materials in the Journal. The 11 submissions published in Volume 9 demonstrate clearly their commitment, as well as their diverse talents, interests and cultural perspectives.

In Volume 9, \textit{JCD&MS}'s traditional remit to explore issues relating to business, education and health care continues to widen and now encompasses a more diversified array of interesting contributions than has previously been the case. The wider range of contributions demonstrated in Volume 8, which included dissertation research projects produced by students situated in France and articles written by Academics resident in Malaysia, has been expanded to incorporate literary critiques, as well as factual case studies. For the first time, a section featuring literature reviews written by London Churchill College staff members aimed at benefitting students has been included. Articles written by well-established academics situated in the United States have added geographical perspectives to the contributions from Malaysia, and France, initially provided in Volume 8.

Diverse Perspectives

Nick Papé's Editorial, 'Surviving and Transiting 2020: A Year Like No Other Years', provides an interesting perspective on the costs and gains for educational society engendered by the Covid-19 Pandemic. In his view, the focus previously placed upon campus-based learning has given way to virtual modes of learning. Online delivery, in turn, has increased student responsibilities for their own intellectual development and provided opportunities for staff to initiate innovative approaches to teaching and learning. Although it is still too early to render a verdict, increased motivation and improvements in attendance, retention and progression indicate that initial responses to on-line delivery are positive.

Donna Carveth's Article, 'The Immoral Superego: Conscience as the Fourth Element in the Structural Theory of the Mind', explores issues relating to the Superego and Conscience in psychoanalytic theory. In his view, issues relating to the superego, guilt and conscience, largely repressed in the 20\textsuperscript{th} century in favour of other psychoanalytic preoccupations now seem to be resurfacing. Within the article, ideas and
analyses put forward by well-known writers in the field are used to support his claim that concepts such as the superego, ego and conscience, and particularly, conflicts between the superego and conscience, should not be neglected but, rather, form vital components in modern structural theories of the mind.

Nasser Amin’s Article, ‘The Colonial Politics of the Plague: reading Camus in 2020’, provides an interesting analyses and critique of major two works written by Albert Camus: The Plague (1947) and the L’Estranger (The Outsider, 1942). Nasser’s analysis of The Plague is particularly interesting, given the comparisons made about a Plague breaking out in Colonial French Algeria and the current Covid-19 Pandemic. In both cases, the actions taken by officials to various social groups in crises periods impacting adversely on all citizens within the affected areas are taken into account. In the Outsider, social inequalities and behavioural complexities within colonial structures existing in Algeria are developed further. The article concludes with an analysis of Camus’ position as a writer and thinker and his views about the complex and often contradictory nature of humankind.

Dr Mohd Abbas Abdul Razak and Professor Sayed Sikandar Shah Haneef, in their article, ‘Globalization and the New Realities in the Muslim World’, provide an interesting account of past and present views and practices of globalization from a Muslim perspective. Focus is placed upon exploring Islamic perspectives in respect of good governance, politics and brain drain. In their view, Muslims today should have an open mind to globalization, selecting from the West what is useful and discarding what is not. In turn, the West should refrain from attempting to impose hegemony through globalization and intervention, but, instead, use discussion, negotiation and arbitration as the primary mechanisms for issue resolution.

**Literature Reviews**

Five staff members in London Churchill College contributed to the exercise. In each case, the authors expressed their own thoughts in respect of the different topics, in addition to citing the works of well-known specialists in the specific subject area.

The Literature Review written by Sisi Wang, Mehfuzul Haque and Golam Faqruzzaman, explores the Use of Technology in International Markets. Useful examples of Big Data Technology are provided. In their view, strong technological capability within a country will positively influence an organisation’s decision to enter that particular domestic market.

Sohel Rana’s Review focuses upon the Challenges and Opportunities faced by organisations wishing to expand into International Markets. His work begins with background information regarding International Business. Thereafter, detailed discussions of opportunities and challenges of entering foreign markets are provided. He concludes that companies planning to expand operations across borders will face challenges and must weigh them carefully against the opportunities envisaged.
Md Shohidul Islam Rajab’s Review compares the approaches taken to standardisation and adaptation with respect to distribution strategy in the context of international strategic marketing. The advantages and disadvantages of each approach are set out in detail. In his view, the challenge for global organisations is to determine which approach is best suited to a particular domestic market. Decisions should be made on the basis of careful study and judgements made that ensure the organisation’s best opportunities for continued success.

Sraboni Sikder’s and Don Dulari Wijesuria’s Review looks at Talent Management and the processes that should be taken in developing and implementing an effective strategy for managing talent. In their view, the essential purpose of talent management planning is to ensure that companies can attract and retain the workforce talent required by that organisation. Consequently, planning stages in the Talent Management Cycle are discussed in detail and general problems identified. They conclude that an effective strategy of Talent Management positively contributes to an organisation’s success.

Golam Faquzzaman and Tasnim Jahan’s Review considers Education and Social Class from a Marxist perspective: in particular, his idea that education serves as a tool to control class domination in Society. The authors apply that view to an analysis of the UK system of education. In their view, through the mechanism of private schools, the elite class continues to retain its dominant position in the UK social order. They conclude, however, that contrary to Marx’s view, firmly centred in Capitalist institutions, education is an individual matter, and any new idea or knowledge can be education.

Case Studies

Nicolas Verger’s article, ‘The Perceptions in France of Higher Education Programmes Taught in English’ is drawn from his undergraduate dissertation of the same name, originally submitted as part of the BA (Hons) Degree in Global Business programme validated by Coventry University, delivered in France through a number of RenaSup Centres. His research aim was to discover if a demand existed in France for University Programmes taught in English among students and parents and to find out how recruiters perceived English higher education programmes as compared to French ones. To accomplish his objective, a case study was undertaken involving two groups of students and a group of parents. On the basis of survey results, Nicolas concluded that access to programmes delivered in English was deemed beneficial to students who desired to work in international companies but much less so for those who wished to work only in France.

Nick Papé, Rahaman Hasan and Mazharul Islam in their article ‘Transformation Experiences During the Covid-19 Pandemic: Higher Education Institute Case Study’, describe the teaching and administrative experiences of London Churchill in responding to the Covid-19 Pandemic. In the March 2020 lockdown, for example, immediate measures had to be taken to transform patterns of delivery from face-to-face to online provision, while still meeting regulators’ requirements. To develop strategies and implement requisite
changes, new management entities had to be created. In their view, approaches have been effective. Although some difficulties have been experienced, the College’s future looks strong. The online model of delivery has proved popular with students and staff members have adapted well to working from home.

Theoretical perspectives

Anna Stetsenko’s article, ‘Theory for and as Social Practice of Realizing the Future: Implications from a Transformative Activist Stance’ (TAS), makes the case that TAS, with its emphasis on human agency in creating and transforming one’s own world, and, through collective endeavour, transforming the world in general, provides a welcomed alternative to models of psychology that emphasise facts and adaptation. In the TAS model, people are not only agents and creators of their own lives and development but also, by virtue of collaborative ventures, of the world they live in. The views expressed by Vygotsky, particularly in respect of social equality are used to demonstrate and support the author’s arguments for central points within TAS. Anna reminds the reader that the world is not just a given that exists independently of what individuals do, it must be understood as continually changing because of what people do in their individual lives and in their collaborative practices.

These descriptions illustrate the wide-range of topics that can be accommodated comfortably within the JCD&MS remit. Interested parties are encouraged to submit contributions to the Journal. Instructions are set out in the ‘Guidelines for Journal Contributors’, which appears as the final entry in this volume.

On behalf of the editorial team,

Dr Tommie Anderson-Jaquest

Dr Tommie Anderson-Jaquest, PhD, FHEA, FISM

Principal Editor, JCD&MS, Volume 9, 2021
Contributors

Tommie Anderson-Jacquest, PhD, Principal Editor

Anna Stetsenko PhD was born in the former Soviet Union and attended Moscow State University. She is currently a developmental psychologist at the City University of New York. She has developed theories about infants' concepts of thinking and speaking based on the research of Lev Semenovich Vygotsky and Jean Piaget.

Don Dulari Wijesuriya obtained a BA Special (Languages) Degree at Sabaragamuwa University in Sri Lanka, where she received an Educational scholarship awarded by Kizuna Bond Project in Japan covering her undergraduate studies. Since coming to the UK, Don has completed her MBA at the University of Suffolk and is currently undertaking a professional Doctorate in Business Administration (DBA) at the University of the West of Scotland. She is also works as Personal Tutor in London Churchill College. Don's primary research interests centre around service innovation, the hospitality sector and human resource management processes around the world.

Donald L. Carveth, PhD is an Emeritus Professor of Sociology and Social and Political Thought and a Senior Scholar at York University, Toronto, Canada. He is past Director of the Toronto Institute of Psychoanalysis and a past Editor-in-Chief of the Canadian Journal of Psychoanalysis/Revue Canadienne de Psychanalyse.

Golam Faqruzzaman, FHEA, is working as a Programme Leader, Business and Health and Social Care at London Churchill College. After completing his MBA in Marketing, he joined a leading Multi-National Company in Bangladesh and contributed to developing a market-based distribution channel, which was a pioneer in the local telecommunication market. Later he came to the UK and worked in many business organisations, where he gained enormous experience about customer behaviour. As a scholar, Golam has completed three post-graduation qualifications, including an MSS in Political Science, and the latest one from SOAS University of London in Migration Mobility and Development. Golam is also a fellow of the Higher Education Academy. He has interests in international business, politics, and society. Golam has published two papers on social issues in the UK.
Mazharul Islam obtained an MSc in Computer Networks from the University of East London and a BSc from the same institution. He has worked in the UK HE sector since 2011 and is currently employed at London Churchill College as the Head of Data & Information Technology. His main interest of work is analysing HE sector data relevant to performance in respect of Alternative Providers and HEIs (Universities). His research interests are in Corporate Cybersecurity and Prevention Measures.

Md. Shohidul Islam Rajeb was born in Bangladesh. Since coming to the UK, he has obtained a BABM (Hons) in Business Management and an MBA in Banking and Finance from the University of Wales Trinity St David. Shohidul is currently undertaking a PhD, specialising in Islamic Finance, at the University of Bolton. In addition, he also works as part time Personal Tutor in London Churchill College.

Mehfuzul Haque works as a Programme Manager at London Churchill College. Before that he was the Programme Leader and a lecturer for the Higher National Diploma in Business. His major responsibilities are promoting curriculum development and enhancement within the programme and ensuring effective liaison with module tutors in respect of planning, managing and reviewing course delivery and assessment.

Mohd Abbas Abdul Razak PhD obtained a B.A. (Hons) degree in Islamic Education from Universitas Ar-Raniry, Aceh, Indonesia. He returned to Malaysia to complete a Master’s degree in Educational Psychology and a PhD in Education at the International Islamic University Malaysia (IIUM). Dr Abbas is currently an Assistant Professor in the Department of Fundamental & Inter-Disciplinary Studies, KIRKHS, at IIUM, where he teaches courses in Islamic Worldview, Knowledge & Civilization in Islam, Ethics & Fiqh for Everyday Life, and Creative Thinking & Problem Solving, Psychology, and Parenting & Family Management. Dr Abbas maintains an active research profile. He has published the book, *Iqbal’s Theory of Personality: A Contrastive Analysis with Freud* and a number of journal and newspaper articles locally and internationally in the areas of psychology, spirituality, globalisation and Iqbaliat.

Nasser Amin obtained a BA (Hons) degree in Philosophy at the University of Essex. Postgraduate qualifications include an MA in Continental Philosophy (with Distinction) from Warwick University and an MSc in International Politics from the University of London (with Merit). He currently works in academic quality assurance. Nasser has served as the Editor of Britain’s first dedicated national newspaper for the Arab community. Since then, he has worked for the government ombudsman, within the film industry and in Higher Education. His writings and ideas have been quoted and discussed by US Administration policymakers, European Commission officials, and in a number of journal articles and monographs written by academics, including scholars from the University of Edinburgh, Bristol University and Simon Fraser University, Canada. His research interests lie in 19th and 20th Century Continental Philosophy, political theory and postcolonialism.
Nick Papé PhD is the Principal of London Churchill College. He obtained his PhD from the University of Bedfordshire and is a Fellow of the Higher Education Institution (FHEA) in Advance HE. Dr Papé has served as an academic at the University of Cambridge and Leicester University. As an experienced author of journal articles, he frequently co-authors articles and also acts as a mentor to less-experienced authors.

Nicolas Verger obtained a BA (Distinction) in Global Business in 2015 from a Coventry University’s programme offered through the RenaSup group situated in France. Following graduation, additional qualifications have been obtained in the field of Information Technology. He is currently employed as a full-time consultant in El-Technologies, situated in the Greater Paris Metropolitan Region.

Rahaman Hasan, is a PhD candidate at University of Essex, specialising in Entrepreneurship. Prior to PhD engagement he obtained an MBA in General Management from the University of Wales and an MA in Strategic Marketing from the University of Greenwich. In 2007, he joined the Academic department of London Churchill College and is currently the Head of Programmes and Academic Monitoring. Rahaman is an active researcher with specific interests in Entrepreneurship, SME, Marketing and UKHE.

Sayed Sikandar Shah Haneef, Professor, is a Shariah scholar of Afghan nationality. He completed his LLB., M.C.L. and Ph.D degrees at International Islamic University, Malaysia. In 1998, he joined as an Assistant Professor in the Department of Fiqh and Usul al-Fiqh of the same University to teach BA, MA and Ph.D Islamic Jurisprudence Courses. As a researcher, Professor Haneef has published several books, many journal articles and presented numerous conference papers. Some of his research and publications have earned University level and national awards.

Sisi Wang has been a Programme Leader for HND in Hospitality Management at London Churchill College since February 2018. She undertakes both Programme Leader and lecturer roles within the College. She is also a doctoral student at the University of Bedfordshire studying the contemporary representation of China in international tourism and through related inscriptive activity. Currently, she has been investigating differences between so called ‘Eastern’ and ‘Western’ understandings of and about China, focused upon government influence in and from Beijing in rescoping the initial soft power projection of ‘The China Dream’ (for Modern China) as ‘The Chinese Dream’. Her own ongoing research interests include ‘Confucianism’ / ‘Neo-confucianism’ and / ‘Soft Cultural Diplomacy’, each positioned within the context of tourism and its related industries.

Sohel Rana is a PhD student at University of Bolton. Prior to that he obtained his MA in the UK. He currently works at London Churchill College as a Personal Tutor.
Sraboni Sikder obtained an MBA in Hospitality from Anglia Ruskin University in 2015 and, shortly thereafter, joined at London Churchill College as a Personal Tutor. While working in the College’s academic department, she completed successfully the A1 Assessor course to establish her position in the teaching industry. As a consequence of her hard work and the CPD training undertaken, she was promoted to the position of Lecturer in Business and Hospitality in September 2019. Shraboni is currently in the process of completing the FHEA qualification offered under AdvanceHE.

Tasnim Jahan is a researcher based in London. She obtained an MSc in Development Studies from London South Bank University. After completing her BSS (Hons) and MSS in Political Science, she started her academic career as a Lecturer in Bangladesh Studies at Stamford University Bangladesh. Later she joined as a Lecture in Social Science at Bangladesh Open University (Public University in Bangladesh), where she was involved in curriculum development for Social Science modules. Apart from curriculum development, Tasnim has visited many parts of Bangladesh to meet students of Bangladesh Open University (BOU) and has gained enormous knowledge about students’ journeys undertaken with BOU. This experience, in turn, has helped her to provide practical guidance into curriculum development. Tasnim has special interests in refugee movements and education theories. She has published two papers on migration and remittance flows and is currently working on Rohingya Refugee status in Bangladesh.
Editorial. Surviving and Transiting 2020: A Year like No Other Years

Nick Papé, PhD

The Covid-19 pandemic impacts on every fibre of our educational society. As a medium size HE Institute, London Churchill College has witnessed events, participated in events, been affected by events and mitigated against the impact of events that could never have been previously imagined. Perhaps like wider society, the experience has changed and is still changing the outlook and even the *modus operandi* of higher education. Gone is the widespread belief that students’ education can only benefit from campus-based locations, which eschews positive aspects of teaching online. Gone is the fear that students will be inattentive and non-attending if physical presence is not ensured, as if head-counting is a primary aim for entry level Higher Education. Gone is the belief that the essentiality of personal contact with the tutor, so much heralded and researched as being a prime facilitating factor, is irreplaceable.

What is left, what is gained?

Colleges as educators still retain responsibility for education. Students are readjusting to cope with current realities and take increased control of their own education. Time will tell if the students’ increased commitment continues. However, the auguries are positive, as data for the latter half of 2020 evidences higher attendance figures, higher retention and higher award metrics. Whether this is ephemeral, without a firm base for continued performance improvement, is still to be discovered. The freedom now experienced by students has potential downsides, being able to prioritise in the life/study conundrum can be challenging and sometimes defeating, as can be the way such decisions are made. Resilience and adaptability emerge as if ever-present but needing a stimulus.

College and staff benefit from the new scenario of increased student responsibilities. Pressure on facilities and resources are lessened, although these may well be replaced by other pressures. There is now a greater reliance on primarily working from home, so concordant with family freedoms missing in the traditional office-based working models. The move from hours worked evidencing function accomplishment, to tasks completed, can be both challenging and rewarding for staff and managers alike. Creating and adopting scales to make such measurements, continues to stimulate fertile and creative minds. The imperceptible attitude permeating within the College authority, that prescriptive expectations based on hierarchy have served so well in the past, have been supplanted by encouraging increased individual autonomy and creativity. This of course is balanced by multilateral decision-making and individual actioning.
The ground needs to be receptive for such development. The collegiate culture espoused by senior general College management must be achievable and sought after and be appreciated by participants. In other words, like students in the new learning environment, control of working conditions falls to individual staff to overcome domestic and other pressures and prioritise delivery of performance targets and goals under working from home arrangements.

The importance of understanding and developing the mode of teaching is not new. The College’s senior management have continually examined how we can increase student engagement and interaction. Academics have used many techniques and methods and involved students formally and informally, as the important stakeholder, in all major decision processes and indeed every aspect of College life. This is in the knowledge that education is not ‘done to them’ by the educator but is a bipartisan compact, giving real involvement in each stage of change brought about proactively or by reaction to circumstance. Thus, online teaching is born. Already the use of virtual learning platforms has introduced learners to some benefits of studying remotely; now the ability to attend lectures online at a time of choosing in a convenient locale, is time and again identified by individual students and the complete body, as being highly preferable. This message is ‘Manna-from Heaven’ to the College. Now that students’ preferences are known, the College can adapt teaching and learning practices to meet online mode preferences of (blended) learning. Staff retraining has to be undertaken, practices of communicating with students have to be relearned and IT support and monitoring has to be realigned.

Adversity can breed creativity. The need for external intervention is understood to trigger either actions or indeed reflections, as if cognitive processes are only more fully used in a defensive reaction formation in preference to autonomous decision making and mind stretching. Somehow, access to creativity is prevented when experiences warn against risk and perhaps become shackled by the mores of society and regulations couched as expectations in the educational milieu. Research suggests that risk-taking and appropriate intimacy in the lecturer-adult learner relationship can encourage play affording creativity. The nurturing relationship, so crucial for entry level students, provides the opportunity of taking risks in a safe environment, and creativity helps to describe intramental thinking.

To access these processes can be challenging, when opportunities for developing the nurturing relationship are lessened somehow by distance learning. Requirements and resources are needed to access developmental ideas on both interpersonal and intrapersonal planes. To enter debates which afford the opportunity for new perspectives and to use learning from these to reflect on previous or current behaviours are the very essence of personal development. Hence creativity can also describe the processes whereby learners are encouraged to tackle tasks on different planes, where such attempts can be appreciated for the process as well as the content and, most importantly, the individual can take responsibility for development and recognise the steps taken.
This journal edition has real examples of creativity, shown individually and collectively. Starting with the deep-thinking of Don Carveth, so imbued with the struggle of immorality and conscience, superego and obligation, the two models of depressive guilt and reparative guilt; to the breadth of discussion of literature reviews by College academics Sisi Wang, Mehfuzul Haque, Golam Faqruzzaman, Tasnim Jahan, Sraboni Sikder, Don Dulari Wijesuriya, Shohidul Rajeb and Sohel Rana; to Nicolas Verger’s research project focused on the perceptions in France of higher education programmes taught in English; to the teamwork of Nick Papé, Rahaman Hasan and Mazharul Islam representing London Churchill College’s senior management, collaboratively sharing some College experiences; to Abbas Razak and Sayed Hanif’s reflections on globalisation and the Muslim world; to Nasser Amin’s thought provoking offering on Camus’s philosophies; and finally to Anna Stetsenko’s beautifully crafted paper on individuals as co-creators of their own lives.

Some of the articles have been composed with students particularly in mind, these are the literature reviews written to promote further thought and research. Indeed, this journal issue is a challenging read for everyone, whatever the interest level, there is something within these pages that will fascinate and stimulate. That is the hope.
The Immoral Superego: Conscience as the Fourth Element in the Structural Theory of the Mind

Donald L. Carveth, PhD

Abstract

Coinciding with the rise of neo-liberalism and the culture of narcissism, psychoanalytic concern with problems of guilt and the superego was displaced in favour of a range of other preoccupations. Today issues of conscience appear to be returning from repression both in society at large and in psychoanalysis, but our theory in this area is deficient in many respects. We have largely identified the superego with the moral and the id with the immoral, thus downplaying the frequent immorality of the superego and the morality of the id. We have implicitly succumbed to a moral relativism oblivious to the existence of a conscience capable of judging both society and the superego it shapes. If we are to live up to our claim to be “the psychology of the innermost mental processes of man in conflict” (Kris, 1938, p. 140), we need to recognize conflict between superego and conscience—and conscience itself as the fourth element of the structural theory of the mind.

Key Words: Superego, Conscience, Moral, Structural Theories, Freud

1 Taken and updated from the original publication in the Canadian Journal of Psychoanalysis: Revue Canadienne de Psychanalyse 23, 1, 2015: 206-223
Introduction

For decades what Freud (1933) himself regarded as “the preferred field of work for psychoanalysis,” namely “The problems which the unconscious sense of guilt has opened up, its connections with morality, education, crime and delinquency …” (p. 61), has been neglected in favor of a preoccupation with shame, narcissism, self, relatedness, intersubjectivity and, most recently, the neurological foundations of mind. Prior to the 1960s, psychoanalysts viewed superego analysis as central to the analytic process. Some analysts never lost sight of Freudian and Kleinian insight into the dynamics of guilt and self-punishment, but I think it is fair to say that many of the newer psychoanalytic approaches that came to prominence in the 1970s and 80s tended to downplay intrapsychic conflict in favor of an emphasis upon trauma, deprivation, abuse, and neglect by caretakers, that is, the ways in which we are more injured than injurious.

By the late 1950s, Sandler (1960) had already noticed that in the indexing of cases at the Hampstead clinic there was a “tendency to veer away from the conceptualization of material in superego terms;” he was wondering why “therapists have preferred to sort their clinical material in terms of object relationships, ego activities, and the transference, rather than in terms of the participation of the superego” (p. 129). Two decades later, Arlow (1982) observed that “[S]uperego function has been shunted to one side by the current preoccupation with the persistence of the regressive reactivation of archaic idealizations” (p. 230) and that “[T]he concept superego itself rarely appears as the central topic of a clinical or theoretical contribution” (p. 229). Würmser (1998) referred to the superego as the “sleeping giant” of contemporary psychoanalysis.

While the giant slept, having been anaesthetized in both society-at-large and the psychoanalytic thinking it encouraged, Thatcher, Reagan, Milton Friedman, Friedrich von Hayek, Ayn Rand, Alan Greenspan, and a host of others laid the foundations for the dismantlement of the welfare state and, with the avid assistance of the “banksters” and “fraudsters” of Wall Street and “the City,” prepared the ground for the economic crisis of 2007-8. I think it was no accident that the flight from guilt in psychoanalytic thought coincided with the shift from productive industrial to consumer capitalism, the emergence of what Christopher Lasch (1979) called the “culture of narcissism,” and the rise of neo-liberalism or market fundamentalism. Ironically, the psychoanalytic preoccupation in the 1970s and 80s with narcissistic characters incapable of bearing guilt coincided with a flight from guilt in psychoanalysis itself. In several streams of psychoanalytic thought the central role of guilt evasion in pathological narcissism was obscured—an instance of what Russell Jacoby (1975) referred to as the “social amnesia” in which “society remembers less and less faster and faster” and in which “the sign of the times is thought that has succumbed to fashion” (p. 1).

Recently issues concerning the superego, guilt, and conscience appear to be returning from repression. Coinciding with the emergence of the Occupy movement and whistleblowers such as Assange, Manning and Snowdon, psychoanalytic books and articles have begun to appear with titles such as You Ought To! A Psychoanalytic Study of the Superego and Conscience (Barnett, 2007); Guilt and Its Vicissitudes:
Psychoanalytic Reflections on Morality (Hughes, 2008); The Quest for Conscience and the Birth of the Mind (Reiner, 2009); The Still Small Voice: Psychoanalytic Reflections on Guilt and Conscience (Carveth, 2013); “Reflections on the absence of morality in psychoanalytic theory” (Frattaroli, 2013); and Guilt: Origins, Manifestations, and Management (Akhtar, Ed., 2013). No doubt this “comeback” amounts to a reflection in psychoanalysis of a shift in the wider culture: the culture of narcissism got us into hot water. What three decades ago Rangell (1980) described in The Mind of Watergate as the “syndrome of the compromise of integrity” led eventually to the 2008 crisis of “casino capitalism.”

The Superego

Psychiatrist and Ret. Navy Captain Wm. Nash (2012) recently reported on the role of what he calls “moral injury” in a common type of PTSD suffered by returning soldiers who in obedience to a superego shaped by parental and military authority committed unconscionable acts for which they are now unable to forgive themselves. Freud’s (1923) decision to incorporate conscience and the ego-ideal into the superego has prevented us from conceptualizing such conflict as between the superego and the conscience. Instead, we have been forced to think of it as intrasystemic conflict within the superego. Since, according to Freud (1940), the superego “represents more than anything the cultural past” (p. 205), we have tended to conceptualize inner moral conflict either as between incompatible internalized value-orientations, or between internalized values and incompatible, often antisocial, sexual and aggressive impulses arising from the id. We have not been blind to the fact that sometimes what we have been taught is immoral while what we feel or desire is moral, composed of prosocial feelings derived from our attachments and libidinal object relations.

In his classic study, Freud, Women and Morality: The Psychology of Good and Evil, Eli Sagan (1988) cites Mark Twain’s (1885, chapter 31) depiction of “Huck’s Dilemma” to illuminate our bias: while the racist superego Huck has internalized from his culture demands that he turn his runaway slave companion, Jim, in to the authorities, his conscience requires him to protect the friend he loves. After an agonizing mental struggle, Huck finally decides conscientiously to defy his superego and tears up the letter informing on his friend:

But somehow, I couldn't seem to strike no places to harden me against him, but only the other kind. … I was a-trembling, because I'd got to decide, forever, betwixt two things, and I knewed it. I studied a minute, sort of holding my breath, and then says to myself:

All right, then, I'll go to hell—and tore it up.

Huck's conflict is between a moral imperative internalised from a racist society and a sense of obligation derived from feelings of attachment and love. Note that Huck fails to come up with a “compromise-formation.” Like the liberalism upon which it draws, psychoanalysis has been more
than half in love with this idea; but sometimes there are unavoidable forks in the road where no compromise is possible. Here, as Kierkegaard (1843) knew, it is a matter of *Either/Or* and recognizing this fact does not make one guilty of “splitting.”

In *Les Misérables* (Volume Five, Book Fourth, “Javert Derailed”), Victor Hugo (1862) offers a moving illustration of the conflict between superego and conscience. The policeman/superego, Javert, comes finally to be touched by conscience, discovering:

... that one cherishes beneath one’s breast of bronze something absurd and disobedient which almost resembles a heart! As a result, a whole new world was dawning on his soul: kindness accepted and repaid, devotion, mercy, indulgence, violations committed by pity on austerity, respect for persons, no more definitive condemnation, no more conviction, the possibility of a tear in the eye of the law.

Confronted with the “terrible rising of an unknown moral sun,” Javert, who until now has been entirely identified with the superego, chooses suicide. It is true that *Huckleberry Finn* and *Les Misérables* are literature rather than life, but then so is *Oedipus Rex*. (See clinical vignettes further down).

While internal moral conflict can involve incompatible internalized values (e.g., sometimes it is unkind to tell the truth), and while internalized moral values may certainly conflict with antisocial id impulses, sometimes internalizations conflict with prosocial feelings and impulses deriving from libidinal attachments. And sometimes we have conflicting attachments. But what I want to emphasize is that in our thinking about conflict between superego and id, we have had mostly the antisocial (incestuous and aggressive) id and mostly the prosocial superego in mind, neglecting both the antisocial superego and the prosocial id.

**Normality**

Another important thing to notice about Huck’s dilemma is that it does not involve an abnormal, pathological, or archaic superego but a normal, albeit a racist, one. Until fairly recently a homophobic, heterosexist superego was normative in psychoanalytic circles and for years “under the banner of the superego” we rejected gay applicants for training. Many of us now think that superego was immoral. Although we have understood the superego as both aggression turned back against the self and values internalized from parents and society, we have devoted little attention to the racism, sexism, heterosexism, classism, childism (Young-Bruehl, 2012), possessive individualism, commodity fetishism, and so on, that characterize the normal, unconscionable superego. Where we have seen the immorality and destructiveness of the superego at all, we have attributed it to an “abnormal” or “pathological” superego, or to “superego lacunae,” thus resisting recognizing the superego as a pathologically normal, that is, a “normopathic” phenomenon (Hantman, 2008).

Despite Freud’s awareness of the role of the sadistic superego in psychopathology and his overall view of it as a hostile and destructive inner force that at times may even amount to “a pure culture of the death instinct” (Freud, 1923: 52), and despite his resultant call for its clinical “demolition” (Freud, 1940: 180), in his sociological writings he contradictorily
represented it as a prosocial force saving civilization from the antisocial forces of the beastly id. Freud saw the drives as arising from a somatic source, from the animal aspect of our nature. While transcending common sense in many respects, here Freud succumbed to it, projecting our uniquely human destructiveness onto the beasts and the animal in man, when animals are seldom beastly, at least not in the ways humans often are (Carveth, 2012). Thanks to the work of Robert J. Lifton (1986) on The Nazi Doctors, whom he shows were not for the most part psychopaths but superego-driven, racist ideologues, and similar studies of terrorism, “soul-murder,” and other forms of human destructiveness, we are finally forced to recognize the roots of human evil in the superego and the ego, not merely or even primarily in the id. Those responsible for the death camps, like those responsible for dropping an atom bomb on Hiroshima, and then again on Nagasaki—without giving the Japanese a chance to observe a test on an uninhabited island—were not for the most part psychopathic demons but superego-driven “do-gooders” who employed sophisticated ego function in the service of mass murder. In tending to think of conflict as between a moral superego and an immoral id, we have tended to overlook both the immorality of the superego and the morality of the id.

Guilt

We have suffered from a similarly contradictory attitude toward guilt, sometimes seeing it as sadism turned against the self and at others as a sign of advance toward a more mature level of psychic development (Ury, 1998). This contradiction was finally resolved when Klein and her co-workers (Grinberg, 1964) differentiated persecutory guilt (including shame) on the one hand, and depressive or reparative guilt, Winnicott’s (1963) “capacity for concern,” on the other. In this light we are finally able to see that while in civilization we need less of the former (persecutory guilt—what I call superego) we need more of the latter (reparative guilt—what I call conscience). Because he failed to distinguish these two fundamentally different types of guilt, Freud also failed to grasp the role of persecutory guilt (superego) as a defense against depressive guilt (conscience). People often prefer orgies of self-punishment to acknowledging wrongdoing, bearing depressive guilt or concern, and foregoing masochism in favor of conscientious, reparative activity.

Following that side of Freud’s (1940) clinical thinking that called for “the slow demolition of the hostile superego” (p. 180), Ferenczi (1928 [1927]) wrote: “Only a complete dissolution of the super-ego can bring about a radical cure” (p. 100). In this connection, Theodor Adorno (1966) wrote: “A critique of the super-ego would have to turn into one of the society that produces the superego; if psychoanalysts stand mute here, they accommodate the ruling norm” (p. 274). Unlike Ferenczi himself, who was both a political and a psychoanalytic radical, most psychoanalysts have pretty much stood mute here, accommodating the ruling norm.
Conscience

Like Ferenczi, Franz Alexander (1925) regarded the superego as “an anachronism in the mind” (p. 25). The therapeutic task, he wrote, “is carried out by limiting the sphere of activity of the automatically-functioning super-ego and transferring its role to the conscious ego” (p. 25). Because, following Freud (1923), most psychoanalysts have identified conscience with the superego, unlike Ferenczi and Freud himself they have feared its demolition would be tantamount to the promotion of psychopathy. Hence, they have called, like Strachey (1934), for its modification and maturation (Jacobson, 1964; Kernberg, 1976; Schafer, 1960; Gray, 1994; Britton, 2003) rather than its replacement by conscience. Alexander and Ferenczi represent the minority view: against the immoral moralism of the superego they posit a conscience grounded in thinking, a rational ego function in which one thinks through the consequences of one’s actions for oneself and others. We might formulate their dictum as: “Where superego was, there ego shall come to be.”

But the problem with this, as with Freud’s own rationalism, his call for the dominance of the ego over superego and id, is that the rational ego is incapable of serving as a conscience. For while thinking through the consequences of our actions for ourselves and others is relevant to moral decision, reason cannot serve as an authority establishing one value over another. The knowledge that smoking causes cancer and that cancer can cause death is relevant to the decision whether or not to smoke, but reason cannot establish that health is superior to illness, nor life worth living. More recently, Bion (1962) and, following him, Reiner (2009) find the basis for conscientious development beyond the rigid, pseudo-moral superego in thinking. While the type of thinking they have in mind, involving “containment,” reverie, alpha function, etc., leading to “transformations in O,” cannot be reduced to simple ratiocination, it remains significant that they choose to label the mental process they have in mind as “thinking.” In contrast to both Freudian and Bionian rationalism, Sagan (1988) recognized with Jean-Jacques Rousseau (1754) that conscience arises not from reason but from feeling, from what Rousseau called “pity”—sympathy or fellow-feeling. Our feelings of both sympathy and antipathy originate in our histories of attachment and object relations and in what Sagan views as our resulting identifications with the nurturer on one hand and with the aggressor on the other.

Given the fact/value disjunction, the confinement of reason and science to the descriptive field of the id and its incompetence with respect to the prescriptive field of the ought, we are forced to recognize that conscience is fundamentally grounded in non-rational, emotional processes of attachment, sympathy, concern and love, not in the head but the heart—for, as Pascal (1669, Section 4) famously put it, “the heart has reasons reason cannot know.” But even while recognizing the limits of reason, the later Freud placed his confidence in secondary process thinking, regarding feeling, like primary process and the unconscious, with suspicion, associating it with madness rather than valuing it as a source of
existential orientation, potential wisdom and creativity. It is due to this suspicion of feeling and overestimation of reason (which Sagan recognized as stemming from Freud’s devaluation of the feminine, the preoedipal and the maternal) that even those psychoanalysts who recognize the destructiveness of the superego have for the most part felt no need to posit a separate conscience, thinking that the ego itself can serve as a sufficient moral guide. For Freud (1933), “Our best hope for the future is that intellect—the scientific spirit, reason—may in process of time establish a dictatorship in the mental life of man” (p. 170). But anyone who, following Freud’s recommendation, actually succeeded in establishing a “dictatorship of the intellect,” achieving dominance of the ego over id and superego, and living as an “enlightened hedonist” in accordance with the pleasure and reality principles, would today be rightly diagnosed as a pathological narcissist or a psychopath. Freud (1914) himself, it will be recalled, wrote that “A strong egoism is a protection against falling ill, but in the last resort we must begin to love in order not to fall ill, and we are bound to fall ill if, in consequence of frustration, we are unable to love” (p. 84). Conscience is grounded in attachment and love and is beyond both the pleasure and reality principles, as well as being beyond the narcissism in which, as Freud (1914) pointed out, the other we “love” is really nothing more than the self we are, or were, or wish to be.

While few psychoanalysts have followed Freud, Alexander and Ferenczi and defined the goal of psychoanalysis as demolition of the superego, most have shared Strachey’s implicit devaluation of the harsh superego and his conception of the analytic cure as involving, among other things, substantial superego modification or modulation, a development conceived most often as advance beyond an archaic or pathological superego toward a more mature or healthy one. The use of terms such as “archaic” vs. “mature,” and “pathological” vs. “healthy,” cloaks what is really a moral judgment defining love and forgiveness as superior to hate and retribution. Psychoanalysts have traditionally attempted to “de-moralize” psychoanalytic discourse in this way, representing it as an ethically neutral, “value-free,” scientific and medical discipline when, as I have argued (Carveth, 2013, ch. 1) it is and always has been a thoroughly moral enterprise from beginning to end. At least in Freud’s own writings the de-moralizing disguise at times wore very thin, as in his demand (Freud, 1914) that we overcome narcissism in favour of object love and his hope, expressed at the end of Civilization and its Discontents, that “the other of the two ‘Heavenly Powers’ …, eternal Eros, will make an effort to assert himself in the struggle with his equally immortal adversary” (Freud, 1930:144). To those who would inflate the notion of analytic neutrality to condemn as unanalytic the making of such value judgements, I would point out that our very showing up to analyze—that is, our rejection of suicide and our choice of life over death—is an implicit endorsement of a value judgement enacted in every session.
Freud’s views

While some psychoanalysts accepted Freud’s view of the superego’s sadism and therefore sought to either radically modify it (Strachey) or demolish it altogether as a bad internal persecutory object (Freud, Alexander, Ferenczi), Schafer (1960), reacting against Freud’s own focus upon its sadism, advanced the idea of a “loving and beloved superego” that he constructed from small hints and suggestions appearing here and there in Freud’s writings but that Freud himself had notably not allowed to alter his overall view. Admitting that “Freud was not prepared to pursue to its end the line of thought leading to a loving and beloved superego or to integrate such a conception with his decisive treatment of the criticizing and feared superego” (Schafer, 1960: 163), Schafer nevertheless proceeded to do the job for him. Subsequent readers of Schafer’s paper seem to have thought it revealed that Freud himself had a more benign view of the superego, when what the paper truly revealed was what Schafer and others wished had been his view, not the superego Freud actually gave us. In the work of Paul Gray (1994, chapters 5 and 6) one sees another retreat from Freud’s predominant view of the superego, this time as one of the three structures of the mind, to a view of it as a defensive ego operation, a view that correctly emphasizes the role of retroflected aggression in superego formation while largely ignoring that of internalized cultural ideology. Because it has represented itself as a cautious extension of Freudian insights, the degree to which post-Freudian ego psychology, including so-called modern conflict theory, represents a radical revision of Freudian theory and a retreat from some of its most radical insights has tended to escape recognition.

A sociologist might suggest that whereas Freud himself gave us a late-nineteenth century European father-superego, Schafer gave us that of mid-twentieth century America. If this were so, it would imply social progress: that we were getting a more modulated view of the superego because superegos had become modulated. But is that fact or wish? At the very time Schafer was advancing his view of the superego as more “Pop” than “Vater,” Kohut (1978) was celebrating the passing of “Guilty Man” altogether in our culture. Here we must boldly bring psychoanalytic thinking to bear and distinguish between what is conscious and what is unconscious. Perhaps due to changes in culture, gender roles, family structure, etc., harsh paternal authority had diminished and, at least on the conscious level, the authoritarian superego along with it. Yet Freud (1930, pp. 128-129) explained how a severe superego may result from a lenient upbringing, its severity having as much to do with the turning of aggression against the ego as with actual parental behavior. Our clinical experience would suggest little decline in the role of the sadistic, tyrannical unconscious superego in psychopathology. Of course, this is a point that one is only in a position to affirm or deny to the extent that in clinical work one still “listens with the third ear” (Reik, 1948) to the unconscious. Schafer’s post-Freudian revision of Freud’s theory of the superego has, like Gray’s (1994), been very influential, even among analysts not usually fond of revisionism.
Psychoanalytic critique of the superego has focused almost exclusively upon its destructive manifestations in the life of the individual, in self-punishment, self-sabotage, masochism, depression and suicide, and not upon the morally objectionable internalized socio-cultural ideologies of which the superego is comprised and that are reflected even in its normative, let alone its pathological expressions. Freud's incorporation of both conscience and ego ideal into the superego hampers our capacity to undertake such a critique for, in the traditional view, the superego is the only judge and there is no other judge to judge it, no higher court of moral appeal. In this framework we can only describe superegos with different content, ones that are racist and sexist and ones that are less so, right-wing and left-wing ones, harsh and critical or more loving and forgiving ones. But to move beyond description and to judge one superego as morally better or worse than another requires an autonomous basis for such moral judgment.

Whereas in the past social scientists and philosophers have often succumbed to the moral relativism arising from a view of morality as entirely a social product constructed in radically different ways in different historical and cultural contexts, today there exists widespread agreement regarding the existence of a universal moral standpoint beneath all cultural accretions and variations that holds simply that one ought not do to others what one does not wish to be done to oneself, the principle of reciprocity that Kant (1785) embodied in his categorical imperative. The universal moral norm of reciprocity constitutes the basis of both conscience and the conscientious critique of superego ideologies and practices that violate it. Without it, critics of the superego, such as Freud, Alexander, Ferenczi, Bion and, more recently, Britton have been forced to appeal to reason against the superego's moralism, a responsibility that, as we have seen, the rational ego is incapable of assuming.

While Freud recognized the role of identification with the aggressor in superego formation toward the end of the oedipal phase, and Klein understood its role in formation of the preoedipal superego (identification with the all-bad persecutory part-object), due to the largely unrecognized work of Eli Sagan (1988) we have failed to grasp the preoedipal (unlearned) drive-based need for attachment. Although inevitable frustration despite the best possible caring imaginable generates hatred toward the primary object experienced as a persecutor.

For Klein

The newborn infant unconsciously feels that an object of unique goodness exists, from which a maximal gratification could be obtained and that roots of conscience in identification with the nurturer. If the superego is comprised of the aggressive drive (or Thanatos) turned on the self, and identification with the aggressor, then the conscience is comprised of the libidinal drive (or Eros) directed outward and inward, and identification with the nurturer. Whereas the superego derives from aggression, the conscience derives from libido, today understood.
to include a primary this object is the mother's breast (Klein et al, 1952: 265).

In primary love and attachment, together with the principle of reciprocity that takes the form not just of the talion law of hate for hate but also that of love for love, lie the drive foundations of conscience, the overlooked morality of the id mentioned above. Value imperatives internalized from parents and society, i.e., superego, often generate something of a “false self” (Winnicott, 1960) on the basis of compliance that conflicts with desires arising from the “true self” and its need to express both its hatred toward the persecutory bad object, identification with which forms the core of the superego, and its love and gratitude toward the nurturing good object, identification with which forms the core of conscience and that generates the need for prosocial behavior and authentic self-expression.

One of the strengths of classical psychoanalysis has been its refusal to succumb to overly socialized, culturally determinist, entirely relational models of human nature, calling our attention to universal drives that conflict with social forces. While well aware of conflicts between social pressures and the drives of sex and aggression, we have paid little attention to those between social internalizations (superego) and moral feelings and obligations grounded in attachment and love (conscience).

Conscience, grounded in Eros, frequently conflicts with superego, grounded in Thanatos. As Freud in his clinical writings as distinct from his sociological speculations understood, and as Klein consistently grasped, the superego is a bad, persecutory internal object. What we have been calling the loving and beloved superego is the conscience. Therapeutic progress requires us to progressively quarantine and disempower the superego and strengthen both the conscience and the rational ego (though the rational ego, being merely rational, is no substitute for conscience). But instead of recognizing the superego as an intrinsically bad object and calling for its displacement by conscience we have preferred the idea of superego modification. In so doing we have failed to recognize that without conscience we lack any basis for judging one superego as superior to another. To reject the idea of conscience as separate from the superego and instead focus on the goal of superego maturation is self-contradictory, for we can only distinguish a mature from an immature superego by the standards of conscience. There is no denying that the superego sometimes represents the internalization of cultural values congruent with conscience; in such cases one is pulled both by one’s conscience and one’s superego in prosocial directions, though even here the superego, as aggression retroflected against the self as well as internalized norms will be more inclined to exhort and punish, while the conscience will push for change and reparation.

Conclusion

In recent years, rather than seeking to elaborate structural theory, prominent psychoanalytic theorists, such as Schafer (1976), Brenner (1994, 1998, 2002), and others, have become concerned with the problem of reification of psychoanalytic concepts, such as id, ego,
superego and the very notion of “psychic structure” itself, all of which they view as abstractions referring ultimately to the human actions and compromise-formations of which they are comprised. I agree we must seek to avoid what Whitehead (1925) called “the fallacy of misplaced concreteness” or the literalization of metaphor. But since all thinking and communicating depends upon metaphor (Lakoff and Johnson, 1980), I believe we must take care not to extend our critique of reification of abstraction to a condemnation of abstraction per se. Philosophers do not prescribe but only analyze what scientists do; we must not allow philosophical strictures to impede scientific creativity and communication. I believe it sometimes serves us to work at the molecular rather than the atomic or subatomic levels of analysis. It is true, to take but one example, that “social structure” is an abstraction referring ultimately to human individuals acting and interacting in patterned ways, yet sociologists have found the concept highly productive in social analysis.

Freud himself did not view Eros and Thanatos as compromise-formations but as the forces that enter into compromise-formations. Nor did he consider the superego a compromise-formation but as aggression turned against the self plus cultural internalizations. In my view, id, ego, superego and conscience are not compromise-formations but the forces comprising the compromise-formations we see. There is no doubt that underlying these macro-structures there exist complex self and object-relational processes and dynamics that psychoanalytic research legitimately seeks to better comprehend. But just as we must resist oversimplification, so we must be on guard against the subtle resistance to facing simple truths that may sometimes take the form of flight into defensive complexification. In my view, there is no need to concretize the hypothetical constructs id, ego, superego and conscience to work with them productively, even while seeking to comprehend their underlying components.

References


Ferenczi, S. (1928 [1927]). The elasticity of psychoanalytic technique. In: Final Contributions to the


Nash, CAPT Wm. (2012). Moral injury in the context of war (research). Workshop session 508 at the National Zarrow Mental Health Symposium & Menal Health America Annual Conference (September 20th, 2012). Tulsa, OK.


The Colonial Politics of the Plague: Reading Camus in 2020

Nasser Amin

Abstract

The global COVID-19 pandemic of 2020 has reignited interest in Albert Camus’ 1947 classic *The Plague*, which charts the relentless course of an epidemic raging through a city in Colonial French Algeria, and contains uncanny resonances with our contemporary situation. Camus speaks of official attempts to initially downplay and then manage the virus; the psyche of the populace under quarantine, with its feelings of aimlessness; the attempts of some to profiteer from the disease; and the fatality statistics broadcast as daily figures. Camus coolly dissects the anguish of separation that millions today have experienced in self-isolation, as social bonds break down and the recourse is to nothing other than inwardness.

The novel is also of course read as an allegory, of human defiance and solidarity in the face of an insurmountable and unknown enemy. In most contemporary accounts, this is identified with the French Resistance to the Third Reich occupation during the Second World War, in which Camus fought.

2020 will also be remembered as the year when the legacies of the colonial past began to be reckoned with in an unprecedented way, as the ‘Black Lives Matter’ movement forced public bodies, companies and educational providers, among others, to grapple with the thorny topic of decolonisation. In that spirit, this paper provides an interpretation that revisits postcolonial critiques, which since the 1970s have challengingly situated Camus’ literature and activism within his wider political commitments to *Algerie Francaise*. Through literary analysis of the novel, and Camus’ earlier novella *The Outsider*, this paper serves to explain the erasure or vilification of the native majority within both works in the settlers’ debilitating fear of revolt and upheaval, as the inexorable rise in political consciousness of the Algerian natives was to issue in their ultimately successful war for secession from the French Republic, a fatal denouement Camus did not live long enough to witness.

*Keywords:* Camus; Algeria; Post-colonialism; Colonialism; France; Algerian War; The Plague; The Outsider; Coronavirus.
French colonial rule in Algeria: a brief history

The French colonisation of Algeria began in 1830. Justified in the name of a ‘civilising mission’, the French rapidly took over and encouraged settlement of Europeans. By 1846, some 200,000 European settlers (‘pied noirs’) had arrived to reside in Algeria, the greater part of them French (Ahluwalia 2010: 26). The most fertile agricultural lands were earmarked for colonisation, and the settlers soon established an impressive array of European-style cities, farms and vineyards in their midst. Indigenous Algerians were relegated to the less productive areas, and cereal production diminished rapidly, leading to deepening hunger problems (Ahluwalia 2010: 28). Algerians were not accorded equal rights with Europeans (Ahluwalia 2010: 30), and skilled jobs were denied to the natives, leaving the Arabs in poorly paid professions such as servants or labourers. Unlike British imperial possessions such as India, Algerie Francaise was ruled as a constitutive part of France.

The sociologist Pierre Bourdieu observed that settler pied noir identity was based on two central elements: hostility to Arabs, who were seen as incarnates of “instinct and ignorance”, but also mistrust of the metropolitan French, who were viewed as unsensual and mean (in Harrison 2003: 68).

From the outset, the native Algerians resisted the French occupation. However, it was not until the mid-20th century that the Arabs had formed a large-scale political and armed movement that was ready to launch persistent attacks on French Algerian targets. The main such organisation was the National Liberation Front (FLN) which was formally established by in March 1954. A large-scale war broke out in November of the same year (Ahluwalia 2010: 35) with some 400,000 French soldiers deployed to the colony to defend the settler population which by this time numbered over one million. French military reprisals were brutal and exacted heavy casualties on the Arab and Berber population. By the late 1950s, however, the French authorities belatedly realised that military force had not been able to quell the rebellion and that decolonisation was inevitable. Against the wishes of the settlers, General De Gaulle began negotiations with the FLN. In March 1962, Peace Accords were signed which led to a ceasefire and a promise of an independence plebiscite in the colony. In the subsequent referendum Algerians voted overwhelmingly for independence from France. The 132 years of French rule was abruptly ended, and the pied noirs fled to France but not before having laid to waste most of the factories, homes and farms (Samers in Ahluwalia 2010: 36). Estimates of the total number of dead as a result of the war range from 500,000 to one million, with the overwhelming majority being Algerians (Ahluwalia 2010: 35).

Camus' background

Two important factors set Camus apart from other illustrious French intellectuals of the 20th Century: the extent to which he was conditioned by French rule in Algeria; and the fact that he grew up in poverty, brought up by his mother and extended family, his father having died before Camus reached his first birthday. Camus rose from
humble beginnings to attain a scholarship which enabled him to study philosophy at the University of Algiers. In 1938 Camus worked as a journalist and writer in Algeria, later moving to France and working as the editor of the French resistance newspaper *Combat*. It was in the 1940s that Camus established himself as a world-class novelist and writer. Even one of his sternest critics was to forcefully say in tribute to Camus: “Probably no European writer of his time has left so deep a mark on the imagination and at the same on the moral and political consciousness of his own generation, and of the next.” (O’Brien 1970: 84)

**The Plague**

Not a single Arab character appears in Camus’s tale of the deadly plague that ravages the poverty-stricken city of Oran, Algeria. The story begins with the main protagonist, Dr Bernard Rieux, discovering a dead rat in the landing outside his surgery. Attending to other matters, he initially ignores the discovery. That afternoon, he has a visit from a young journalist named Rambert from a major Paris newspaper, who has travelled to Oran to report on the living conditions and state of health of the Arab community. He wants an assessment on this from Rieux. Rieux informs Rambert that their health is not good, but before he discusses it further, Rieux wishes to establish from Rambert that he is able to tell the truth about the Arabs’ situation in his report, an “unqualified indictment” if necessary (Camus 2013:11). Rambert replies that he is not able to publish an unqualified indictment. He asks Rieux if there are grounds for unqualified criticism of the Arabs’ situation. Rieux answers that there is no basis for a total condemnation of the state of health of the Arab community. However, because Rambert does not have the freedom to publish an unfettered account, Rieux politely declines to provide an assessment: “I can only countenance a report without reservations, so I shall not be giving you any information to contribute to yours.” (Camus 2013: 12).

When his concierge dies from fever, Dr Rieux consults with his colleague, and both reach the conclusion that an epidemic of the plague has hit the city. They warn the City’s Prefect. Rieux is initially rebuffed, and in a meeting some officials question whether the disease is in fact the plague, and whether drastic measures are necessary. In a debate that recalls the agonising discussions at government level around the world between politicians, scientists and public health officials about how to respond to the Coronavirus, Rieux replies:

> When a microbe [...] is capable of increasing the size of the spleen four times in three days, and of making the mesenteric ganglia the size of an orange and the consistency of porridge, that is precisely when we should rush to do something. The sources of infection are multiplying. At this rate, if the disease is not halted, it could kill half the town within the next two months. Therefore it doesn’t matter whether you call it plague or growing pains. All that matters is that you stop it killing half the town. (Camus 2013: 39)

Official guidance is provided to the public about measures to take to control the spread of the disease, but these are measured and do not emphasise the severity of the situation. However, the daily death toll continues to rise, and officials are forced into stricter policies, including...
quarantine of infected homes. Rieux is incensed that the authorities are dithering in the face of the evidence. The pestilence continues unabated, and the death toll reaches 30 a day, finally forcing the Prefect to officially declare the presence of the plague and to lockdown the city, with all entries and exits prohibited. The lockdown is to last nearly a year.

In the ensuing chapters, Camus richly and vividly depicts the psychological strain on the residents under quarantine, who adopt various ways of dealing with the isolation:

Without memory and without hope, they settled into the present. In truth, everything became present for them. The truth must be told: the plague had taken away from all of them the power of love or even of friendship, for love demands some future, and for us there was only the here and now. (Camus 2013: 140).

Months after its onset, the fatalities begin to subside, but public morale is yet to recover:

Although this sudden decline in the disease was unexpected, the townspeople were in no hurry to celebrate. The preceding months, though they had increased the desire for liberation, had also taught them prudence and accustomed them to count less and less on a rapid end to the epidemic. (Camus 2013: 207)

Almost a year after it began, the plague is finally under control, and the decision is taken to reopen the city, reuniting loved ones. Camus has a character say by way of conclusion:

Everyone has a plague in him. The decent man, the one who doesn't infect anybody, is the one who concentrates most. All I say is that on this earth there are pestilences and there are victims – and as far as possible one must refuse to be on the side of the pestilence.” (Camus 2013: 195)

In his analysis of the novel, O’Brien casts his gaze on the meeting between Rieux and Rambert, prior to the plague being identified. That meeting serves as an early corroboration of Rieux’s integrity, his uncompromising commitment to principles that he will articulate later in the story, since he will not reveal information to the journalist unless the latter is willing to publish the whole truth. Yet, after this, the Arabs, O’Brien observes, “absolutely cease to exist” in the story. (O’Brien 1970: 46) This is the case, despite their pre-plague health problems as a community being notorious enough for a journalist in a major French paper to come all the way from Paris to enquire about. Later in the story, Rieux and Rambert walk through an Arab part of the city, indifferent to the fate of its inhabitants:

They went down through the narrow streets in the African quarter. Evening was coming, but the town, which had once been so busy at that time of day, seemed oddly deserted […] Along the steeply descending streets, between the blue, ochre and violet walls of the Moorish houses, Rambert spoke in a state of great agitation. He had left his wife behind in Paris. (Camus 2013: 65)

O’Brien’s indictment that “Neither Rieux, the doctor, nor Rambert, the reporter, ever goes into
these houses. We hear nothing of the progress of the plague among them [the Arabs]” (O’Brien 1970: 47) inevitably invites comparison with the significant racialised health inequalities demonstrated in COVID-19 in the form of disproportionately higher mortality rates for ethnic minorities within the official figures in Britain, the US and other Western societies, which have been posited as being caused by structural racism and neglect. (Mathur et al., 2020)

Back in colonial Algeria, the anonymity of Arabs in the dominant narrative was for the psychiatrist Fanon a manifestation of the psychological degradation of the native:

If psychiatry is a medical technique which aspires to allow man to cease being alienated from his environment, I owe it to myself to assert that the Arab, who is permanently alienated in his own country, lives in a state of absolute depersonalisation. (Fanon 2001: 154)

If Algerians are conspicuous by their absence in plague-ridden Oran, Camus’ most widely read2 work, The Outsider, does find a central role for Arab characters, even though they are not accorded full personhood.

The Outsider

Regarded as “a paradigm of the philosophical novel” (Sharpe 1995) which confronts the central issues of the human condition, The Outsider is a story about a young pied noir clerk called Meursault who works in Algiers, and narrates the story. The novel begins with Meursault receiving a telegram in which he is informed of the death of his mother, whom he had some years before sent to live in an old people’s home. The funeral has been arranged for the following day. At the funeral, Meursault shows no apparent emotion and dreams of being elsewhere. Back at home and with the weekend in full swing, Meursault goes swimming with a young lady, Marie, that he has a liking for. Later that day, they visit the cinema to watch a film that Marie wants to see, a comedy. They then go back to Meursault’s flat where they sleep together.

On the next day, Meursault meets a neighbour by the name of Sintes. Sintes is a criminal and pimp, and he asks Meursault for some help with a girlfriend whom he claims has ‘let him down’ and he wants to take revenge against. Sintes asks Meursault to write a letter for him that he shall send to her that would be both insulting to her and encourage her to return to Sintes. On her return, Sintes plans to beat her badly and throw her out. Immediately recognising on hearing her name (although the reader is not informed of what the

---

2 A 2006 poll of the most favourite books of novel-reading males in Britain placed The Outsider at the top of the list (Higgins 2006)
woman’s name is) that she is a ‘Moor’, Meursault agrees to write the letter.

The following day, with Marie in his apartment, Meursault hears screams from Sintes’ flat. They come out on to the landing to see Sintes beating the Arab woman. Marie is horrified and asks Meursault to call the police. Meursault agrees to be Sintes’ witness. Later in the week, a worried Sintes calls Meursault and asks him for help: “I’ve been shadowed all the morning by some Arabs. One of them is the brother of that girl I had the row with. If you see him hanging round the house when you come back, pass me the word.” (Camus 1961: 47) Meursault agrees. At the police station, Sintes is released with a warning after Meursault gives evidence about the woman having been false to him. The police do not check the veracity of Meursault’s statement.

On leaving the police station, Sintes tells Meursault to look across the street: “I saw some Arabs lounging against the tobacconist’s window. They were staring at us silently, in the special way these people have – as if we were blocks of stone or dead trees.” (Camus 1961: 54) Sintes whispers that one of the Arabs is the brother of the woman he had beaten. Sintes, Marie and Meursault take the bus to the beach where they had arranged to stay with a friend. They are followed by the Arabs. A fight on the beach ensues, and the Arab attacks Sintes with a knife, drawing blood on the latter’s arm and face. The Arabs then disappear, and Sintes hands Meursault his revolver and goes away for treatment, leaving Meursault alone on the beach in the intense midday sun. After walking some way, with the sunshine blazing down on him, Meursault sees the Arab again with his knife drawn. He approaches the Arab and shoots him several times, but without apparent malice.

The second part of the novel describes the trial and sentence of Meursault for the murder of the Arab. In the courtroom, the prosecution depicts Meursault as a callous man citing such evidence as his refusal to see his Mother’s body, his smoking of cigarettes at the funeral and his failure to cry there, and his sexual liaison and cinema-visit on the day after the funeral. Found guilty, he is sentenced to be guillotined. In the poignant closing scenes of the novel, Meursault refuses the persistent calls from the prison chaplain for religious consolation, violently rejecting his confident entreaties for a belief in God and the afterlife.

Conventional reception of the novel within the philosophical and literary tradition has often been to regard it as highlighting essential existential and moral themes. For instance, Connolly sees the novel as demonstrating an heroic affirmation of life and a defiance of death; a joyous Mediterranean celebration of sensuality and self-coming, even and especially, in the most trying circumstances of human adversity (Connolly 1961: 8) At the same time, the novel represents a revolt against the self-righteousness of bourgeois French morality that condemns a young man to death simply for failing to cry at his mother’s funeral, Connolly states (Connolly 1961: 9). Making a contrast with British imperial juridical norms, Connolly reminds us that:
A few hundred miles farther south and ‘a touch of the Sun’ would have been readily recognised, no doubt, as a cause for acquittal, in the case of a white man accused of murdering a native, but part of the rigidity of the moribund French court is the pompous assumption that Algiers is France. (Connolly 1961: 9)

For Camus and his philosophical heirs, The Outsider is the manifestation of the philosophy of the ‘Absurd’, which is to say the unbridgeable gap between human aspirations and the structural indifference of the world. Meursault represents the archetypal absurd man in an absurd world: he bravely confronts an arbitrary and oppressive system with his own, equally absurd and obdurate insistence on refusing to lie, no matter what the consequences. He is a Nietzschean martyr for integrity whose unshakeable resolve and refusal of guilt, religious comfort and sentimentality shakes the values of his society in a way that only a social ‘outsider’ is able to. The travails of this everyman evidence a universal reality. As Camus puts it:

He refuses to disguise his feelings and immediately society feels threatened. He is asked, for example, to say that he regrets his crime according to the ritual formula. He replies that he feels about it more annoyance than real regret and this shade of meaning condemns him. [It is ] the story of a man who […] accepts death for the sake of truth.” (in O’Brien 1970: 20)

This high-minded self-assessment has been undermined by postcolonial critics such as O’Brien and Said. These critiques of The Outsider are based on the idea that through the novel Camus reveals – sometimes involuntarily – his own decidedly colonial view of Algeria, its Arabs and the Europeans settlers. O’Brien argues that far from being a martyr for the ‘truth’, Meursault shows himself to be happy to tell all manner of vicious falsehoods: “He concocts for Sintes the letter which is designed to deceive the Arab girl and expose her to humiliation, and later he lies to the police to get Sintes discharged, after beating the girl up.” (O’Brien 1970: 21) The ‘truths’ for which Meursault is prepared to fight and die are therefore self-serving ones and ones that can only be understood, in O’Brien’s account, as the justification of the colonial status quo.

A closer look suggests that Camus performed a slight of hand in which the facts of colonial oppression in Algeria were ignored and made to seem incidental to the story, when in fact that background and that history are key to what occurs. Meursault is made to seem an ‘innocent’ victim of a bureaucratic injustice which condemns him for refusing to express the necessary emotions at his mother’s funeral when in actual fact he has remorselessly murdered a man. Camus skilfully portrays the trial and capital punishment of Meursault as being a far worse crime than the initial murder of the Arab – which is portrayed as an incidental fact. As O’Brien observes - and contra Connolly’s uncritical acceptance above of Camus’ depiction of the legal process - the story is profoundly unrealistic when it distorts the reality of how a pied noir who killed an Arab armed with a knife would actually have been treated by a racialised French judicial system:
In practice, French justice in Algeria would almost certainly not have condemned a European to death for shooting an Arab who had drawn a knife on him and who had shortly before stabbed another European. (O’Brien 1970: 22)

Several features of the plot help to construct the necessary fiction that Meursault is innocent. Perhaps the most obvious is the narrator’s refusal to name any of the Arab characters. The Arabs appear as menacing background characters; not well-drawn, undifferentiated and distant. Indeed, the stereotypes that Camus lays bare are ones that Fanon was later to identify as being key components of the racial demonisation of the Algerian as congenital criminal. This ‘official theory’ stated:

The Algerian kills savagely: first, the favourite weapon is the knife [...] The Algerian kills for no reason: very frequently magistrates and policeman are taken aback by the motives for a murder. (Fanon 2001: 239)

No Arab witnesses are called to the trial. O’Brien argues that this neglect of the Arab populace reflects Camus’ desire to depict Meursault’s murder as seemingly inconsequential, and this is best achieved by ensuring that the victim is a non-European:

When the narrator shoots down this blank and alien being and fires ‘four shots more into the inert body, on which they left no visible trace’, the reader does not quite feel that Meursault has killed a man. He has killed an Arab.” (O’Brien 1970: 25)

Thus, the placing of the story in an Algerian, colonial context is imperative, rather than (as many readers have it) simply coincidental. Rejecting some of the universalist, philosophising pretensions of mainstream interpretations, O’Brien proceeds from a basis rooted in material existence, stressing the primacy of social setting and context in making sense of the particular perspective advanced in the text:

[Men] live and die in particular places and conditions, and their sense of life’s meaning, or meaninglessness, derives from their experiences in these places and conditions, and only in these.” (O’Brien 1970: 26)

That is, the perspective championed by Camus is merely that: a particular viewpoint, rather than a lofty insight into the fundamentals of the ‘human condition.’ It can also be said to be the surfacing of the profound anxieties of both metropolitan French and pied noir society in the middle part of the 20th century.

Placed within his wider project of ‘Orientalism’ and cognisant of the historical moment of Camus’ life, Said takes O’Brien’s critique further. Describing Camus as a “very late imperial figure” from “whose work the facts of imperial actuality [...] have dropped away” (Said 1994: 208). Said claims that the text can be interpreted as ultimately giving justification to the French colonial venture. When, for example, Meursault recounts that his mother at the end of her life was “ready to live everything again” (Camus 1961: 120), Said understands this to be a latent manifestation of the “tragically unsentimental obduracy” of the pied noirs (Said 1994: 224). Philosophical accounts have seen this as Camus’ commitment to self-mastery in accordance with
Nietzsche’s doctrine of ‘eternal reoccurrence’, where one ought not to regret any of one’s actions in life and indeed be prepared to live life again, in exactly the same way, infinitely. Said does not deny this interpretation and how it may positively influence readers seeking to overcome adversity, but sees a political statement writ large. Unabashed about the historical seizure of Algeria, even as they contemplate the possibility that their reign may be coming to an end, the pied noirs are essentially declaring: “We have done what we have done here, and so let us do it again.” (Said 1994: 224)

Overview and Conclusion

In his political journalism, Camus was among the first pied noirs to bring to wider attention the wretched lives of Algerian Arabs and call for political and social reforms in Algeria. From 1939 until shortly before his death, Camus castigated the colonial authorities for oppressing the Algerians and denying them democratic rights. Following the French army’s massacre of thousands of Algerians in Setif in 1945, Camus wrote denouncing the ‘collective punishment’ of the Arabs and compared French state terror to the actions of Nazi Germany (Carroll 2007: 52). For Camus, the solution to the Algerian problem was the assimilation of Arabs and Berbers into a democratic and multicultural Algeria, still under the sovereignty of the French Republic, even if most Algerians wanted France out.

The Algerian conflict placed Camus on the horns of a traumatic dilemma that reached the very depths of his identity. Appalled at the atrocities of the French State, he nonetheless could not bring himself to endorse the pro-independence demands of the Algerians. His ultimate failure to rise above his tribe was demonstrated in the rigid colonial stereotypes of his most brilliant works, in the nonchalance of the murder of the Arab on the beach, and the absence of Arabs in the plague-ridden city. A large part of the reason for this was his enclosure within the politics of pied noir identity, a particularist attachment he was unable to relinquish even as he was hailed by the post-war liberal European intelligentsia as “illuminating the problem of the human conscience in our time.” (in Cruickshank 1970:19).

Those on the left in France and the colonies saw Camus differently at this stage. Sartre and De Beauvoir were unable to reconcile their erstwhile friendship with him, and the legendary Arab-Jewish anti-colonial intellectual in the Maghreb, Albert Memmi (who died in 2020), lambasted Camus as the archetypal “good-willed coloniser”, schizophrenically decrying colonialism’s worst individual to judge whether they have lived their life to the fullest.

---

3 Nietzsche’s cosmological idea that everything is part of a perpetually repeating cycle of events. Nietzsche employs the concept as a personal test for an
excesses without challenging its basis (Shatz 2020). Refusing to accept the structural causes of oppression in Algeria that resulted inexorably from the colonial framework and tied to an identity and discourse that was increasingly being discredited by the theory and practice of decolonisation, Camus, who was a profoundly humane person, failed to see the continuity between his heroic struggle against fascism with the subjection and deprivation of the indigenous Algerians. In this, Camus can be seen as presaging contemporary worries among progressives of the perils of identity politics.

Camus was not alone in his ambivalent feelings. George Orwell, Camus’ English contemporary, with whom he shared a championing of individual dignity against totalitarian systems, felt the full force of the dilemma too at first hand, as an imperial policeman in Colonial Burma in the 1920s. Orwell described thus the brutalising dissimulation at the heart of colonialism:

All I knew was that I was stuck between my hatred of the empire I served and my rage against the evil-spirited little beasts who tried to make my job impossible. With one part of my mind I thought of the British Raj as an unbreakable tyranny, as something clamped down [...] upon the will of prostrate peoples; with another part I thought that the greatest joy in the world would be to drive a bayonet into a Buddhist priest’s guts. (Orwell 2003: 32)

Camus seldom fantasised about inflicting injuries on the Algerians – the murder on the beach being the notable exception - and even wrote to De Gaulle asking the commute the death sentences of captured FLN militants (Lottman 1970: 607). Unlike Orwell, however, Camus was unable to decisively break with his country’s socio-political system of oppression in the colonies. The tragedy of Camus was pithily summed up by Edward Said as that of “a moral man in an immoral situation” (Said 1994: 210). Besides other legacies, the unequal health outcomes of our own plague throw into sharp relief how we still live under the shadow of the vacillations of Camus and others of his era.

References:


Haddour A. (2000), Colonial Myths: History and Narrative, Manchester University Press, Manchester,


Globalization and the New Realities in the Muslim World

Mohd Abbas Abdul Razak⁴ and Sayed Sikandar Shah Haneef⁵

Abstract

Long before the coming of the modern era of globalization from the West, the Muslim world had seen and enjoyed its own era of globalization. The Muslim era of globalization happened exactly during the peak of the Islamic civilization (750-1258). Around that era, there appeared a great multitude of Muslim scholars and scientists. The openness of the Islamic civilization led early Muslims scholars to borrow ideas from the earlier civilizations; like the Greeks, Persians and Indians. Many pioneering works produced by early Muslims scholars in the areas of science, technology and philosophy later immensely benefited scholars in the West. Concurrent to modern globalization was the era of European colonization of the East and Africa. Since then, Western globalization has been influencing every part of the globe. In the last few decades with the advent of the internet and now social media, knowledge and information sharing have become a lot easier than before. At times, however, the internet and social media have negatively impacted on the masses living in the East, nevertheless their positive impact challenges governments and local authorities in many countries to practice good governance in the day-to-day running of their countries. Through this paper, the researchers intend to explore globalization from the Islamic perspective and discuss issues related to the practice of good governance, politics and the phenomenon of brain drain in the Muslim world.

As a qualitative study, this research employs the library research method that uses the textual and content analysis techniques. Pertinent data related to the study will be gathered from print and internet sources.

Keywords: Globalization, Good Governance, Brain Drain, Islamic Response

---

⁴ Assistant Professor Department of Fundamental & Inter-Disciplinary Studies, KIRKHS, IIUM. Email: maarji@iium.edu.my

⁵ Professor at the Department of Fiqh & Usul Fiqh, KIRKHS, IIUM. Email: sayedsikandar@iium.edu.my
Introduction

In recent times, among the most popular issues discussed in the institutions of higher learning in developing countries, particularly in the Muslim world, are topics like sustainable development, civil society, transparency, devolution of power, democracy and globalization. Like the two sides of a coin, globalization has its pros and cons. Although the positive benefits associated with Globalization have spread across the world, uneven processes associated with the phenomenon have impacted negatively on the lives of many people living in Asia and Africa. Since modern globalization comes from the West, it has replaced the traditional values of the East with some foreign values, marginalized local cultures and languages, and introduced new habits of eating, dressing, socializing and entertaining (Faruqi, 2008:77-89). At the same, modern globalization has also contributed in some positive ways. Among the good contributions that come through globalization are things like knowledge sharing, technology mediated learning, transfer of technology, instant messaging and news broadcasting, educating citizens of the world on issues related to human rights, global warming, environmental degradation, good governance, etcetera. Through this study, the researchers intend to investigate the nature of Muslim globalization, the brain drain phenomenon and the need for good governance in the Muslim world (Ray, 2007:1-4)
TheMuslimEraofGlobalization

FromthetimetheProphetMuhammad(pbuh)wasgiventherevelationinMeccauntilthetime
he migrated to Medina, there was not much of
expansion of Islam to other parts of Arabia. The
history of the Prophet indicates that during the
early days of Islam in Mecca, only a small band
of Muslims went to live in Abyssinia for a short
period of time as asylum seekers. Their mission
there was more about protecting their lives from
dangers and oppression that came from the
non-believers in Mecca. As such, the real era of
Muslim globalization started when the Prophet
(pbuh) established the Islamic state in Medina in
the year 622. It was then that Islam as a religion
and a mighty civilizational force began to develop
and expand to other parts of the world, especially
in the Arabian Peninsula. The expansion was
more obvious during the Umayyad dynasty (661-

The end of the Umayyad dynasty gave way to the
emergence of the Abbasid dynasty (750-1258). In
contrast to the Umayyad rulers, the Abbasid
leaders were more interested in the conquering
of knowledge and science. Under their
leadership, the Golden Age of the Muslims
emerged. Muslim rulers during the Golden Age
supported scholars and scientists in their forward
march in conquering technology and knowledge;
natural and social sciences. The Qur’an and the
prophetic traditions were the driving force in
asking the Muslims to not only learn but to
enlighten their souls through knowledge. That era
of the Muslims was marked with a lot of scientific
research, exploration and expeditions
(Hoodbhoy, 1991:95-107). In their endeavour to
master new areas of knowledge and technology,
Muslims had an open-mind in learning all that is
positive and beneficial from others. With such an
attitude they were prepared to borrow ideas from
the Indians, Persians and Greeks as a way of
enriching their own civilization. It is interesting to
state here, that the Muslim leaders, without any
prejudice, employed Jews, Christians,
Zoroastrians and others as scholars and experts
either to conduct research, teach or translate
texts in the academies, such as Baitul Hikmah in
Baghdad. As a consequence of research
undertaken and translations of foreign texts,
Muslims acquired new knowledge from those
outside their own civilization, especially ancient
Greek philosophy (Fakhry, 1983:1-18; 2000:6-10;

In realizing the fact that not all ideas of the Greek
philosophers were acceptable to their Islamic
worldview, early Muslim scholars adopted,
adapted, assimilated or integrated various ideas.
Through this methodology, the early Muslim
scholars took all those ideas which were non-
contradictory to their religious values and faith.
The scholars of the Golden Age of Islam not only
borrowed ideas from others but went further to
develop and come up with some new, original
and innovative ideas. This was the spirit and
culture of learning that was prevalent during the
early Muslim era of knowledge expansion and
exploration.

In a similar fashion, Western scholars also
borrowed ideas from Muslim scholars during the
Golden Age of the Muslims. For example, some
European scholars were introduced to the philosophical ideas of Greek philosophers as a consequence of reading works translated and annotated works by Muslim scholars. Moreover, they also learned from many pioneering works undertaken by Muslim scholars and scientists in the field of medicine, astronomy, chemistry, mathematics, algebra, trigonometry, etcetera. At the moment, however, only a few Western scholars duly acknowledge the great contributions made by the early Muslim scholars in the areas of science and scientific explorations (Nasr, 1984: 41-58; Abdul Razak, 2011:335).

In assessing the Muslim era of globalization, the Researchers point out that the expansion of Islam and Muslim civilization to foreign territories happened due to its dynamic nature as a revealed religion from God. The message of the Qur’an was appealing to its new adherents because it called for a balanced life style giving equal importance to the ‘here and now’ and to the life in the hereafter. The book of Islam, not only emphasizes in matters related to faith but at the same time encourages Muslims to acquire knowledge and science (Iqbal, 1996: 103-106). When Muslims took their religion to foreign lands there was no compulsion on the people in those countries to follow Islam (Al-Qur’an, 2:256). Besides that, the pages of Islamic history reveal the fact that Muslims were neither interested in the plundering the wealth, nor in tyrannizing the people in those countries. As such, the claim made by a great multitude of Western scholars that Islam was spread at the point of the sword is one which is unfounded. On the contrary, Islam was promulgated with beautiful preaching and good examples shown by the Prophet of Islam and early Muslims during their era of globalization (Al-Qur’an, 16:125).

It can be safely stated here that any reader into Islamic history and civilization will come to the understanding that the Muslim globalization was not interested in any atrocities and usurping of wealth of others. It was not even interested in forcing others to accept Islam as their faith, and equally not interested in making others follow the Arab culture and in making the Arabic language as the lingua franca for the territories that came under the Islamic rule. If the Arabs were interesting in propagating their language and culture, then the whole of the Muslim world should be only speaking Arabic and practicing the Arab culture.

What was the Muslim globalization interested in?
As a response to such a question, the researchers are of the opinion that the Muslim globalization was only interested in sharing the good news of the Qur’an and calling humanity to the path of justice and righteousness, making this world a better place for all to live in peace and harmony (Al-Qur’an, 3:104; 3:110; 3:112; 16:25;4:58).

Leadership Crisis in the Muslim World

Ever since the demise of the Prophet of Islam, and the era of the four rightly guided caliphs; Abu Bakr, Omar, Othman and Ali (may God be pleased with them), the Muslim world started to experience serious leadership crisis. As the Ummah expanded and became bigger in size there appeared many empires. Due to over-
politicicking and power struggle, countless wars and conflicts happened in the many of the empires established by the Muslims. Derailed from the true spirit of Islam, many rulers and their empires started to crumble and vanish, leaving behind their traces only to be seen in ruins and documented in the history books. It has been highlighted by many Muslim scholars that one of the reasons for the disappearance of the empires and dominance of the Muslims at the global level was due to the lack of good governance. Leaders who came after the Golden Era of the Islamic civilization (750-1258) were also lacking in the area of leadership qualities and good governance. Only few leaders had leadership qualities which qualified them to be called as true leaders of the Muslims, while the vast majority of them were interested in fame and self-gloration. War, internal conflict and conspiracies within the Muslim empires became some of the contributing factors to the downfall of many empires. In a way, many of the shortcomings within the Muslim Ummah ushered European powers to colonize large sections of Muslim lands (Musa, 2004: 37-57).

Even after gaining their independence, many Muslim countries did not do well economically due to political instability and lack of democracy in those countries. Even after the discovery of oil in many parts of the Muslim world, the Muslim Ummah was not doing well due to rampant cases of mismanagement, financial scandal and embezzlement of national wealth. The absence of a democratic system in electing a leader became an advantage to some iron fisted leaders in the Muslim world. Under the dictatorial rule of some tyrants caused the Ummah to suffer oppression and detention without trial. Many of the crimes committed by some cruel leaders in the Muslim world went unreported due to the absence of free press. Moreover, it was very difficult at that time to report and share information on leaders' crimes and misappropriation of national wealth as the technology in telecommunication was not as advanced as what we have today.

Good Governance in the Era of Globalization

Islam as a way of life not only emphasizes spiritual matters but also on worldly affairs of the Muslims. The definition of *ibadah* (worship) in Islam not only refers to religious rituals but also to all human activities that are carried out in accordance with the will of God. As such, good governance in Islam is a form of *ibadah* that needs to be carried out consciously in line with the religious principles. Moreover, the one who has been entrusted with public administration not only will be held accountable in this world but also in the hereafter. In order for good governance to be successfully implemented by the Islamic nation or state, it has to pay serious attention to all lofty ideas and principles mentioned in the Qur’an and Sunnah (Haneef, 2013:161-165). The following will be a discussion on some of the principles stated in the Qur’an with regard to good governance:

Man as the *Khalifah* on Earth

In reading the Qur’an one will discover that man has been honoured in his stature as the best, intelligent and creative creation of Allah (Al-Qur’an; 2:30-33, 6:165, 17:70, 95:4). The Qur’an
also explains that all other creations have been created to be at service to man (Al-Qur’an45:13). Man’s position as the Khalifah of Allah, demands him to be upright and righteous in all his actions regardless whether they refer to this world or the next. On the contrary, the Khalifah should not act as a despotic tyrant. Despite man’s privileged position as the most honoured creation in this world, he will be questioned on how well he carried out all duties and responsibilities assigned to him in this world in the next (Al-Attas, 1985: 71-76). With regard to man’s role as the leader the following hadith explains that he will held accountable for all his actions:

Abdullah reported that Allah’s Messenger (pbuh) said: Everyone of you is a guardian (ra’in) and accountable (mas’ul) for his charge. Thus the amir is a guardian of the people and He is accountable for them. And a man is a guardian (ra’in) of his household and he is accountable for them; and a women is in charge (ra’iyah) of the household and her children and she is accountable for them; and a servant is guardian of his master’s property, everyone of you is accountable for his subjects. (Bukhari, al-Jam’al-Sahih)

Among the duties the Khalifah has to perform in this world, a leader is expected to bind a good relationship with Allah, nature and fellow human beings. From the Islamic perspective, all of us are leaders in one way or another in whatever situation and position we are put in this world. Compared to ordinary citizens, leaders of a state and public administrators have a greater responsibility, as they are put in charge of the needs, safety and security of the lives of millions who have elected them into power. As Allah’s vicegerent, man has to follow all the rules and regulations stated in the Qur’an and Sunnah. A good Khalifah of Allah will work diligently for the prevalence of the kingdom of God on this planet (Al-Quran 34:15). Conversely, by all means the Khalifah of Allah should avoid harming fellow human beings and causing destruction to nature (Rahman, 1988, vol. 6:1; Maududi, 1992, Vol. 1:66-68). The idea on how the Khalifah should behave has been candidly stated in the Qur’anic verse, as follows:

Mischief has appeared on land and sea because of (the need) that the hands of men have earned, that (Allah) may give them a taste of some of their deeds: in order that they may turn back (from Evil). (Al-Qur’an30:41)

Amanah / Trust

Although the word Amanah in the Qur’an has a broader meaning to it, in principle it refers to trust (Al-Qur’an; 4:58, 8:27, 23:8, 28:26, 33:72). In one of the sayings of the Prophet of Islam, the act of failing to uphold Amanah has been mentioned as one of the signs of hypocrisy. An effective public administration can only be materialized when people holding positions are conscious of their responsibility. In Islam, public welfare is a form of Amanah. All those given the trust will be questioned on the Day of Judgment. As such, all those holding power and position in the government need to stay away from all forms of fraudulent practice, corruption and abuse of power. The nation’s wealth should be managed wisely without any wastages and embezzlement. In Islam, the act of giving contracts and business opportunities by the Head of the government to
his family members, relatives, and cronies is deemed as a form of corruption. All position and power administered in the wrong way not only destroys the nation but slowly and surely the perpetrators themselves (Maududi, 1992, Vol. 10, Notes no. 120:155-157; Asad 1980, Notes no. 87-89: 653)

Fairness and Justice

In Islam, the head of state and public administrators need to practice fairness and justice in serving people living under the Islamic state. The government, courthouse and all other government agencies should be fair to all its citizens regardless of their race, religion and ethnicity. The Islamic nation state should serve justice to all, regardless of one’s social status. The rule of law applies to all, the rich and poor, the aristocrat and the peasant, and even the leaders themselves. In the Qur’an, fairness and justice have been mentioned as signs of one’s piety (Al-Qur’an: 4:58, 4:135, 5:8, 16:90). In the West, they say, “Justice delayed is justice denied”, while in the Muslim world we believe that “Justice denied in this world, will be served in the Hereafter” According to Islam, the Islamic state should avoid all forms of injustice like detention of its civilian population with trial, oppression and suppression against those who demand for justice and fairness on the part of those who hold power. It is a big crime if the state kills or performs ethnic cleansing on those who voice against the state policies. Killing of the innocents without any valid reason is a major crime in Islam. The Islamic state should respect human lives and value life dearly. With regard to the human lives, the Qur’an says: “Whoever kills a person [unjustly]…it is as though he has killed all mankind. And whoever saves a life, it is as though he had saved all mankind (Al-Qur’an5:32) (Al-Attas, 1985: 7-72)."

Openness and Transparency

The Islamic government should be open to criticism and rectification of its public policies. Hiding information on state investment and future planning from the public is un-Islamic in many ways. All national assets that belong to the state are not a private ownership of the Head of state or the elected government of the day. All national budget and money owned by the government should be made known to the public. By doing so, the citizens will have a greater trust on the government with the belief that all their contribution towards the well-being of the state will bear fruit in the near future. Besides that, transparency on the part of the government in terms of its investment, award of contracts, privatization of projects, etc. should be well-informed to the public. At the end of the day, the public have the right to know about all planned investments of the state as they are the ones who sponsor the government through their income and business taxes (Choudhury, 1993: 39-52).

Promotion of Good and Prevention of Evil

One of the basic principles of the Islamic teaching is the promotion of good and prevention of evil. One among the many references found which calls for the promotion of good and prevention of evil is this verse from Ali Imran:
Let there arise out of you a group of people inviting to all that is good (Islam), enjoining Al-Ma'roof (i.e. Islamic Monotheism and all that Islam orders one to do) and forbidding Al-Munkar (polytheism and disbelief and all that Islam has forbidden). And it is they who are the successful (Al-Qur'an 3:104).

Other references in the Qur'an that relate to promotion of good and prevention of evil are found in Surah 3:10, 16:125, 41:33, etcetera. In line with this principle of the Qur'an, the Islamic state should abolish or fight against all evil, unethical and un-Islamic practices. As such, it should wage war against the evils of drug addiction, alcoholism, prostitution, sex tourism, human trafficking, terrorism, money laundering, riba (usury), etcetera. It is a fact beyond doubt that all these degrading human activities can undermine a progressive nation and prevent society from pursuing the lofty idealism mentioned in the Qur'an and Sunnah. To counter all social ills in the society, the state should launch campaigns to promote ethical and healthy lifestyle through all available government machineries. The best platform to start a massive campaign against social ills will be at the school and university levels. If the young minds are inculcated with ethical and religious values, then it will be a lot easier for the state authorities to govern the public and maintain peace and harmony within the society (Al-Qaradawi, 1991: 111-128).

Rights of the Minorities Should be Respected

The Islamic state should treat non-Muslim minorities living in the country with all fairness by giving rights to practice their religion and culture. They should be given their freedom to own a place of worship and to celebrate their religious festivals. On the affairs related to non-Muslims, the Qur'an says, "To you your religion and to me mine (109:6)", "For us are our deeds, and for you your deeds. There is no [need for] argument between us and you. Allah will bring us together, and to Him is the [final] destination (42:15)." In line with the Qur'an recommendation, non-Muslims should be treated with dignity as fellow human beings. Philosophically speaking, a Muslim should treat another Muslim as his brother or sister-in-faith, while the non-Muslim as his brother or sister-in-humanity, as our origin goes back to a common ancestry (Adam and Hawa). There should no forced conversion of non-Muslim population of the state into Islam. Many Muslim countries around the globe are pretty much aware of the Qur'anic prohibition of a forced conversion into Islam. The more often quoted Qur'anic reference on the issue of no compulsion in Islam is, “There shall be no compulsion in [acceptance of] the religion. The right course has become clear from the wrong. Whomever disbelieves in Taghut and believes in Allah has grasped the most trustworthy handhold with no break in it. And Allah is Hearing and Knowing” (Al-Qur'an 2:226) (Choudhury, 1993: 60-63).

What Qualities Should a Leader Have?

The Prophets mentioned in the heavenly books, especially the last Prophet Muhammad should be the good role-models. The four rightly guided caliphs in Islam, plus Umar Abdul Aziz (682-720CE), Salahuddin al-Ayyubi who was well-known as Saladin (1137-1193CE), Sultan
Muhammad al-Fateh (1432-1481CE), Tippu Sultan and a few others should be made our beacon.

However, times have changed a great deal since then. In today's globalized world, many different interpretations exist in respect of what good leadership should be about, and politics on the ground is very different from the political idealism that floats in our minds. As a consequence of globalized communication networks and technological innovation, leaders are constantly exposed to media reporting in respect of national and international matters. Through the global media, we are all too aware of how leaders can rise and fall overnight. One moment the leader is sitting on the throne of power enjoying the glory of the day and the next moment he is dethroned from it. Worst still, some are beaten to death and assassinated.

Here are some of the responsibilities leaders, particularly those living in the contemporary Muslim world, should seriously consider and before they decide to enter politics:

One should not get into politics with the notion that it is a career and he/she wants to make a fortune for him/her, family and cronies. He or she must be clear in his/her mind that leadership is not a career like any other profession, but it is a service to the people and the nation. It is recommended that those who are humanist, non-racist, sensitive to the sufferings of others and selfness beings are qualified to enter into politics. It is wrong to enter into politics just to take revenge on one’s rival on the other side of the divide. From the Islamic perspective, leadership is an Amanah (trust) that you will be questioned in the hereafter. So one should be just and upright in carrying his duties without any partiality (Jamil, 2015: 25).

A leader must have a clear vision and mission for his/her country or the organization for which he/she is the President, Prime Minister or holding the chairmanship. Jumping into the bandwagon of politics for the reason to be popular is not a good thing at all. For those wanting to attain stardom, they should join the film industry and not politics.

The type of politics written in the ‘The Prince’ by the great Renaissance philosopher by the name of Niccole Machiavelli (1469-1527) might be an accepted thing in the Western world, but it is an idea that doesn’t go well with the Islamic idealism. Concepts like “the end justifies the means”, “before you get power, tell the people of what they want to listen and once you get power do the things you want to do”, “be stern and fearful to your enemies and subjects”, “might is right”, cannot be emulated as good leadership qualities in a Muslim country. Such values contradict the moral high ground a leader should stand from the Qur’anic perspective.

In Muslim countries, leaders should not raise themselves above the nation and people. The sufferings of the people should be the topmost priority and the leader comes second. Leaders should not abuse their powers entrusted to them to loot the wealth of the country, leaving the people impoverished, jobless and under poor living conditions. Good slogans like “People First, Performance” and “No one will be left behind”,
“Change”, “National Transformation” and the like can act as an impetus to move the nation forward in the forward march towards progress and success (Jamil, 2015: 26-28).

Leaders should not overstay their period of welcome. They should be smart enough to leave office when they can sense that the people are getting tired of him/her. A successful leadership is not something seen in the magnitude of his/her followers, but in his/her ability to produce the next echelon of leaders who will take the nation to greater heights of success and development.

The stories of Muhammad Iqbal (1877-1938) the spiritual father of Pakistan, Nelson Mandela (1918-2013) who stood against the then apartheid regime of South Africa, Gandhi (1869-1948) and former president of India A.P.J. Abdul Kalam (1931-2015) are inspirational and soul elevating. The last-mentioned leader in the list, was once asked about the leadership qualities one should have, his answer was “in life it is not important how or where you start, but it is more important how you will end your life”. As a leader, you should leave this world with good deeds, a good name and a legacy to be followed by others. Analogically explained, such personalities break like a precious stone and shatter into millions of pieces. Each piece will live in the hearts of the people. Though physically they might be dead and, but spiritually they will live beyond their death, in the heart and minds of millions of people. Such a leader will be mentioned positively in the annals of history. One more thing that made Kalam a star more luminous than the millions we see in the night sky is the culture of accepting gifts which he was opposed to. He had a philosophy of not accepting gifts from the public and political parties during the course of carrying out his official duties. He believed that the one who receives such gifts will be obliged to do favours in return. Moreover, he also felt such a practice can open the doorway to corruption and corrupt practices in politics (Nadason, 2015).

In addition to accepting such responsibilities, Muslim leaders should be knowledgeable in many ways. He/she should improve prospects for advancing the nation, by providing opportunities for making a marriage between science, technology and spirituality. Science only explains how we got here, while religion explains why we are put here on this planet. Technology may improve quality of day-to-day living in respect of modern transportation, communication and household appliances, but it does not explain the meaning or purpose of our lives. Spirituality, however, explains how we should lead our lives, the purpose of life, what it means to be a good human being, how to appreciate beauty, etcetera. If science focuses on the human mind, then religion focuses on the heart. In the Qur’an both science and spirituality are mentioned. In Arabic we call them “Zikr and Fikr”. In order to be successful in this world and in the hereafter, Muslim leaders should move the nation towards a progressive life in both these areas. In a leader’s effort to make the nation great, he or she should promote the observance of good morals, ethics and etiquette, etcetera. (Abdul Razak, 2015: 17;Hassan, 2001:23-44).
Today’s Reality

All governments and leaders in the Muslim world should come to accept the new reality of the world we live in today. Today’s world is no longer the same it used to be in the past. Metaphorically speaking, the world we live today has become a global village. Since we are living in a globalized world with the latest technology in telecommunication and social media, nothing can escape from the knowledge of the masses living in a country and others elsewhere around the globe. At the moment, people in the world, regardless of their ethnicity, language, culture and religion, are generally well connected and informed of what is happening to the rest of humanity. As such, no country in the world, particularly in the Muslim world, can carry out and hide any significant amount of information on crime, sectarian violence, assassination or election fraud. Equipped with social media and smartphone in their hands, within minutes, citizens in the country and around the world can learn about the crimes, embezzlements, mismanagement and misdeeds of those who hold power in the government (Abdul Razak, 2017: 284-286).

While avoiding the negative impact of the internet and social media, Muslim countries should use the internet and social media in a productive manner to improve public services and the living conditions of the people. Leaders should allow freedom for newspapers, radio broadcasts and television channels to present the pros and cons of how the government of the day is conducting itself. In this aspect, Muslim countries can emulate freedom of the press that has been practiced and enjoyed in many Western countries. Election campaigns held by the ruling party and the opposition should be given equal opportunity to be aired in the mainstream media in the Muslim countries. All sectarian violence and uncalled wars in the Muslim world should stop and move on with their national development agendas that will benefit the people.

Ruling parties should not practice crony nepotism that will benefit their friends, families and corporate companies. E-economy that has been brought by globalization should benefit the people in many Muslim countries. All Muslim leaders should work towards abolishing corporate capitalism and empowering and encouraging individuals to develop local enterprises in the country. By eradicating corporate capitalism, the wealth of a nation will be equally shared by its people and not owned and controlled by a selected few. Thus, when wealth is equally shared, the disparities between the haves and have-nots can be easily narrowed down.

The Brain Drain Phenomenon

Brain drain is a phenomenon that has been present throughout the history of mankind. It happens all over the world, particularly in developing and third world countries. Developed countries in the world look for the intelligent minds in the poorer countries and allure them to work for building their nations and meeting national agendas. By doing so, this allows the rich countries to maintain their status quo as advanced nations of the world, and, at the same time, causes the poor countries to lag behind in
terms of development and progress (Arifin, 2004:2).

It is an accepted fact that globalization has helped the process of brain drain that is taking place in the world. Through brain drain, many countries in the East lose a great number of highly qualified professionals, academicians, researchers and scientists to the developed countries in the West. Many foreign companies and institutions hunt for such professional people while they are still in the universities in the West. Sometimes the potential candidates of brain drain are handpicked and given scholarships while they pursue their specialization in their own countries.

Many factors have been identified which contribute to this global phenomenon (Barker, 2003: 50), which are especially visible in the East, particularly in Muslim countries. They can be divided into two categories; the pull-factors and the push-factors. With regard to ‘Pull’ factors, host countries in the West offer professionals and scholars handsome salary packages, access to hi-tech and sophisticated research centres, good opportunities for educating their children, interesting climates (four seasons), and a greater variety of lifestyles. In contrast, ‘Push’ factors in poorer countries offer limited opportunities for future well-being as a consequence of low economic growth, poor living conditions, lack of intellectual freedom, lack of access to resources, political turmoil and threats of war looming on their homeland or due to sectarian wars that endanger their lives (Johnson, 2000: 30).

Apart from professionals migrating to the First-World countries, another form of brain drain happens when foreign companies employ locals who are talented to work in the industries and labs established in Eastern countries, especially in the Muslim countries. Under such situations, the research and findings of the Muslim professionals will either benefit the foreign companies operating in the local country or exported to the advanced countries. All research findings by the Muslim professionals will become the copyright of those who have employed them.

In realizing the rampant cases of brain drain in the Muslim world, it is about time that the oil-rich and other Muslim countries should initiate a ‘brain gain’ program to bring back the lost intelligentsia. As an initiative to bring back the Muslim professionals to work in their own or in other Muslim countries, Muslim governments should provide laboratories, science and research centres, build good universities, provide good salary, etcetera. At the same time Muslims countries must also practice ‘brain retention’ program in order to stop local talents from going out of the country permanently to benefit advanced countries. As a means of stopping the professionals from leaving, governments in the Muslim world can facilitate the ‘brain retention’ group by giving the same sort of benefit given to the ‘brain gain’ group. Under such a program, top students at the university level should be identified and given scholarship, and jobs should be made readily available to such students upon graduating from the universities. Some students can even be provided with financial assistance by the government to pursue their post-graduate studies before settling down on their professional career.
Since brain drain is happening at a fast rate, one of the most important issues that deserves due consideration on the part of Muslim professionals is whether it is proper for the professionals and scientists from Islamic countries to be involved in the war industry and nuclear projects which are meant other than for a good cause. The researchers feel that there is a great possibility that their talents and expertise could be employed to produce sophisticated weapons that could probably be used for the purpose of waging war and to invade and destroy weaker nations, like the ones existing in the Muslim world. If this happens, then it should be deemed that such Muslim minds have been employed for a wrong purpose, causing pain and misery to innocent people on whom war has been imposed.

Contrary to the preceding form of brain drain, the researchers are in favour of the kind of brain drain that brings people from the advanced countries to the developing and underdeveloped countries in the world. If that happens, then this scenario should be seen as positive development, as there will be transfer of knowledge, technology and expertise from the developed countries to the poor and developing countries in the world. The expected end result in that sort of a brain drain is that the living standard in the underdeveloped and poor countries can improve and put them on par with the advanced countries in the world. Idealistically speaking, when there exists the philosophy of loving, caring and sharing among the countries in the world, then humanity as a whole can create a better world for all to live in peace, harmony and prosperity.

**Appraisal**

Muslim approaches to globalization in the Golden Age contributed in all good ways in promoting knowledge and science. It avoided oppression and other form of atrocities on the people in which it came in contact with. Muslims did not impose their will on others. They respected the differences in people and even prepared to learn from others to enrich their own civilization. In contrast, modern globalization that comes from the West has its own hidden agendas. In analyzing modern globalization one can detect gaps in the current process that continue to favour developed countries in the West at the expense of developing and less developed countries around the world.

The researchers are of the opinion that innovation in teaching and learning which comes along with globalization is a progressive development. At the same time education should not be separated from its lofty ideals aimed at producing good individuals as well as good citizens who will have a good relationship with God Almighty, fellow human beings and with the environment (flora and fauna). Since Muslim countries cannot isolate themselves from the rest of the world, they must adapt to the new developments that the world is going through. Muslims must show an interested attitude towards learning new things without compromising their faith and the principles laid down in the Qur’an and Sunnah. Affluent oil rich countries in the Middle East should not waste large amounts of money on purchasing armaments. On the contrary, these countries should give greater priority in investing
their money on education. Building scientific research centres will be a good idea whereby Muslim scientists and scholars can congregate and come up with some original ideas of their own. This in turn can cut down their dependency on others. Through such investment, Muslims can narrow the prevalent knowledge and technological gaps that exist between them and others. Brain drain involving exchanges between Muslim countries will not be a problem if it benefits the Muslim Ummah, because it will allow Muslim professionals and scientists from the underprivileged countries to work in other Muslim countries that can cater for their intellectual development. Muslim countries will benefit economically, socially, politically and intellectually from such exchanges.

Muslim countries that are still lacking in the area of good governance should improve their records. Leaders in those countries should give a serious thought on the well-being of their citizens. Likewise, leaders who are addictive to war should pause and the think about the destruction caused to human lives and infrastructure. The rule of law should be observed strictly by those in power as well as the civilian population to fight all social ills and corruption. All uncalled wars and sectarian violence in the Muslim world should stop. All ongoing territorial disputes in the Muslim world should be resolved through peaceful negotiation without going into war. Warring Muslim nations should reflect on what happened to the European nations during World War I and II. Roughly sixty million people died, and their countries were in ruins as a result of the two wars. Ever since then, Europeans have tended to value human lives and tried to resolve their differences through peace talks and negotiation. It is hoped that a similar situation can prevail over Muslim countries in the Middle East.

Modern globalization should not lead towards the marginalization of local cultures, customs and languages. Positive cultural influences that come from the West via globalization should be imitated and followed, leaving aside those deemed to be detrimental to a people. The culture of undertaking research and development and exploring new ideas are positive things associated with globalization that the Muslim world can follow. The idea that the West should understand is that humanity as a whole is like the colours of the rainbow. To homogenize the world community to speak one language, follow one culture, eat and dress alike would not be an interesting thing to see. We should not see the differences in culture, ethnicity and language as weaknesses (Al-Qur'an, 30:22). On the other hand, the differences that we see in people in the East and West should be regarded as a positive dynamic. The East and West should recognize and respect their different strengths and try to learn from each other. The strength of the West lies in its science and technology, while the East’s strength rests in its spirituality, the concept of extended family and a God-centered life. No country can exist on its own. Regardless of Western or Eastern orientation, people should unite in calling for peace, cooperation and mutual understanding.
Conclusion

Muslims today cannot run away from globalization by living in seclusion and isolation. They must view globalization as a challenge rather than a problem and look for solutions to overcome the challenges that come along with modern globalization, in accordance with one form of Jihad (striving for excellence) in the path of Allah (Al-Qur’an, 8:60). Muslims should have an open-mind to examine all that comes from the West, picking and choosing what they deem to be relevant and discarding what is deemed to be dangerous and harmful to their existence as a community and nation. The West on its part should cast away completely its past mentality of intruding into the affairs of the East and imposing hegemony through globalization. Instead of looking at war as a solution in overcoming problems with the East, the West should consider discussion, dialogue, negotiation, and arbitration as the primary mechanisms for conflict resolution.

References


Literature Review: The Use of Technology in International Markets

Sisi Wang, Mehfuzul Haque and Golam Faqruzzaman

Abstract

This Literature Review focuses on the importance of technology, development and application of Big Data technology in the context of the current global business environment. The paper summarises some advanced technologies applied to international marketing in recent years, with a focus on Big Data.

Keywords: Big Data, Technology, Technological advances in International Markets

Background

With the rapid development of the Internet, the world economy demonstrates trends towards integration. Correspondingly, international marketing activities are maturing, that feature new dynamic characteristics. Relying on the development of the Internet, cross-border e-commerce must change and keep pace with the times in order to adapt to the evolution of the international market. Technology plays an increasingly important role in marketing.
Big Data Technology

Big data is an Internet concept, jointly proposed by American information technology experts Victor Myer Schoenberg and Kenneth Kuckye (Asmaa et.al, 2020). With the increase of Internet terminals, network information has increased significantly, undermining the utility of traditional statistical methods, previously used to extract qualities of information from stock data. Big Data can help enterprises to extract market information on a very large scale. It can also be used effectively to gather regional economic information, thereby optimising the allocation of resources in international trade. Moreover, Big Data can promote the collection of demand and supply information, in ways that can change and improve channels of international trade. The five examples set out below illustrate how Big Data can be used to gather information in different fields for international marketing:

Application 1:

'Google Trends' is used extensively to gain information relevant to domestic and international markets. This is the most intuitive, simple online analysis platform based on Big Data sources. The platform allows individuals and companies to view daily search hot words and compare historical trends in respect of those hot words. (Wanida, 2020).

Application 2:

One can define the Ideal Customer Profile (ICP) and create the perfect customer portrait, which can be developed within Big Data. Data collected may be used to set parameters for the target audience's age, address, education, income and other characteristics. In addition, more detailed information gained in the search may be used to stratify the purchase patterns of users, and detailed information such as users' online behaviour and online searching can be easily obtained. Once the ideal target customer has been identified, company managers will be in a good position to re-adjust their sales information and strategic direction (Chan, 2012).

Application 3:

The purchase elements of customers can also be determined. Now most of the marketing focus is on creating and publishing communication content. But what elements help to turn potential customers into real buyers? What makes them
willing to buy? Review software helps one to identify this kind of content, guide target customers, and translate it into real sales. This allows companies to quantify the value of marketing content (Li, 2020).

**Application 4:**

Prediction based on big data can produce more meaningful analysis. Many enterprises are using customer relationship management (CRM) software to predict user behavior more effectively. It is not only about getting to know a potential customer, companies must also know how to guide the customer. In the meantime, it is important to find out customer’s reaction regarding the product and what exactly they will do in the next stage. This process has become a priority for enterprises to identify the trends of the customer using IT technology such as Artificial Intelligence by analysing historical data and inferring possible future results and key points. This skill can help enterprises significantly improve quality and reduce costs.

**Application 5:**

Big Data can’t be used according to the rhythm of every quarter, every week, or every day. Big data can be used for immediate response and the immediate adjustment of a fulcrum. According to the real-time behaviour of visitors, companies should be able to guide them immediately and automatically to relevant web pages that provide detailed information. E-commerce businesses should automatically track users’ browsing behavior and analyse which products users do not buy and which products have been put into the shopping cart. For example, Royal Dutch Airlines collects and analyses real-time data and automatically sends email to remind the users who have not completed their scheduled orders. This significantly improves the click through and conversion rates. The way Royal Dutch Airlines uses big data also helps them predict customer churn and reduce the risk of user Churn by optimizing the user experience (Qiao, 2020).

As can be seen from the five examples provided above, carrying out international marketing from both macro and micro perspectives is extremely important, particularly in terms of speeding up the economic construction, expanding sales production, reducing the business risks and accelerating enterprise growth and development. Therefore, both enterprises and countries should
strive to improve the level of technology, so that profitability and economies can develop more fully.

**The Importance of Technology**

Technology is an important element for any marketing activity. It helps organisations to develop more effective strategies that will attract more customers. In International markets, technology is about marketing beyond the border. In this era of globalization, organizations must use their technological expertise to promote their products in different markets. Developments in advanced communication facilities, transportation systems and flourishing internet networks, allows many organisations to go beyond their boundaries (Hax, 1989). People around the world are witnessing the benefits of technological advancement and can update themselves with latest products and services.

Every activity, from product innovation to reaching global consumers, involves technological advancement. It helps an organisation to enhance its competitive advantage over other competitors. Integrating information technology into marketing activities will help organisations to have better customer attainment and retention rates (Brodie et al., 2007).

Technology covers a wide range of applications that allow an organisation to develop a smooth bond with all its stakeholders; distributors, and suppliers. It also provides a mechanism for a company to ensure a successful transition from local to international markets. Using internet and data logistics centres helps companies to monitor the progress of all the activities in the global market. On the other hand, technological capacity in the market is also important for an organisation in the process of deciding about entering the markets of different countries. More technologically advanced countries will offer more facilities and prospects for expansion, while countries that lack technological facilities may pose a threat to further expansion.

**References**


Literature Review: Challenges and Opportunities of Entering International Markets

Sohel Rana

Abstract

The trend of internationalization has increased the overall cost of production and manufacturing for businesses urging them to globalize and hire labor internationally in countries where cost of labor is low. However, this is possible only for companies which have a presence in international markets and are conducting business in several countries. This has created challenges for companies wishing to enter into international markets and maintain an equitable balance between costs and profits.

While entering into international markets, new startup businesses have come across several challenges along with several opportunities. Some of the major challenges faced by organizations include but are not limited to differences in organizational cultures and the behavior of employees in international countries. Companies have to invest time and effort in training new employees hired internationally. They may not be certain about an employee’s loyalty and, consequently, may have to take difficult decisions about their wages and salaries. Furthermore, the changing economic conditions in countries is also a challenge for international companies because companies operating internationally are strongly affected by fluctuating economic conditions.

Along with multiple challenges come several opportunities for multinational corporations to expand into international markets. They may have better opportunities to invest and enter into multiple domains by adopting different marketing approaches. Some multinational companies have experienced positive growth in business due to fluctuating exchange rates which have proven to be beneficial for them. By having the collective skills of individuals and departments in different countries, companies can enhance the knowledge of their employees and build up the level of international expertise deemed requisite for business growth and success.

Key Words: International Markets; Emerging Economies; Business; Entrepreneurship; Multi-National Corporations.
Background of International Business

Globalization and internationalization have become imperative to businesses who have been operating in a single location. Technological advancements have enabled almost every business to expand beyond the boundaries of local regions. There are several reasons that companies are expanding abroad: for example, more sales opportunities exist across borders, compared to their local location. According to Paunescu (2018), companies that fail to leave their homeland may fail to expand the business significantly over time. A primary incentive for internationalizing rests in opportunities for cutting costs. As the companies aim to minimize their manufacturing cost, they shift their manufacturing operations to countries where cost of labor is quite low, in anticipation of high growth and profitability rates (Gamage et al., 2020). In the process of conducting business abroad, companies come across different approaches to solve business problems and generate new business ideas. The manager has the capacity to build upon his/her own skills, and, at the same time, increase the company’s effectiveness and implement broader horizons. Every business has to reach a point where senior managers realize that they cannot continue to operate solely in the domestic market because of the limits placed upon growth and expansion. Local business may expand, but prospects for stability and growth decline, as more and more foreign companies and competitors enter the home market. (Carpenter and Dunung, 2012).

Emerging market countries are those countries which were considered to be less developed a few years ago but, due to substantial economic growth, they have assumed a competitive position in relation to highly developed countries. It has been predicted that in next ten years, emerging markets will have the highest contribution in the growth of world’s economy, and these countries will be undergoing rapid economic transformation.

Companies which aim to do business in international markets will have proper strategic approaches to entering and engaging in international markets. It is not possible for companies to have a ‘one size fits all’ strategy for attracting new customers in different countries. As the markets grow and internationalize, it becomes important for companies to rapidly
adapt to changing conditions in the market (Abou-Moghli, 2018).

The experience companies have gained in respect of transacting business in western markets can add considerable value to the strategies adopted by managers planning to conduct business in emerging markets. Sending individuals to the West to study and develop their skill sets provides opportunities for emerging countries to catch up with western economies. Consequently, barriers to investment have decreased as consequence of the growing interests of many companies to outsource components of the business to emerging countries. For example, multinational corporations have expanded their bases of operation in India, USA and UK by outsourcing production, distribution and other units of the business in emerging markets. As a consequence, some of those countries now occupy a competitive position in the global economy (Kefalas and Kefalas, 2018).

When going abroad, companies have to face several opportunities and challenges. According to research undertaken in 2019, almost half of the world’s population live in emerging markets, and the rate of business growth in these markets is twice as much as in Western markets. The reason for rapid growth is rapid modernization and industrialization. Therefore, businesses seeking to enter emerging markets must have a clear understanding of the way business is conducted in different countries. (Kefalas and Kefalas, 2018).

**Opportunities**

According to Obi and Sykes (2020), companies operating in international markets have significant advantages: in particular, a diverse talent base equipped with intellectual and practical skills, low production costs, and the ability to bring in new technology and expertise that will ensure a competitive advantage in new markets. Better living standards within some countries creates opportunities for businesses seeking to enter new markets. As the purchasing power increases, new companies are able to sell their products and services at higher prices than has been the case in their country of origin. Furthermore, over time, the size of middle to low class populations in respect of earning power is increasing in many countries in the world, minimizing the entry barriers for businesses to
operate effectively and continue operations in these regions (Paunescu, 2018).

Some companies, which have entered the new markets internationally have been able to take advantage of low costs and higher productivity due to availability of resources and facilities in these regions. However, difficulties may be encountered by companies wishing to introduce a new product or service in the domestic market, as people may not have a compatible mindset and one product design may not suit the taste of people in a particular country. Thus, it is essential that companies understand the habits and preferences of people of country that they want to enter, prior to entry (Zekiri, 2016).

Research conducted by Yener, Doğruoğlu and Ergun (2014) has highlighted several opportunities available for companies intending to enter into UK market to achieve first mover advantage. By having the first mover advantage in any country, companies have been able to gain access to the best technical and professional skills, obtain government support and build strong relation with the top suppliers within the country. Additional opportunities identified by Heshmati and Lovic (2018) include launching ‘arm’s length sourcing’ relationships with local producers to reduce production and transportation costs. Some companies have secured persuasive advantage by combining their research and development divisions with the research and development division of a particular country. Katavić (2020), for example, has identified some success factors for foreign companies intending to enter the United Kingdom (UK). He claims that the UK government of UK has supported newly entering companies through the provision of long-term investment that has enabled new entrants to make a strong commitment to local markets, rather than encouraging the implementation of foreign business models in the UK. In his view, for any business to be successful in UK, three components must be demonstrated: a strong product proposition, access to robust supply chains and smart local manufacturing procedures. Newly entered companies also have opportunities to measure success using the benchmark model, in relation to other companies in UK: thereby making the UK market quite attractive for new companies due to global competitive advantage, size, demonstrated capability and growing market potential (Katavic, 2020).
Challenges

Katavic (2020) also considers the challenges facing companies intending to enter international markets. In his study focused on the organizational behavior of companies operating in UK, some hurdles new companies may have to face which plan to enter the UK market are identified. In his view, greatest challenge is market segmentation. as companies have to re-segment their market according to new country laws and customer behaviors when they enter any new country. As the purchasing and spending power of people in each country is different, this sometimes create barriers for companies, and senior managers have to modify their marketing strategies to cope up with new industry standards. According to Heshmati and Lovic (2018), the most common challenge faced by the companies entering international markets is related to the trade-off between the price and quality which is quite different in emerging markets, as compared to Western markets. Also, the judicial system, political system, educational system and cultural difference can make it difficult for international firms to adjust to new markets. Almotairi, Alam and Gaadar (2013) has identified some additional challenges facing companies intending to enter the UK market: in particular, the lack of a sufficiently developed industrial infrastructure, high trade tariffs, and very little protection for intellectual property provided by the government. Zekiri (2016) points out that extensive bureaucracy, hard and fast rules and regulations, monopoly control and variations in distribution systems are some of the key challenges facing new companies intending to enter the UK market. Companies also have to face issues in respect of currency conversion and dealing with inconsistent and time-consuming legal requirements.

Transportation of goods, building relations with suppliers, price sensitivity, changes in local needs of consumers are also some of the major challenges highlighted by author for new companies working in UK. The people in UK have low disposable incomes which makes it harder for them to use elite class brands and to operate within a weak structure for telecommunications. Many authors have analysed these challenges using the SLEPT analysis model which is simply the extension of PEST analysis model. According
to this model, as applied by the Kefalas and Kefalas (2018), foreign markets are multi-dimensional and complex which makes up the major point of difference between how a company operates in the home market and how it operates in a foreign market. When making a decision to enter new markets, it is important for companies to have sound knowledge about internal and external factors affecting the country and the impact these factors can have on the company’s operations. Thus, political, economic, social, technological, legal and environmental factors of the country can directly influence the operations of companies working in the country (Heshmati and Lovic, 2018).

**Summary of literature review**

By comparing and contrasting the views of several authors in this Literature Review, it has become very clear that companies planning to expand their business operations across borders or on a global scale, have to face challenges as well as opportunities. From internationalization to B2B marketing, international marketing, and formulation of marketing strategies, companies must be able to understand the existing and future market trends as well as have a complete understanding of consumer behavior in a particular market, in order to modify their product and service strategies accordingly (Abou-Moghli, 2018). The first point to consider is the cost of production, as companies always prefer to move to the country where cost of manufacturing and production is low compared to countries where cost of production is high. In the UK, for example, the cost of production and manufacturing is relatively low, when compared to many other developed countries, making it a best fit for new companies to expand their operations. The business environment of the country which defines new partnership opportunities for companies is another important factor that companies must consider in deciding whether or not to expand the business across borders. Some companies prefer to enter a new country by forming joint venture with one of the industry giants, while others prefer to enter new markets locally by registering the business according to legal requirements (Obi and Sykes, 2020).

In addition to opportunities, companies will have to deal with many challenges: for example, legal registration of the new business which may be quite lengthy process. In addition, it may be
difficult for companies to understand the market trends and consumer behavior in new markets which can result in adopting and implementing the wrong entry strategy. Moreover, rapid developments in technological and economic growth in some countries can create entry barriers for companies, because senior managers may be forced to make quick economic decisions which can adversely affect the company’s operations. To maintain the quality of products and keep the costs low, it may become increasingly difficult for companies to retain their profit margins and generate positive growth. To further complicate matters, many countries are divided into different states or regions, where officials frequently change laws and regulations creating a challenge for foreign companies to adjust to local and regional practices operating within the country. (Abou-Moghli, 2018).

This Literature Review clearly indicates that each country has its own rules and regulations pertaining to political, economic and legal conditions that can hinder the entrance of foreign companies. At the same time, new opportunities can be created for companies wishing to take advantage of expanding the business across borders. As the result of foreign expansion, however, companies may be forced to change their vision and mission statements (Paunescu, 2018). In addition, the workforce in companies must be trained in such a way that they are ready to adapt to the changing culture in the new environment and, if necessary, to compromise with or modify existing policies and procedures. Moreover, it is important that employees in companies develop a diverse skills set that will enable them to adjust to the new environment (Gamage et al., 2020).

Moving to a new country is not a simple operation. Companies have to consider challenges, as well opportunities. The ability to develop and implement appropriate mechanisms for dealing with customers in their local language with respect for cultural differences presents a major challenge. In this respect, however, many companies have expanded internationally, overcome the cultural barriers and set positive examples for other companies to follow in expanding the business and entering international markets (Katavić, 2020).
References


Literature Review: Evaluation of Delivery Strategy Standardization; Adaptation within the Framework of International Strategic Marketing

Md Shohidul Islam Rajeb

Abstract

The research is focused on the assessment of distribution strategy standardisation/adaptation in the context of international marketing strategy. For a long time, there has been a dispute on international marketing strategies, which has two viewpoints: one which suggests that global standardisation can help increase returns and minimise costs by introducing a single marketing strategy and a standardised marketing mix that will benefit from economies of scale, as well as establishing a company's global picture, and the other that advocates the notion of adaptation so as to meet the particular market with a specific dimension. This debate began as early as 1961 (Vrontis et al. 2003) with Elinder (1961) taking the concept of global advertising into account. The statement was further broadened by Buzzell (1968) by claiming that it refers to the entire marketing mix and not just to advertising alone. The different international distribution methods applicable to global markets for business and consumer goods are also analysed as the distribution for both is not comparable.

Keywords: Delivery Strategy, Standardisation, International Strategic Marketing
Introduction

In the past, disagreements between countries led Multinational Corporations (MNCs) to consider and design their marketing strategies according to each region. Followers of the concept of standardisation, however, maintain that circumstances have changed in recent times, and the experiences of a growing number of MNCs indicate that if the businesses accept the standardisation of marketing mix components, there are strong potential benefits. According to Levitt (1983), global standardisation has become generally accepted. Well-managed companies have switched from customization to global standardisation for reasons of efficiency, sophistication, practicality and lower costs.

Standardisation in international marketing

Standardisation is characterised as the way in which businesses apply marketing-mix requirements across international markets (Schilke O et al 2009). Alternatively, a standardised marketing practice refers to the use of a particular instrument in the production or implementation within the marketing strategy of a business implemented in its international service. (2005-Henry). Because of increased technological development and a greater convergence of consumer desires, expectations and tastes, exponents of standardisation perceive globalisation patterns as the driving force for greater business similarity. They claim that standardisation is further encouraged by the advancement of international systems of communication, the expansion of global markets and the advancement of the internet. In their view, a standardised approach will improve substantial economies of scale in the field of manufacturing and marketing, as well as adding value to the consumer, a clear corporate or brand image across different nations, reduced managerial complexity, improved control and coordination over international operations (Theodosiou et al 2002). Levitt (1983) argues that cultural disparities between countries have been resolved by technological growth, and, therefore, standardisation is the preferred choice of businesses to achieve economies of scale as well as the ability to develop and market a standard
corporate image worldwide. (Schilke, O, et all, 2009). For example, cultural overlap, demand similarity, decreased trade barriers and technological advancement allow different foreign businesses to sell standardised products using standardised marketing programmes (Zou & Cavusgil, 2002). Standardisation requires a centralised approach for company marketing programmes, and businesses adopting standardisation need to possess more marketing know-how than those involved in decentralised adaptation.

The Advantages and Disadvantages of Standardising Distribution

The investigation in the European Union of cross-market standardisation strategies is based on the research done by Henry and Chung 2005. As the standardisation approach is applied in the cross-market situation, the use of a standardised delivery policy for agents in all the European Union countries where they work, is definitely an essential consideration. As the study indicates, however, standardised delivery strategies can only be applied in countries with similar delivery infrastructures.

Advantages

The advantages of standardisation in respect of products are evident and have been thoroughly investigated. For the standardisation of delivery, the same categories can be applied.

- Economies of Scale. As fewer inventories are needed, stock management and distribution expenses are typically reduced.
- R&D Costs. Distribution standardisation would minimise the research and development costs necessary to adapt to a specific market.
- Marketing economies. Standardisation facilitates standardisation of promotions resulting in advertising savings. There appears to be considerable savings as companies use the same advertising strategy for different markets, thereby increasing the returns on marketing activities.
- Global Consistency. The organisation will market unified goods on a worldwide basis because of economic globalisation. Marketers are looking at the market becoming more homogeneous, for example, the demand for denim and pop music is growing day by day, meaning that producers can look to satisfy these demands on the same platforms worldwide.
- Global Manufacturing. If a business starts designing and distributing global products from a worldwide manufacturing location,
then it can be said that a standardised process exists. Here, the company may not only benefit from economies of scale, but also have the advantage of being able to transfer its focus to other supply locations without facing any concerns, particularly when there is a problem with one of the suppliers.

**Disadvantages**

- **Upgrading.** If an upgrade is required, all the nations in which the company works will need to make adjustments, which may entail government efforts to create or introduce new legislation.
- **Profitability.** Standardisation aims at the possibility of cost savings rather than the maximisation of income.
- **Market penetration.** In the development of marketing strategies, consumer tastes and expectations play a very important role. According to Levitt (1983) globalisation results in lower prices and better-quality goods and services, and consumers are drawn to lower-priced products and no longer prefer local products. Lower rates and heavy discounts, however, do not ensure market penetration. If one looks at the European Union, which is considered homogeneous, there are still gaps and variations between customers. The producer must then consider the customer and the market reach he wants to provide in conjunction with the marketing strategies and then prepare his delivery strategy.
- **Uneven consumer buying power.** In terms of standard of living, skills and abilities required in the specific sector, there are some differences between countries. For example, lower per capita income markets are more likely to have less buying power. This means that, according to the individual market, the delivery methods would have to be altered in accordance with market realities.
- **Domestic regulations.** In order to protect the interests of their economies, government rules and ties are developed and this can entail a change of strategy. Monopoly laws and stronger channel members may cause the business to adjust its own policies and strategies that will invariably have to comply with the government's rules and regulations that make standardisation impossible.

**Adaptation**

Adaptation proponents claim that global marketing is fascinating because it blends business, science and art with other disciplines, such as anthropology, economics, geography, cultural studies and history. In international marketing, companies have to adapt their positions to deal with a number of constraints presented in foreign markets, at governmental and local levels: for example, economic factors, including customer purchasing power, climate conditions, topography, ethnicity, political stability, employment conditions and regulations, as well as cultural differences in regions within a country in respect of faith, education, attitudes, beliefs, manners and customs and aesthetics.
Proponents of adaptation maintain that despite the growing movement towards globalisation, disparities between nations remain too great and thus require the business to adjust its marketing strategy to the various circumstances of each foreign market. Furthermore, the company's ultimate aim is not to minimise costs by standardisation but to achieve long-term profitability, since higher profits come from the proper use of different customer demands in different foreign markets. Standardisation is considered to be a marketing myopia that simplifies the principles of marketing as well as opposes them (Rugman and Brewer, 2003: 320).

**Adaptation in Distribution Strategy**

Adaptation does not need to be a defensive tactic. Companies that shift supply chains are also effective in introducing new goods or entering new markets during the period they change their strategies (Harvard Business Review, Oct 2004). A standardisation approach to the global marketing strategy may not be sufficient to operationalise a market distribution strategy abroad, as it is very important for global marketers to understand the distribution patterns and systems in different markets. There is a need to conduct a comparative marketing analysis for this. In various continents such as Africa, Asia and Latin America, distribution is possibly highly adapted to different circumstances as government regulations and the local customer differences serve as barriers to standardising distribution processes and channels. For example, Avon had to develop distribution techniques other than door-to-door and other direct sale methods in Thailand and Japan, because of distribution constraints faced in those countries. A manufacturer must bear in mind that a specific type of retailer cannot operate in the same way as in all countries due to adaptation. For example, a US supermarket might emphasise a lower gross profit margin, whereas its foreign counterpart may have a comparatively high gross profit margin. It follows then, when a specific distribution method has proven to be helpful in one country or region, it may not function in another and the company will need to adapt to that country’s requirements. (Onkvisit and Shaw, 2004: 361).

Worldwide differences in the distribution system and its accessibility, as well as the coverage of different types of distribution networks, also makes adaptation the only viable local market distribution strategy solution. Particularly in
developing countries, the identification and implementation of effective distribution channels is critically important to the business. According to Douglas, et al (1995, pg 235) differences in the purchasing behaviour of the consumer along with preferred facilities, government rules, regulations and interference in the sales channel along with competitor management must be taken into account when designing a distribution plan in foreign markets. Global companies need to be fully aware of the trends in distribution prevailing in the international marketplace. It is misleading to consider that the distribution of the channel in the global market is identical to the distribution in the local market. The various factors that companies must consider in respect of taking a strategic approach to distribution are discussed below:

**General Patterns**

The distribution channel pattern between different countries is very difficult to generalise. It is as complicated as generalising people’s actions. Marketing strategies are proving to be different within the European Union itself. It is therefore considered prudent that no foreign market should be generalised in terms of distribution.

**Middlemen Services.** The service attitudes of individuals vary greatly at both retail and wholesale levels in terms of their work as distributors, or in terms of different other services from country to country. In this situation, therefore, the Company must align its efforts with the efforts of the middle man.

**Line Breath.** Each country has a particular pattern in relation to the breadth of the line carried by both the wholesaler and the retailer. Some nations seem to have the distribution system led by an intermediary who transmits or can get everything. In other cases, specialists dealing in extremely narrow lines seem to oversee the process. In certain nations, government laws restrict the breadth of line that can be issued by the intermediary, in addition to imposing licensing requirements for some products.

**Costs and Margins.** Depending upon competitive strength, productivity, services rendered, the extent of the inefficiencies, geographical factors and the turnover relative to the market size, tradition and a few other basic determinants,
costs and middleman margins vary widely from country to country. For example, in India, there seems to be highly competitive rivalry in the urban market as opposed to the rural market in terms of costs and margins.

*Channel Length.* The degree of economic growth and the length of the distribution channel appears to be related. For industrial products and costly consumer goods in many countries, the distribution channel seems shorter in respect of lower cost items. The channel length can vary accordingly and can be longer or shorter.

*Non-existent Channels.* Adequate market coverage by a simple distribution channel is almost impossible in many countries. There are sometimes no appropriate mechanisms, and different distribution networks are required to meet the various consumer segments.

*Blocked Channels.* Channel blockage may take place on account of existing rivals in the market who, by preventing distribution through the middleman’s association, may also have the effect of restricting the alternatives available to the manufacturer. Therefore, it is possible to bar a producer from the marketplace by forming rival partnerships and increasing competition.

*Power and Competition.* In countries where a small number of large wholesalers sell to a vast number of small brokers, distribution capacity tends to be concentrated in a few companies. Normally, major wholesalers fund middlemen. The strong loyalty they command from their clients helps them to block existing distribution networks effectively and force an outsider to rely on less effective and costly distribution methods.

*Customer Shopping Patterns.* Preferences and habits of consumer shopping differ considerably from one country to the other and are considered to be a major factor in designing the distribution strategy. In order to create the nature and spatial design of retail delivery, variables such as population, consumer mobility, and demand for service are considered essential elements. For example, US individuals typically have access to a car that allows them to travel to large shopping malls; so the company should look at the availability of parking before selecting a store in this case. These consumers are likely to buy in bulk and not very often, so it is appropriate to consider these factors in developing the delivery
strategy. Where consumers shop regularly and in small amounts, as is the case in Japan, where housewives shop for food every day or twice a day, the distribution strategy must be prepared on the basis of this trend.

**Competitors’ Distribution Strategies.** The organisation must also consider the distribution of the competitor in the implementation of its own distribution plan. For example, if the rival has already captured the distribution of the primary line and the other company has the option of using the second distribution line, then the second option may be less effective and more costly, as it may not be able to offer the quality of support and promotion the organisation requires. Preventive action by competitors can also impede entry into a market by blocking access to distribution channels. For example, Kellogg faced challenges in respect of distribution when they tried to sell Quaker Oats in retailer’s shops in a particular country and had to partner with Nestle to resolve the problem.

**Government Regulations.** Regulations and government rules play a critical role in the development of the distribution strategy and can entail the appropriate adaptation of distribution policies. Since these policies will protect smaller retailers, these policies have proven to be effective and are vital for the survival of the businesses. By creating government-controlled monopolies, the government will directly interfere in the distribution. The Government can also create monopolies for the distribution of products such as alcohol, tea, tobacco and salt. (Douglas, 1995: 237).

**International Distribution Channels.** The manufacturer is linked by a distribution system to the customers and attaches considerable importance to decisions made about distribution networks. Companies can assess the effectiveness of the current system and, on the basis of results, can choose the most appropriate distribution channels for the business.

**Indirect and Direct Channels.** Identifying intermediaries is one of the key choices that international companies have to make, whether the product is sold directly or indirectly. Direct distribution provides a company with greater control over a product, but it requires accountability and dedication to implement successfully and poses some potential risks. In contrast, indirect distribution, which involves the
use of foreign sales representatives or distributors, or the company’s own sales force, or distribution outlets within a country can be considered a better alternative. It will not affect a company’s centralised control over distribution channels in various countries, as it is not incorporated within the business. In addition, indirect control over distribution channels allows companies to invest less in resources and reduce the time spent on training and managing operations. An independent distribution channel also helps an international business to prosper in respect of achieving economies of scale and to benefit from the expertise of specialist distributors in overseas markets.

Advantages

• Following a strategy of adaptation, the business would enable customers to meet their goals, namely optimising profits and becoming competitive in the market, by embracing a country’s cultural traditions, rules and regulations, adapting to conditions of the domestic market and working with local people.
• Adaptation is long-term and seeks not cost savings but to optimise profit and benefits.
• Adjusting to the product and the supply chain provides substantial economies of scale as well as marketing and sales advantages. For example, if the local postal services are inefficient, a business which has been selling catalogue sales could find an alternate delivery route. A retail catalogue business in Mexico confronted this situation by changing its distribution channel and employing a network of school teachers. Such a move may be costly, but the company has to justify these costs in relation to the benefits.

Disadvantages

• In contrast with standardisation, adaptation is challenging.
• Adaptation is a long-term viewpoint that can be time-consuming and expensive. Prior to introducing the new plan, the competition has to be carefully analysed and researched.
• Adaptation decreases organisational control as it can incorporate decentralisation, which can be expensive and requires management to look constantly into matters.
• It could be risky to implement the new strategy as the company will not have any experience with the new distribution methods and would need time to adapt. Consequently, a change in one of the variables can affect related factors; so the company should be very careful about the cost of opportunity as well as the variable cost.
• Adaptation requires time and resources to develop and implement.
Standardization versus Adaptation

Another group of researchers applies a contingency point of view to the debate on standardization versus adaptation. In their opinion, standardisation and adaptation must not be seen separately from each other, but as the two ends of a similar spectrum, where the size of the marketing campaign of the organisation will differ between the two ends, as to whether the marketing strategy should be standardised or adaptations should be made, according to the specific situation. Decisions should be based upon careful study and relevant framework assessments. Judgments should be made on the basis of the particular strategy’s impact upon the success of the organisation in foreign markets (Quelch & Hoff, 1986; Onkvisit & Shaw, 1987; Jain, 1989; Cavusgil & Zou, 1994). The challenge for the global organisation, therefore, is to determine which particular strategic components need to be introduced in order to achieve the desired result based on standardisation and adaptation at what levels and under what conditions.

In recent times, in order to become genuinely global competitors, the challenge faced by businesses is to have a global competitive advantage. This critical success factor can be accomplished by providing global customers with added value by offering them advantages that are considerably superior to those provided by rivals on the market. Businesses must also assertively aim to obtain cost efficiencies, which, in turn, would make it easier for firms to get more value for capital than their rivals. These days, in practise, businesses manage these incompatible needs by adapting methods that are suitable to their own situation, and by managing the varying degrees of standardisation or adaptation according to different elements of international marketing. (Doole et al 2004 pg 189)

Criteria for standardization and adaptation

Decisions

Nature of the Product. Industrial products such as pharmaceutical products typically need less modification than consumer products and businesses might well benefit from standardisation approaches. Companies focused upon products, like food and beverages, however, might rely more on adaptation, due to changing consumer tastes and preferences.
Consequently, distribution strategies might require various adjustments in other countries.

**Market Environment.** A company’s decision to standardise or change distribution methods may be decided for different reasons in the overseas market; in particular, the atmosphere for competition as well as political and legal aspects, including the climate for handling goods.

**Market development.** Strategies also depend on the product life cycle. For example, marketing and distribution strategies for products in the mature stage of development will differ markedly from the same product introduced in its initial stage of development in another country.

**Infrastructure.** This refers in particular to the institutions and roles that would support the customer service sought by retailers. It will include channel representatives, logistical assistance such as warehousing, transport, advertisement and accessible media and financial agents. The availability of unreliable intermediaries, such as retailers and other channel representatives, would impede after-sales operations. This will contribute to the adaptation of successful delivery methods to address this problem.

**Cost-Benefits Analysis.** Finally, the company is responsible for the type of techniques that have been adopted and the extent to which they support the company. Adaptation is ultimately implemented to maximise profits. If this aim is not accomplished, then adaptation is not required.

**Conclusion**

This paper covers the facets of standardisation and adaptation from an international marketing perspective with regard to distribution strategy. It looks at the different studies carried out on the standardisation and adaptation of the marketing mix, explicitly related to the delivery strategy. In terms of dissemination, the spectrum of significance is explored in respect of standardisation and adaptation. It shows the benefits of standardisation and adaptation and the drawbacks in respect of international and local distribution channels in the context of international strategic marketing.
References


Literature Review: Talent Management

Sraboni Sikder and Don Dulari Wijesuriya

Abstract

Talent Management has become increasingly important in modern organisations. It positively affects the capability of developing a convincing, beneficial, and valuable business for all stakeholders. It encourages talent adaptability and empowers the fast development of the business. In the context of globalisation, privatization and liberalisation, Talent Management has emerged as a novel, but important area in human resource management. Specialists around the world have demonstrated a significant interest in developing and retaining talented employees, which has prompted organisations to maintain and develop talents within the organisation. In the current financial decline, there is a significant requirement for talent within the organisation. The purpose of Literature Review is to analyse the importance of talent management processes within organisations and to identify issues encountered, while researching on the secondary sources which are already published.

Keywords: Talent Management, Human Resource Management; Employee Retention

Introduction

A dynamic rivalry for information encompasses the business climate, which drives associations to acquire information more precisely and quickly than its competitors. Currently, one of the primary difficulties for the associations is to identify and respond to recent changes within a competitive environment, particularly in respect of Human Resource Management (Tetik, 2016).

Talent Management (TM) has lately become a centre of expanding interest in the realm of work and has become more visible in modern scholarly writing because it meets the needs of workforce management that are related to cycles of expanded unpredictability and complexity, which an organisation ought to incorporate into its business methodologies. The idea of TM is frequently used to highlight the essential
significance of in-depth human resource reviews in associations. Most of the secondary resources on TM contains the focal idea that TM should be a vital component in the review process. (Nilsson & Ellstrom, 2012).

Due to the absence of solidarity in definition, TM is regarded as an anchor (Sparrow, et al., 2014) for assembling viewpoints and practices from various fields (Tetik, 2016). Lewis and Heckman (2006) identified three points of TM conceptualisation. The first viewpoint incorporates the general Human Resource (HR) office practices, for example, enlisting and retaining energetic and competent laborers to improve their performance abilities. The second approach explores TM through talent pools. These methodologies guarantee to fulfil the worker’s needs and deal with the advancement cycles of representatives through various positions. A third point of view focuses upon the ability to identify talent for explicit positions inside the association (Tetik, 2016). TM can also be regarded as a positive attitude towards individuals where they are properly esteemed and considered to be the wellspring of an association. (Hughes, 2008)

**Conceptual framework of talent management**

After a broad inquiry on the TM, the accompanying essential model is put forward. In view of the proposed model in Figure 1, the TM is presented as the exogenous inactive variable, with the TM Strategy and TM Mindset as the endogenous inert factors. It is recommended that TM measurements are required to add to the improvement of a TM Mindset and better actualisation of TM Strategy. Figure 1 displays the specific relationships between components. The elements of TM Mindset have been primarily categorized as:

- Talent attraction / Talent identification / Talent development / Maintaining positive relations

![Figure 1: The conceptual model (preliminary framework)](image)

TM strategy has been divided into:

- Talent engagement / Talent retention / Work-related competencies
Elements of TM Process

Armstrong (2014) said that ability to manage talent begins with the business system and what it means in relation to the skilled individuals needed by the company. The principal objective is to create and keep a pool of capable individuals in the workplace. In his view, managing intellectual ability must take into account resourcing needs in respect of marketing strategy, approaches to innovation and maintenance, ability reviews, job planning, proper execution of talent relationships, execution of company’s development strategy, learning and advancement, progression plans and professional field management. CIPD (2006) also identified essential components in a talent management model called "Talent pipeline" that included selecting, sending, executing strategies through the executives, creating, committing, following, fulfilling, and leaving. In addition, results from a CIPD survey undertaken in 2010, indicate that companies should undertake a determination review before undertaking TM projects to upgrade the sensations of mindfulness, certainty, and the inspiration to perform well. Pella and Inayati (2011) maintain that the critical components of the TM cycle are enlistment and determination, direction, executive execution, acknowledgment, maintenance, preparation and instruction, progression planning and advancement. Manopo (2011) adopts a similar approach. In his view, the TM cycle should consist of preparation, competency, executive management, selecting, learning and information advancement, performance management and progression planning.

The views of subject specialists set out above demonstrate common features in the TM cycle. In general, the separate components can be organised into three significant groups: drawing in ability, creating ability and holding ability. The essential challenge companies face is how to connect three groups, and the components identified therein, to create a meaningful cycle. Lack of connection is the primary reason why some companies have failed to develop and implement successful TM systems.

Importance of TM

The essential purpose of TM planning is to ensure that a company can attract and retain the workforce talents required by the organisation. Keeping a predicted balance of workers is not the sole motivation behind the TM in an organisation. An effective approach to TM is fundamental for moulding the objectives and systems of the company and embedding them within the workforce culture. According to Morton (2005), TM also serves as a basis for attracting workers towards the organisation. Accordingly, the mix of these issues has become an essential determinant of accomplishment and an indispensable concern of an organisation (Hughes, 2008). After the 2008 worldwide monetary emergency, for example, some companies chose to decrease their expenses in respect of developing skills within the workforce to become more efficient. Numerous organisations started to contribute to the
development of long-term techniques by recruiting and establishing TM skills and adopting coordinated TM advancement methodologies. Thus, such an all-around arranged technique can assist with meeting organisational challenges and leading business towards the victory (Poorhosseinazadeh & Subramaniam, 2013).

An effective TM strategy can value and improve the knowledge management in organisations (Whelan & Carcary, 2011). According to McDonnell, et al. (2011), most of the ‘upper hands’ are implicit by nature; talent is inherent in individual activity and experience that is difficult to reproduce, formalise, or spread within an organisation. Accordingly, workers’ information, abilities and capacities should be supported and perceived as an imperative wellspring of ‘upper hands’ (Collings & Mellahi, 2009).

Although the importance of TM to an institution’s success is overlooked by many organisations, the survey carried out by CIPD in 2010 indicates that companies are placing more importance on TM, aimed at information creation, sharing and maintenance. Thusly, they will have a better understanding of the relationship between TM and knowledge management, which will improve prospects for business success (Whelan & Carcary, 2011).

In this new competitive business atmosphere, organisations should be clear about the requirement to ensure that a reasonable number of abilities are spread across the workplace to prosper, but should also exercise the option to consider and deal with ability and manage talent effectively. As per Williamson (2011) these double activities are the most basic issues that can decide the achievement or disappointment of a company.

**TM and the organisations and Issues**

According to Neill and Heinen (2004), an effective organisation consistently pays attention to attracting, retaining, and improving the ability and talents of its employees. This, in turn, helps the organisation to define its strategy to ensure that plans take talented employees into account. If the organisation becomes unsuccessful in the utilisation of human capital, business decay is likely to result (Anwar, et al., 2014). Due to the swiftly moving, dynamic and exceptionally competitive global business sectors, organisations all over the world are making significant judgments and confronting difficulties in global TM (Schuler, et al., 2011). Gupta (2006) maintains that in companies worldwide, each business must be prepared for satisfying the future business needs by dealing effectively with TM. Consequently, TM is becoming a critical indicator of business performance (Ifeoma, et al., 2015).

As indicated by Scullion, Mullholland and Zaharie (2020), there are some issues that employers experience while supervising ability and potential in the work environment. It has become hard to retain and attract the workers and recruit possible candidates in the current climate. Limited variety is a significant issue in the working environment, which influences the possibility of retaining employees. Different workplace cultures improve
prospects for development and urge individuals to develop innovative ideas. Low social variety or ineffectual management procedures impact negatively on TM, as it prompts low inspiration among the employees. Absence of convincing leadership is another significant factor in managing skilled employees, as new recruits should be guided and prepared to develop their abilities and supported in their efforts to improve performance (McNulty & Cieri, 2016). Another issue in the current business situation is the highly competitive rivalry for gaining the best potential employees. All organizations need to employ talented contenders to expand competitiveness and, to achieve these objectives, offer worthwhile packages and advantages for attracting talented applicants. This provides talented employees with opportunities for changing occupations. Moreover, it adversely impacts upon a company’s turnover rate, which may result in low performance in the organisation and deferral in the work cycle. Unappealing society resulting from insufficient talent at executive level is another issue, as a work culture, characterised by low cooperation and clashes, is likely to debilitate individual performance and result in inadequate TM (Scullion, et al., 2020).

Building up an inventive workplace characterised by an effective approach to TM, which strengthens positive links between employers and employees should create a more effective organisation. An inventive work culture can urge employees to expand their abilities and potential, which, in turn, should upgrade the effectiveness and commitment of the general labour force, by improving communications, strengthening cooperation, and securing worker commitment to improving performance. Moreover, the HRM group can set out the requirements and job specifications for applicants, in addition to planning job roles, compensation, and other recruiting components. This methodology should attract applicants to join and remain with the organisation (Aminudin, et al., 2017). Creating and preparing programs with powerful objectives and techniques for examining and controlling the work force is extremely important in persuading employees to expand existing skills sets and talents. Impact preparation will motivate employees to build upon existing abilities within the company and improve its prospects for success. (Mahfoozi, et al., 2018).

Workforce engagement and TM

In respect of workforce engagement, commitment is an essential component. A committed worker is less likely to leave the company and, therefore, by pulling in and retaining ability, the company is able to construct a more effective information base and to gain a competitive advantage over other organisations (Albrecht, et al., 2015). In Kahn’s view (1990), worker commitment requires the presence of three inter-related conditions – significance of work, social and hierarchical security, and accessibility to company management and values. Powerful talent deployment and harnessing are important advantages associated with securing worker commitment.
Worker commitment is demonstrated by interest in development, eagerness in the working environment, profitability, responsibility, effective conduct, and better results as a rule (Pandita & Bedarkar, 2015). Improved conduct emerges out of the certainty that workers are keen on performing well in their positions. They share a conviction that their work impacts positively upon the company’s results. Their conviction, which is instrumental, lies in the belief that how they lead themselves and work together will provide the incentives for the company’s success (Albrecht, et al., 2015).

Creating competitive advantage by properly utilising TM

**Stage One: Pulling in Talent**

**Ability Planning:** Organizations through HR Professionals estimate deliberately the organisation’s workforce needs, the range of abilities and capabilities required, fit with the company culture, and supply in respect of the labour market.

**Recruitment:** The organization attempts to recruit applicants whose skills and qualifications map on to the Ability Planning exercise previously undertaken by HR Professionals. Positions are advertised internally and externally, to provide opportunities for workers already in the company to apply for another position.

**Selection:** Candidates are shortlisted, tested and interviewed to determine the individual best suited for the position, using a variety of methods. The ultimate choice should be done cautiously to limit dangers inherent in selecting someone who does not meet fully the requirements set out in ability planning.

**Induction:** The company sets out clear expectations for each new employee and provides details about the role. It is significant for each new worker to understand details about their new position and how it fits in the company structure.

**Stage 2: Developing Talent.**

**Appraisal/Performance Review:** This cycle is done to assess the employee’s performance. One approach to evaluation is competency by targets (CBO).

**Ability planning:** Ability planning is assessed continuously to estimate the strengths and weaknesses of employees in their daily work environment and, also to provisionally assess future potential with respect to TM.

**Improvement through development planning:** As a consequence of Ability Identification and planning, HR Professionals in the Organisation know the current ability levels of every worker and, on the basis of findings, are able to make positive recommendations for development needs that will align with the organisation’s current and future plans for workforce improvement.

**Stage Three: Retaining Talent.** Some important steps are:
Career arranging: To retain talented employees, the organisation must balance its own requirements with the requests, wishes, and capabilities demonstrated by each worker with respect to future prospects for advancement within the company.

Progression arranging: The idea here is that the workforce will be structured in such a way that no key positions will become vacant, solely because of a talented employee’s unplanned departure. Under succession planning, other talented employees should be able to carry out role requirements in the short or medium term, or at least until the post can be advertised.

General Problems in Managing Talent

According to Vaimen et al., (2012), although firms will in general perceive the significance of TM, they frequently neglect to oversee it successfully. In Green’s view (2008), clarity about issues that occasionally bring about incapability are given low priority in TM wording. Organisations need to engage in more conversation about what is really needed to establish TM in their respective companies. Another issue is talent loss brought about by poor communication between administrators and staff members and the lack of attention paid to basic issues and potential answers for drawing in talent. At times, for example, almost every company has understood their specific selling strategy, but this has not been understood from the viewpoint of the workforce. Another problem which Green (2008) mentions is the crucial role of the line manager in initiating and overseeing improvement procedures.

Scullion and Collings (2011) claim that limited theoretical and scholarly research is also an issue in respect of TM. Lack of clarity about the objectives of TM is a testing factor for any company (Bethke-Langenegger, et al., 2011). The topic of how to characterize, recognize, create, and oversee ability still remain unanswered (Nilsson & Ellstrom, 2012). Companies cannot stay serious if they cannot pull in, create, and hold skilled laborers. This implies that TM is an essential factor that should be taken seriously by any company.

Conclusion

A superior organisation is normally upheld by a proactive and methodical HR and talented senior executives. Consequently, every company needs to have a deliberate plan in respect of developing, implementing and encouraging effective TM practices. Although HR professionals can coordinate pulling in, creating and retaining talented employees, it is up to an organisation to identify the factors required to recruit workers that meet the needs of the company and to provide opportunities for development that will encourage them to continue to contribute to the company’s success over time.

References


Literature Review: Education and Social Class, A Focus on Marxist Ideology

Golam Faqruzzaman\(^6\) and Tasnim Jahan\(^7\),

Abstract

More than 150 years ago, Karl Marx, a philosopher and revolutionary thinker, initiated many theories that still influence contemporary discussions of society and social systems. His works generated many critical questions and revolutionary ideas that are still relevant in the current world. To understand the social system and its education, we need to know the ideas of Marx put forward in respect of inequality, segregation, and poverty prevailing in capitalist society. To Marx, capitalism is the main source of socio-economic and educational inequality, which ultimately works for a specific class. His idea of mass education and strategy to control society are interlinked. In his view, education works as a tool to control the class domination in society. His idea of education is still existing in the UK, where the education system is controlled by the elite class. Through the mechanism of private schools, the elite class develops a dominant privilege, which enables them to maintain a high standing position in all aspects of the society.

**Keywords:** Education and Social Class; Marxist Ideology

\(^6\) FHEA, Programme Leader, HND Business and Health and Social Care, London Churchill College.

\(^7\) Researcher. Email: tjonny@yahoo.com
Introduction

In the era of globalisation, it is difficult to ignore the contribution of education in global society. Countries around the world are working tirelessly to ensure education for all of their citizens. It is one of the main pillars of the Millennium Development Goal adopted by the United Nations (UN) (UN 2020). The difficulty is that the meaning and purpose of education are different for different communities and people. For some, ‘it is a process of gaining knowledge and skills to compete in the global market’ (Aubrey and Riley 2016:1). For others, it is just a qualification acquired in school, college, or university. In the current pandemic situation, for example, education is about developing a vaccine for the deadly Coronavirus.

Many scholars like Karl Marx, linked education with social class and used ideology to explain the relationship. This paper will discuss the meaning and purpose of education in relation to social class with a focus on the theories of Karl Marx.

The purpose of Education

Education is a process, which helps us to learn different things in different situations. It is a basis for cultural development and critical preparation for future life (UK.GOV 2020). It provides the required skills and knowledge and supports the individual to achieve her/his potential. It also helps individuals to adjust to society. Education is a process of learning where ‘we learn by living and live by learning’ (Bhattacharya 2006:2). Nowadays, education is often visualised as academic learning acquired in schools, colleges, and universities, where each institution pursues a national curriculum and assessment system associated with a specific qualifications framework that dictates an individual’s capacity to contribute to society and focus upon securing employment. It is sometimes criticised for developing political and ideological concepts aimed at creating and maintaining traditional class supremacy (Hill 2018: 9). In the broader, deeper and more meaningful sense, however, the purpose of education is about learning new knowledge, facilitating critical thinking, and developing the personalities and characteristics of individuals (Bhattacharya 2006:5).

Education and Social Class

Social class is defined as segmentation in the society based on some pre-determined criteria including wealth, education, employment, and background. It exists all over the world, in all societies. In the UK, for example, society in the past was mostly divided into three broad social classes: working, middle and upper class, and primarily based on wealth. In a recent survey, segmentation in the UK has been extended to encompass seven broad categories, still closely associated with wealth: “elite, established middle class, technical middle class, new affluent workers, traditional working class, emergent service workers, and precarious proletariat” (BBC News 2013). Education is also interlinked with social class. In the UK education system, for example, various uneven patterns of achievement are also demonstrated within social
divisions in respect of achieving high scores on A levels, gaining degree or post degree qualifications with high marks and accessing opportunities leading to professional career advancement. (Hill 2018:181).

Researchers have also found that learners’ academic outcomes are commonly linked to their social backgrounds, particularly their parent’s income, academic qualifications, or occupations (Reardon 2011), which raises serious questions about students’ academic attainment and how performance results relate to social class. Karl Marx, a leading thinker and scholar, criticised this process and claimed that education in schools was being used to uphold and reproduce social structures that would ensure the poor performance of students from the working class. In other words, the set curriculum was practiced in a way that ensured that members of the upper and middle continued to dominate over the working class. Today, this type of schooling is criticised by scholars as “an Ideological State Apparatus (ISA) which works to convince learners that the status quo is reasonable and lawful” (Hill 2008).

**Education and Karl Marx**

Karl Marx visualizes the education system as a major part of the superstructure which functions in the interests of capitalism (Steelle and Taylor 2004: 573). Marx considers education as a commodity for the dominant ruling class (Bourgeoisie), which serves as a practical use-value for capitalist society. Marx says that the elite class is controlling the material forces as well as the intellectual forces of society. Within this process, they are also controlling the ‘means of mental production’, in ways that ensure dominance is retained over the working class. (Marxists.org. 2020). In this process, the school is teaching the ‘know-how’ process, where students are learning the basic principles of the ruling ideology: for example, the rules of good behaviour, respect, and order established by the dominant class (Hill 2008).

As a result, education is a mechanism for ensuring ruling class dominance over capitalist society continues from generation to generation. As a result, preserving the existing class structure becomes the main function of education in capitalist society (Reay 2017:29). Education plays a crucial role in preserving inequalities to ensure the upper-class domination. (Steelle and Taylor 2004: 574). The Marxist view of education can be categorised into three broad categories:

**Reproduction of Class inequalities**

Education is a tool to reproduce the class inequalities in the society, where people from the upper classes tend to acquire the best education, middle-class parents use their resources to send their children into the best schools and lower-class/working-class children are likely to receive a comparatively poorer education and obtain lower paid working-class jobs (Hill 2008). Moreover, educational institutions are reproducing the capitalist ideology and distributing the required skills to reproduce the social division of labour through “legitimising the capitalist rationality and sustaining the dominant social practices” (Giroux 1983:257). The entire social system is working in a way that working-
class people cannot afford to go to better-equipped institutions for a better education. In the academic institutions, they are learning some social norms (rights, respects and tolerance) of believing in the system, which ultimately promotes class inequalities.

Legitimisation of Class inequalities

To Marxists, money is the ultimate driving force to get an education. Teachers are promoting the 'myth of meritocracy' to their pupils (Bowels and Gintis 1976). Students are informed about the difference between a pass and a fail. They are motivated to believe about an equal chance in education, and, if they fail, their lack of ability and practice should be blamed. This develops the myth of the legitimacy of the capitalist world, as the wealthy students are going to the private school where they are receiving a better education and more opportunities to succeed in their lives.

As a result, the system is legitimising financial inequality by ensuring meritocratic instruments for the individual students in the society, where different students will be treated differently. This system promotes the notion of success based on the possession of capital and skills (technical and cognitive) based on meritocratic principles (Bowels and Gintis 1976).

Teacher as a tool to ensure class inequalities

Teachers are playing their role, intentionally or unintentionally, in ensuring class inequalities in society. Apart from the direct curriculum, there is a hidden curriculum that teachers are teaching to elevate middle-class students over working-class students. The hidden curriculum is disseminating some specific beliefs and values: in particular, punctuality, professionalism, commitment and motivation (Kelly 2001). Learners are learning those unintentionally. In the long run, the entire social system is organised around the exploitation of students from working-class backgrounds in a way that ensures the dominance of the ruling class (Hill 2008).

The Marxist approach does not go without criticism. One of the major concerns is the focus placed upon the limited access of working-class children to a good education. There are many examples in the current society, where children from lower-class families are attending leading universities, acquiring professional qualifications, and securing white-collar jobs. Marx is also criticised for not discussing education in greater detail, given its importance to society. Discussions appear in a scattered way in several of his writings, and, during his time, there was no state education (Brown and Brown, 2020). Marx’s analysis of education can also be criticised for being too narrow. Focus is placed primarily on representing educational institutions and their mechanisms of working as tools for preserving the capitalist structure and the class system, rather than considering education in its broader sense as a process of learning that helps people to improve their knowledge and understanding. The purpose of education is about improving the capacity of an individual to contribute to the society in which s/he is living.
Apart from the criticism, there are some positive actions that support Marx’s criticisms of education. In the UK, for example, the availability of private schools and the costs of going there, in addition to grammar schools, support his argument that schools perpetuate the existence of a privileged class in society. In general, private schools have better facilities and feature lower teacher to student ratios. As shown in the table below, state schools maintain around a 1:15 ratio of teacher to students, as compared to 1:10 in private schools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>UK</th>
<th>UK (maintained schools)</th>
<th>UK (Independent schools)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Average IESA score</td>
<td>500</td>
<td>497</td>
<td>516</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Socio-economic background</td>
<td>0.20</td>
<td>0.16</td>
<td>0.46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>0.93</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Speak national language at home</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td>0.97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Students per teacher</td>
<td>14.5</td>
<td>14.9</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality of resources (Index)</td>
<td>0.45</td>
<td>0.44</td>
<td>0.61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Residency not considered in admittance</td>
<td>0.19</td>
<td>0.17</td>
<td>0.35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Academic performance not considered in admittance</td>
<td>0.72</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table: State vs private school (Reay 2017: 45)**

The quality of resources is far higher in private schools compared to that of state schools. Consequently, private schools are not only facilitating the development of an elite class but also becoming the primary instrument for enabled the ruling class to maintain a high standing position in all aspects of the society, including politics, laws, media, and even in the sports. In 2016, for example, 28% of participants who participated in Rio Olympics from the UK were from private schools, compared with 20% in the 2012 Olympics. In the 2016 Olympics, six ex-students from one private school in Somerset participated (Pells 2016). Our current Prime Minister is from a private school and his daughter is also going to private school, demonstrating Marx’s criticisms of education even in the present world, where the views are transferring from generation to generation.

**Conclusion**

Education is the process of acquiring knowledge and understanding, but Marx visualised it as a tool to exploit the lower class in a capitalist society. In some cases, Marx’s views are supported in modern-day England. Separate private schools and in some cases grammar schools reinforce a sense of social class in society. Children from wealthy families are attending private schools, where they learn, in a way, that they can do better than most of the poorer children going to state schools. Students from private schools have better access to resources and better teacher to student ratios. Moreover, mixing with middle-class students helps to re-enforce the upper-class culture allowing it to flourish at an even higher level. Ensuring the dominance of the upper-class in society. We can still see the low representation of students from working-class backgrounds in the top universities, where admission is so competitive for most of the working-class students. The white-collar jobs are also dominated by upper-class elites with some representation of the middle class. In this sector, the working class is mostly engaged in low paid blue-collar jobs, though they have some minor representation in white-collar professions.
On the other hand, over the period of time, education creates a sense of reality in the society, and that has resulted in a separate attempt for some elite universities to recruit some students from working class backgrounds. However, the purpose of education is not only about the institution and the part played in delivering hidden agendas of capitalist society, it is also about expanding an individual’s knowledge and understanding within a changing environment. History suggests that Marx’s criticism of social class and its management of education still exist in modern-day England. However, any new idea or knowledge can be education. This allows us to think about the purpose and meaning of education differently.

References


Pells, R. (2016). Private school students have a better chance of being Olympic champions, claims Sir Steve Redgrave. The Independent, [online] Available at: <http://Private school students have a better chance of being Olympic champions, claims Sir Steve Redgrave> [Accessed 17 Dec 2020].


The Perceptions in France of Higher Education Programmes Taught in English

Nicolas Verger

Abstract

France is far behind in languages, notably in English, and this could be detrimental to the future of its businesses. It has shown resilience to adapt to international educational standards, and companies are now starting to find that young French graduates don’t learn the necessary skills to work in an international environment. Meanwhile, Anglo-Saxon countries have been branching out and exporting their programmes to attract foreign students who are interested in Anglo-Saxon studies. The aim of this research was to find if there was an interest or a demand for such programmes amongst students and parents of students, and to determine how recruiters perceive Anglo-Saxon higher education as opposed to French higher education. Students and parents were selected through quota sampling to participate in this research, and it was discovered, by surveying them, that they were not aware of many Anglo-Saxon programmes accessible in France, notably a Bachelor programme from a Coventry University offshore campus in their own town. The HR managers, who were interviewed separately, admitted that in general French companies don’t know the content of Anglo-Saxon programmes. Students and parents of students were generally interested in English studies, most of them stating that it was the best way of perfecting language skills, while those that weren’t interested had a preference for French degrees. The majority would prefer to get their English degree abroad as well, which could mean that potential students of offshore campuses would be more likely to study abroad than in an exported programme in France. HR managers thought that education in France needs to evolve to resemble Anglo-Saxon education so that young graduates could better adapt to international companies. It has also become increasingly clear that a good level of English is required for a managerial position. Generally, French recruiters pick candidates with French degrees as they are more familiar with them. Anglo-Saxon programmes had the image of being expensive for students and their parents, while they were mostly unaware that those exact same programmes are cheaper in France. Branch campuses have an advantage of price over their home country counterparts, but they would still seem expensive to French students. However, students and their parents were still willing to pay a high price if it means having a better career. In general, students and parents of students perceived English programmes as an excellent means of language education, while HR managers perceived English programmes as essential to working in an international firm.

Keywords: Language education; English Degree Programmes in France; English Language Skills
Introduction: Anglo-Saxon Studies in France

With the rise of globalization, it has become clear that using commonly accepted diplomas and knowing a universally used trading language, English, are essential to the present and the future of international business. However, France has not yet entirely accepted this new turn of events, believing instead to preserve its language and values.

The Toubon Law (1994) is a testament to this hostility towards English: it makes the use of French (in education, work, trade, and public services) mandatory, which complicates the expansion of English education in France. Nonetheless, according to Héran (2013), English education has taken great strides towards progress and raising awareness in the importance of English for international communication. In theory, teaching completely English in France is illegal according to the Toubon Law, but this law is not applicable to establishments with international courses. This is because it is clear that English is the global business language and that it encourages foreign students to study in France, making the country fifth in the world in total number of foreign students (and first for a non-English speaking country) (Le Monde, 2013: 17). In fact, a study by Campus France (2013) revealed that nine in ten foreign students who had graduated or studied in France recommend it as an attractive destination to pursue studies. Schools and universities, notably international ones, are therefore permitted to have programmes entirely in English in order to attract foreign students.

That is well and good for foreign students, but what about the development of French students? When only 39% of its population can hold a conversation in English (Appendix 1), far behind most northern European countries, it would seem that France is lagging behind when it comes to speaking English. It has become apparent that if France does not accept that English is the global language of business, it would be a fatal blow to future generations (Roberts, 2013).

There now are many forms of English programmes in France, such as offshore campuses, exported from universities in the United Kingdom or the United States (Le Monde Campus, 2014). They are attractive for French students who wish to study in English or obtain an internationally recognised diploma while spending much less than English students, but it seems that still too few students choose offshore campuses over classic French degrees. Since the implementation of the Bologna Process, which aims to converge and unify the European higher education of diplomas, France has taken steps to standardize their diplomas to the European norm (Malan, 2004), although a study has shown that awareness for this process was lacking in France as most people were still unfamiliar with it (Neive, Veiga, 2013: 70).

It would appear that French students have gained more and more interest over the years in English, but that insufficient data has been collected to know the perceptions and the demand in the market. It would be greatly beneficial to understand the perceptions and demand for such education in France and to study a relatively affluent area to know more accurately how to market them, or at least to be able to determine
what their perceptions are. More specifically, the sample target of my research was the vicinity of Meaux, because little research has been done there, and the presence of a Coventry University London Campus offshore campus there made the location ideal for the study.

So to reiterate the question: what are the perceptions and the demand for higher education English programmes in France? I will first present the objectives of this research, as they were the three objectives that guided the direction of my study. Then, the “literature review” section will give an overview of the secondary data findings, and what secondary sources have said on the topic. After that, the “methodology” section provides explanations about my research plan, philosophy, approaches, strategies and data collection methods. Finally, I will explain how I collected my data, and then present the analysis of the collected primary and secondary data.

**Research Objectives**

These objectives were verified by the SMART method, to make sure they were Specific, Measurable, Achievable, Realistic and Timely.

1/ Identify the perceptions of higher education in English for students who attend schools in Meaux (one of the two largest cities in Seine-et-Marne, France).

Students from two different schools in Meaux were selected for sampling. Of the 150 that were selected, half were in private schools in special English programmes, and the other half in public schools and not doing special English programmes. This research aimed to find their awareness, interest and demand for higher education English programmes.

2/ Identify the perceptions of higher education in English for parents of students in Meaux.

A sample of 50 parents of students was selected to represent parents of students in France in general, as parents are often the ones who pay for a student’s education and influence where he or she may want to study, then it was deemed pertinent to also find their awareness, interest and demand for higher education English programmes.

3/ Determine perceptions of HR representatives in International companies in evaluating diplomas and other qualifications in English of prospective employees.

To represent International companies in France, two HR managers in large firms accepted to be interviewed. The aim of this research was find out how they value Anglo-Saxon degrees in their companies, what their awareness of those degrees were, and what they look for in candidates.


**Literature Review**

A study conducted by the British Council (Going Global, 2014a) discovered that most students around the world participating in international programmes have begun such education because of the opportunities of an internationally recognized degree and to learn English. French students were part of the sample surveyed. For the most part, French students prefer graduating in French universities in French programmes, and the Bologna Process did little to change French perceptions of international degrees (Neive, Veiga, 2013) despite the change in education structure (LMD), and it was only recently that the English “Bachelor” started to become a trend amongst students in France, although it is still not very known by recruiters, as only 80% of those surveyed in a recent study “knew” what a Bachelor is and only 36% of them recognised it as an undergraduate degree (Arnoux, 2013). This point was stated as well by Pompey (2013) and by Bourcieu (2013) who explained that French have a misconception about what the English term Bachelor stands for.

The study by Héran (2013) proved that English is already the dominating language in France for science and business, even though the French government is still divided on whether it should allow English more leeway (Caulcutt, 2013). This therefore could be linked to the issue of the Bachelor degree not being as recognised in France as the Licence, even though they are officially equivalent (according to the Bologna Process), and it could be linked as well to the entire issue of the perceptions of higher education English programmes, such as those accessible in offshore campuses. An article in the Guardian by Ratcliffe (2013), confirmed that there was a recent surge of students worldwide enrolling in international branch campuses, while another article in the Guardian by Adams (2014) went so far as to say that British students were interested in enrolling overseas, such as in France, because of the more advantageous tuition fees.

According to the University of Boston, branch campuses are risky because they may suffer from reputation (Boston College, 2010: 3), but another study by the British Council (Going Global, 2013b) shows that transnational higher education campuses are greatly beneficial for the host country, since most students find those programmes more affordable than studying abroad. Finally, an article by the Observatory of Borderless Higher Education (Anon, 2009), explains that the “increase in English-taught programmes (in France) has been driven primarily by competition for international prestige, students and revenue”. However, it poses the legitimate question if English will survive the test of time throughout the French education system.

While it is yet unclear what the perceptions in France of English higher education programmes are, some studies have been made about the perceptions of French higher education by foreigners, such as in The Figaro (2015a), and it was revealed that foreigners do not understand why French managers pay more importance to their qualifications rather than their skills and competences when clearly companies in France
find that students who graduated in French universities do not learn the skills required to work in large international firms (Figaro, 2015b). However, it is clear that insufficient field research had been conducted on the demand and perceptions for Anglo-Saxon programmes in France, which lends weight to the purpose of this research.

**Methodology and Research Design**

In respect of the research design, Pragmatism was adopted as the prevailing philosophy, a blended approach to Induction and Deduction was taken and a mixture of qualitative and quantitative methods was adopted. Having explained my research design, the first method of data collection selected was the questionnaire, because I could survey a sample of respondents, representative of the parents, students and HR managers all across France in within a short period of time. My next data collection approach was to conduct semi-structured interviews, which could provide more detailed answers and add more information and insight on the topic than could be gathered in a survey. To complete the triangulation of data, a review of secondary data deemed relevant to my subject was undertaken. This method of collecting data allowed me to get insight into my topic or on a related topic through the eyes of journalists and experts. These three methods together gave me enough data that, after analysis, I was be able to give a complete description and even go further and explain the perceptions of higher education English programs in Meaux.

**Data Collection and Analysis**

The target of this research was to have responses from students from two very different types of programmes. On the one hand, there were students from a two-year programme on managing enterprises, and these students will now be referred to as "Management students" (or “MUC students”). On the other hand, there were students from an optional high school programme that is attached to the Baccalauréat that gives more English language training. These students more focused on English training will now be referred to as international students (or “SI students”).

The Management programme is a more French orientated degree, which focuses on business inside of France, while the International Section programme has a more international orientation and aims to make its students better at languages and more interested in other cultures. Surveying students answered my first research objective.

The second research objective was to find the perceptions of the students’ parents. For this, surveys were also handed to the parents of the students of the International Section, and they were kind enough to answer the questions for the sake of educating their children.

The initial idea, concerning the survey, was to have the students and parents fill out the questionnaire online through SurveyMonkey.com. However, this method wouldn’t have been very efficient, since there was the possibility of getting a low response rate, and the aim at first was to have between 100 and 150
responses. I therefore opted for a more direct approach. I printed and personally handed out the surveys to students in the two different schools and they filled them out and returned them straight-away. In the end, the aim of total responses was met, which had the potential of making this research more credible.

The professors teaching on the two programmes allowed me to distribute the questionnaires to their students. Consequently, some of the questions were designed specifically to provide professors with more insight about what the students thought of their current programmes. This meant that there were two survey models: one for the International students and one for the Management students. The main questions that were pertinent to this research were the same for both questionnaires, so comparing all three groups (the two different programmes, and the parents) was very relevant.

**Third Objective: collecting data from International Companies in France**

To meet the third objective of finding the perceptions of HR representatives of International companies in France on English higher education, it was decided that interviews would be the best method of collecting qualitative data. I was able to get in contact two HR managers from large International companies, but because of how far away they were, and because the travel expenses did not enter into the budget of this research, it was decided that the interviews would be over the phone, rather than in person. The two interviewees were very helpful with their responses and were most interested in the topic for personal and professional reasons.

**Collecting Data from Secondary Sources**

Secondary data was also collected, through academic journals, business journals and other reliable news sources, such as The Guardian, as well as many reviews and magazines in France that covered the topic. Because of this, some of the sources that were collected are in French, but as this research concerns the perceptions in France, then it is quite pertinent. Collecting secondary data was also vital for understanding the current situation of higher education in France.

**Data Analysis**

The first objective of this research was to discover the perceptions of students of English higher education programmes. I wanted to find out, first of all, what English programmes students know of, or if they are interested in them at all. In the survey, several English programmes were listed, and the respondents were asked if they knew of them.

What these charts reveal is that a minimum of 80% of Management students (Figure 2) did not know about these programmes and were not interested in knowing about them. The International Students (Figure 1) proved to be more informed of these programmes, as they knew more about such English programmes as the Baccalauréat International or the TOEIC and even 60% were interested in knowing more about the OIB. Interestingly enough, the parents of the
International Section knew less about these programmes than their children, but it is likely because the students have encountered them while at school.

Figure 1. What programmes do they know?

Figure 2. What programmes do they know? (management students)

The next question of the survey was about the Bachelor’s degree. From the initial secondary data analysis, it was revealed that only 36% of French know that the Bachelor is an undergraduate degree (Arnoux, 2013). To verify this number, the sample of students was asked about it.

Figure 3a: University Level French students believe a bachelor represents

Figure 3b: University Level French Management students believe a bachelor represents

When French refer to the different levels of higher education, they speak in terms of how many years after the Baccalauréat. Therefore, a Master’s degree is also known as a BAC+5. Officially, a Bachelor degree would be a BAC+3, because the Licence diploma (a BAC+3) was created - with the implementation of the Bologna Process in France - to be the equivalent of the Bachelor degree. A BA with Honours is actually
recognised internationally as a BAC+4 (a senior undergraduate degree), while it is not recognised as thus in France. This is why, when querying about the Bachelor degree, I asked if the respondents knew what the level of education for it was. BAC+3 and BAC+4 were both accepted as correct answers. Only 37% (34+3) of International students were correct in guessing what a Bachelor is (Figure 4), and over a quarter didn’t even venture a guess, while 60% (47+13) of Management students were right. This still represents an alarming number of students who are unsure of what a Bachelor is, which only proves the information collected from the secondary data. This misconception is perhaps due to the fact that it is commonly known in France that a “Bachelier” is a student who has passed the Baccalauréat. This is also stated by both Pompey (2013) and Bourcieu (2013), who claim as well that the “Bachelor” has no renown amongst the French population. HR representatives in France were more knowledgeable on the subject. They both knew that the Licence is meant to be the equivalent of the Bachelor, but while one stated that in his company they did not know what skills could be learned from this degree, the other HR representative said that her company had an HR team that specialised in finding out exactly what these degrees offered students. The parents of International Section, meanwhile, also knew more of this degree than the students did, as two thirds of them knew of its equivalence.

Responses from the parents of International Section students

Furthermore, when asked if they knew about the offshore campus of Coventry University in their own town, Meaux, nearly three quarters of all students had no idea of its presence (Figure 5). While analysis of secondary data has shown that offshore campuses are spreading worldwide (Ratcliffe, 2013), they are generally not as well-known as local programmes (Boston College, 2010: 3). The findings of the survey are a testament to that last point.

Responses from International Section students

Figure 4 Responses from the parents:

Figure 5 Are they aware of a Bachelor programme in their area (international section)?
Figure 6 Are they aware of a Bachelor programme in their area (management students)?

The parents also did not know of the existence of a Bachelor programme in their area.

Clearly, this proves that the Bachelor degree is generally not well known in France, while it is a staple of higher education all around the world. Is it because French education is far behind the educational systems of other countries, as suggested by the interview of HR staff members? It could also just simply be an issue of translation.

Since preliminary analysis of secondary data made clear that there was a misconception of the term “Bachelor” in France, this allowed for the creation of a theory that maybe French would prefer if it were called an “English licence” (Licence Anglaise). Proposing this as a hypothesis, a theory previously created in my mind, I added deduction to my approach (Saunders & Lewis, 2012). I then asked if the respondents would prefer a “French licence in English”, or an “English licence” (Figure 7).

Figure 7a. French Bachelor in English or an English Bachelor? International Section

Figure 7b. French Bachelor in English or an English Bachelor? Management Students

Responses were vastly different here, as we can see that more than half of Management students preferred having a French licence in English over an English licence, while nearly nine in ten of the International Section students preferred the English licence.
believe that students who graduate from French universities lack the requisite business skills and knowledge.

One possibility of the ignorance in France concerning the English higher education degrees is that many French are proud of their language and culture. In order to protect their language and culture from the “invasion” of English, the government instated the Toubon Law (1994), which makes the use of French mandatory for any work, trade, education or public services inside of France. This means that English is only (officially) taught to be used abroad.

Responses from the parents of International Section students

Figure 9: Would they consider an English Higher Education programme for their children? (parents)

However, what HR managers had to say about that is quite different: “I don’t know if offshore campuses should change the name of the Bachelor just to attract students. It would do well on the short term, but not on the long term”. Companies see the Bachelor as “chic”, and many are now starting to see that the Bachelor, as an Anglo-Saxon degree, gives students the tools they need to be able to adapt to company requirements, especially since a recent study in the Figaro (2015b) revealed that most companies...
in order to improve their level of English. This point can also be proven by research done by the British Council (Going Global, 2014a), which states that students from all around Europe, including France, tend to choose an English higher education degree mainly to improve their language skills.

HR managers also believe that having an Anglo-Saxon degree is better for an international career. According to them, French universities format their students to work in France (but as we saw earlier, it is no longer the case), while Anglo-Saxon universities give students more international opportunities.

Parents would also choose an English degree for linguistic purposes. What I can deduce from this is that parents, as well as students, perceive English programmes as an excellent way of learning English, and by extension it also means that they perceive English as an important language that must be learned. On the other hand, HR managers said that speaking English in companies in France is not a prerequisite unless candidates want a managerial position. This could be the one of the reasons why parents want their children to learn English, as they believe that

---

**Figure 10a.** Why they would choose an English degree (international section students)

**Figure 10b.** Why they would choose an English degree (management students)

**Figure 11.** Why they would choose an English degree (parents)
learning English will give them more professional opportunities, in France or abroad.

Figure 12 shows that more than three in four of all students would prefer to study abroad, because there is no better way to learn a language than full immersion in another country. Studying abroad also provides more experience with another country’s culture, which in turn opens up new potential career opportunities, because recruiters seek out people with more knowledge about a country’s subculture.

Responses from International Section students

![Figure 12a where would they enrol (section international students)]

Responses from Management students

![Figure 12b where would they enrol (management students)]

As seen above improving English and career opportunities were the two main reasons cited for their choice of study abroad. In fact nine in ten of respondents who preferred to stay in France said they did so to stay close to their families.

While considerably fewer of the International Section students said that their reason for not choosing an English degree was because they weren’t interested in working abroad, this was because more than one in four were more interested in French degrees, and because more than one in four thought the costs were too high. Three in four of the students answering other stated their primary reason was proximity to their families. These students maybe thought it was only possible to obtain an English degree abroad, although offshore campuses in France offer degrees in English in many major cities in France. This could be more of a cultural issue than an institutional one. English is, after all, the language of science and business (Héran, 2013), and even local firms and businesses must adapt to internationalisation. Perhaps French students are misinformed as to what an English degree provides.

Responses from International Section

![Figure 13. Why they would not choose an English degree (SI students)]
The Management students (Figure 14), who answered “no” to an English degree, were more split on their reasons. The four different factors were each between 24% and 26%.

**Responses from Management students**

To summarize this section, it is clear that students and parents who were interested in an English higher education degree view such a degree as either an ideal course for improving their level of English and as a tool to have a career with better opportunities. They were all nearly unanimous in saying that the ideal place to study for an English degree is abroad, because complete immersion is the best form of education possible. This factor also means that those students would likely prefer studying abroad rather than enrolling in an offshore campus. This could explain why branch campuses are not as popular in France, and why they’re not well known, because students prefer studying for English programmes abroad. HR representatives further emphasized that while speaking English is not a necessity in France (far from it), it is imperative for those in managerial positions in International firms.

On the other hand, those who were not interested in a higher education in English, stated that this is because they were for the most part not interested in working abroad and were more interested in French degrees. Over a quarter of the Management students even said they would not try their hand at an English degree because they believed it to be too costly. Finally, 60% of parents, who were not interested in encouraging their children to enroll in an English higher education programme, preferred French degrees. The general perceptions by students, parents and HR managers is that to work in France, one must have a French degree, while working abroad or in an International context is best with an Anglo-Saxon qualification.
Overall, only half the students were interested in a higher education degree in English. This total is quite satisfactory, as it seems there is a high demand for such education, which means a lot of potential students who would enrol in a higher education English programme. Unfortunately, being interested in it does not necessarily mean that they would, as other important factors would come in the way: their future career plans (and where they want to work), costs (as French universities are often less costly than in Anglo-Saxon countries), and perhaps also the fact that they would not want to go too far from home (in which case they are unaware of the rising number of offshore campuses in France).

**Perceptions of Cost in English Higher Education**

As mentioned in Figures 13, 14 and 15, the cost of a programme was a big reason why students wouldn’t enrol in an English course. Several of the questions of the survey were on the topic of cost, because it is a significant factor when choosing a programme and aim of this research was to determine how important costs were to students when they are choosing an educational programme, and to determine if they thought such degrees were too costly. This is why respondents were asked to classify different factors, when choosing an educational programme, in order of importance. These rankings were rearranged into points (5 points for most important, 4 points for second, etcetera), so that we could see what factors were more important to the respondents. So in Figure 16, “professional opportunities” has scored nearly 500 points from the answers of all students.

**Educational experience**

![Responses from all students and parents](image)

Figure 16. Factors involved in choosing a programme

This bar chart reveals that when students and parents choose a programme, the first factor they are looking for are the professional opportunities. Second comes the notoriety of the school and/or of the programme; third is the proximity of the school to them, and the cost of the programme comes only fourth.

This does not mean that students and parents don’t place any importance on the cost of a programme, but rather that the other factors are more important. That also means that if a course offers considerable professional opportunities, has a very good reputation, and is near enough, then there are more chances that students and parents would try to overcome the costs of the programme.

This knowledge could be very useful, because offshore campuses of English programmes could try to market their courses as steppingstones to successful professional careers. Students and
parents need to feel like they are getting their money’s worth for their education. One of the possible perceptions of parents and students concerning English higher education is that it is not worth the investment.

However, the next graphs (Figures 17) show that students are quite unaware of the tuition fees for English degrees in France (offshore campuses). While undergraduate degrees cost in average £9,000 in the United Kingdom, a BA (Hons) Global Business degree costs only half that price in euros in an offshore English provision in France.

**Responses from International Section students**

![Pie chart showing 29% Yes and 71% No responses](image)

Figure 17a. Do they know if English degrees are cheaper in France? (international section students)

**Responses from Management students**

![Pie chart showing 3% Yes and 97% No responses](image)

Figure 17b. Do they know if English degrees are cheaper in France? (management students)

Respondents were asked if they knew that the tuition fees for Anglo-Saxon degrees were cheaper in France than in their own countries, and nearly three in four of the International Section students answered that they didn't know (and more than three in four for their parents), while nearly all of the Management students answered “no”. On the other hand, British students are aware of this price difference, as even an article in The Guardian states that more and more British students were interested in enrolling in British offshore campuses for the more affordable tuition fees (Adams, 2014). In fact, these exported campuses are a boost for the host country, because they bring in “prestige, students and revenue” (Anon, 2009), so it really should be a priority for these offshore campuses to better promote their programmes.

**Responses from the parents of International Section students**

![Pie chart showing 23% Yes and 77% No responses](image)

Figure 18. Do they know if English degrees are cheaper in France (parents)

Finally, the respondents were asked if, in the case that they had the possibility to enrol in a Bachelor programme with Coventry University in France, the tuition fee would deter them from choosing the Bachelor course (Figures 19).
Figure 19a. Would the cost of a Bachelor deter students from enrolling? (international students)

Figure 19b. Would the cost of a Bachelor deter students from enrolling? (management students)

The responses, once again, were diametrically opposite. Nearly two thirds of the International Section students would not be deterred by the tuition fee of a Bachelor programme in France, while only more than a third of the Management students said the same.

Figure 20. Would the cost of a Bachelor deter parents from enrolling their children?

The parents of students were a perfect split on the question. A quarter of them added as an additional comment that they did not know what the cost of the programme was, so they could not properly answer the question. International Section students were clearly more aware, in general, of higher education English programmes, as well as more interested, and more apt to pay the tuition fees, than the Management students. It’s also important to note that students were generally more interested in the language aspects of such education, and most of those who weren’t interested in English programmes were actually not interested in the English language or culture at all. Furthermore, English programmes in France seem to carry the image of being expensive. To recap, students and parents see English programmes as expensive, but the majority would consider enrolling in one of those programmes if they thought they were worth the cost.

Conclusion

In general, students and parents of students are unaware of many common International or Anglo-
Saxon degrees that are accessible in France. There are two possibilities for this: either they were simply not interested in English degrees and that is why they never researched them, or the programmes are insufficiently advertised.

Nearly half of the total respondents of the survey (parents and students) did not know what the French equivalent of a Bachelor degree is. The interviewed HR managers knew of the equivalence of the Bachelor degree, but both confirmed that generally, in France, recruiters do not know what it is, and would most likely associate it with the Baccalauréat.

Maybe renaming the Bachelor in France as an “English Licence” would give the degree more credibility with French students, parents and recruiters. However, this would only serve on the short term (if even), because the Bachelor and the Licence are not really comparable in terms of content, methods of teaching, or international recognition. As stated by one of the HR managers, a Bachelor degree is perceived as being more “chic”.

Half the students surveyed were interested in English higher education. Their main reasons for this were to improve their level of English and to gain access to better international career opportunities. Most were unaware of the costs of English programmes, or even that English offshore campuses in France were quite affordable, but at least half of the total number of surveyed students were willing to choose a programme that offered what they wanted even if they were costly. Meanwhile, those who were not interested in English higher education preferred French degrees or were not interested in working abroad. Clearly, the perceptions of students are that English higher education programmes are ideal for working abroad or in an International context, and that it is better to have a French degree if one wants to work in France.

Three quarters of the parents of students were interested in English higher education for their children. Their main reason (by far) was so that their children could better learn English, which is also why the majority of parents would want them to study abroad, as it is the best way to learn a language. However, those who weren’t interested in enrolling their children in English higher education programmes stated – for the most part – that they were more interested in French degrees. If the two different points of view were to be assembled together, it could be assumed that parents perceive English higher education as an excellent means of learning English, but that getting a French degree is best for getting a managerial position in France.

Large companies in France do not make it mandatory for their employees to speak English, except for the managers who work in International firms. Speaking English is definitely an added value in a candidate’s résumé, but it is not a requirement except for managerial positions. The HR representatives were agreed on the fact that a French degree is best for working in France - because companies recognise them, unlike Anglo-Saxon degrees – while an Anglo-Saxon degree is ideal for working abroad. They further added that French
programmes should evolve to resemble their Anglo-Saxon counterparts, because young graduates from French universities often do not meet company requirements.

Generally, HR managers see Anglo-Saxon degrees in a good light, and they hope that these degrees get more recognition and notoriety in France, but currently companies are more French degree-orientated, mostly because they are unaware of what Anglo-Saxon programmes teach their students.

**Recommendations**

As this is just a study that aimed to find the perceptions in France of higher education English programmes, the recommendations presented here are rather points to think about if campuses of English higher education programmes wish to improve their services:

- Continue with the expansion of offshore campuses in France. These campuses offer interesting alternatives to students who wish to graduate with an English degree (to either improve their language skills or to open doors to International companies) but don’t want to go too far from home or cannot afford to study abroad.
- Include additional hours of English training in the offshore campuses. As English is the number one reason why students and their parents find Anglo-Saxon programmes to be attractive is that they are efficient means of learning English. This point could be used during promotions of these programmes to better sell them.
- Keep the tuition fees of these programmes under the prices of the “grandes écoles” in France, so as to be a competitive advantage. Increasing the tuition fees might only scare away potential students, including students who would be a perfect fit for these programmes, but feel they could not afford it.

**References**


Anon. (2009) *Allez-y? France’s latest transnational education initiatives to increase its market share in North Africa and the Middle East*, Observatory of Borderless Higher Education


Eurobarometer 386 (2012) *Europeans and their languages*, Special Eurobarometer 386, European Commission

Figaro (2015a) *Que pensent les cadre étrangers du management à la française?*, (French) [online] available from http://www.lefigaro.fr/emploi/2015/05/07/09005-20150507ARTFIG00012-que-pensent-les-cadres-etrangers-du-management-a-la-francaise.php [13/05/2015]

Going Global (2014a) Exploring the impacts of transnational education on host countries: a pilot study, British Council

Going Global (2014b) Impacts of transnational education on host countries: academic, cultural, economic and skills impacts and implications of programme and provider mobility, British Council

Héran, F. (2013) *No English please! Survey on the languages used for research and teaching in France*, Population & Societies, National Institute for Demographic Studies (INED)

James, W. (1907) Pragmatism: A New Name for some Old Ways of Thinking, Hackett Publishing


Transformation Experiences During the Covid-19 Pandemic: Higher Education Institute (HEI) Case Study

Nick Papé PhD⁸, Rahaman Hasan⁹, Mazharul Islam¹⁰,

Abstract

The development of the mode of learning and teaching for our College to match the need to mitigate the impact of Covid-19 pandemic, is an extraordinary story. Traditionally, we have welcomed students to a face-to-face learning experience, supported by virtual learning environments, and now, through a number of iterative stages, we find the online mode of teaching and learning is highly preferred by students of all ages. Data figures evidence increased key performance indicators of students' attendance, retention, assessment submissions, pass rates, progression and awards, as well as student satisfaction of provisions and resources emplaced by the College. All despite real changes in the learning environments involving separation of students from a collegiate environment, losing the advantages of peer interaction and constant contact with College academic staff. The threat of loneliness for the individual student is ever present and remains a direct concern of all staff.

Key Words: Covid-19 Pandemic; Blended Learning; Loneliness; Online Learning

⁸ Principal, London Churchill College
⁹ Head of Programmes and Academic Monitoring, London Churchill College, PhD Candidate (University of Essex)
¹⁰ Head of Data and IT, London Churchill College
Introduction

‘Necessitate est ingenii mater’\(^{11}\)

The Covid-19 pandemic continues to have a profound effect of the lives of a wide population as a whole and stakeholders in Higher Education Institutes in particular. Coagulations with identified foci and outcomes will continue to find ways to contain the virus whilst immunisation is sought. This is a worldwide challenge and phenomenon, which will be addressed beyond the sole interests of nation states and indeed HEIs. Universities are asked to act as arbiters and purveyors of research, bridging the gap between scientific research ‘…and actionable findings that can deliver a positive impact across societies…’ (Blom et al, 2020:257). Inter alia, this would not be restricted to universities but include more generally, all HEIs including private Colleges.

Contiguously, the role of the private College through the pandemic is to maintain an equilibrium and remain steadfast in its support of its students and staff, perhaps eschewing the higher academic advantages of applying research to find immunity. However, its drive must be to mitigate the impact of the pandemic for and on behalf of its stakeholders: in particular, the interests of students.

The College is identified as a medium-sized enterprise, with a history of successfully delivering Higher National Diploma courses in Business Management, Health & Social Care and Hospitality Management. Students are UK/EU qualified, mainly with origins in South East Asia, Africa and East Europe. Courses run for 2 years, and students attend on a full-time basis. Traditionally education has been campus-based with support from Virtual Learning Environments. For this study, responses are captured over two academic semesters (comprising 18 teaching weeks) using electronic quantitative survey questionnaires with 674 students (358 and 316 in April and September 2020 semester respectively).

So, what could we do, as a College?

It did not take the Directors and Management long to decide that we had to adapt to different circumstances. In March 2020, there was an overwhelming understanding that immediately, we had to produce an educational plan in this threatened time, driven by Management, to provide an experience which would be

\(^{11} ‘Necessity is the Mother of Invention’; the true author of the exact phrase, necessity is unknown, but it is credited to Benjamin Jowett, an administrator in the University of Oxford. In his translation of 1871 Plato’s Republic, there comes a phrase – ‘The true creator is necessity, who is the mother of our invention.’ The phrase is strikingly similar to the proverb ‘necessity is the mother of invention’ and has a similar meaning. Prior to the translations by Jowett, the phrase was still popular in England, but in Latin. Earliest known use of the Latin phrase is documented to be by William Horman, who used the Latin phrase “Mater atrium necessitas” meaning in English “The mother of invention is necessity.”
valued mainly by students, but also importantly by regulators, that would secure the educational journey resulting in increased opportunities for employment and/or developing skill sets to drive self-employment for each and every individual.

The plan evolved addressing strict criteria. Firstly, the teaching model had to enhance the students' experience, not its detriment. Secondly no major decision would be taken without full recourse to all stakeholders, including students. Thirdly all staff, particularly academic staff, would have to be consulted meaningfully about any changes to the way we delivered education. Fourthly regulatory issues needed to be addressed. We recognised that we must stay within the parameters of regulations and consult widely where appropriate.

To implement steps to deliver the outcomes of any changes, we considered our structure and whether this was robust enough to withstand the demands of a changing scenario. After wide consultation, the College agreed to form the Covid-19 Action Working Party (CAW) as a sub-group of and reporting to the Principal's Executive Group (PEG). CAW would meet weekly and function to agree operational decisions regarding the daily running of the College during the period of the pandemic. CAW membership included Heads of Departments and other members of staff on an occasional basis as appropriate. Chaired by the Principal, regular reports were to be submitted to senior boards for oversight. Within CAW there would be three further sub-groups: CAWLearn with responsibility for recommending educational arrangements; CAWGov with responsibility for ensuring the updating of public information, including governance documentation; and CAWQual with responsibility for updating policies, procedures and processes as well as meeting outcomes of regulatory requests and/or recommendations.

**Educational Offering**

The first focus was to address the challenge presented by the pandemic in March 2020. After considerable debate, the College took the primary decision, approved by the Academic Board, to move from campus-based learning to virtual learning and from 01 April 2020 all learning and teaching would be online. This was a major departure from the traditional experience of delivering campus-based learning, and the College was very aware of the need to offer a student experience that could in some way replicate the advantages of social interaction enjoyed on a campus. The need for this was College-driven, and subsequent experience has suggested that students seem not to value campus attendance for peripheral activities as much as much as previously thought.

In July 2020, as the pandemic developed and requirements for social distancing in organisations was introduced, a further stage was discussed and approved, again by the Academic Board. There was the added necessity to cater for reduced numbers physically, allowing students on campus densities of 30-50% only and resulting in detailed planning and room allocations.

For the September 2020 semester, we introduced a blended learning model, which included online learning and teaching for all traditional classroom
activities and campus-based learning for resource acquisition, administrative and academic support. However, even then, ever mindful of our values in involving students in decision-making, all campus-based activities were made available as an option for students to decide on face-to-face or online access. The method of implementing these stages became the responsibility of CAW under the authority of PEG and approval of the Academic Board. In many ways, blended learning was a more ‘comfortable’ fit for the College, as a substantial part of the curriculum had been delivered over the years via a highly popular and interactive Virtual Learning Environment (VLE).

**From Campus to Online Learning**

The axiom ‘online learning’ seems to be used interchangeably with virtual learning, as if somehow it is a lesser form. This seems a misunderstanding of the definition of virtual, not to be confused with ersatz, predicted on false representation.

For students studying in an online environment, social interaction with peers and educators can often be an exercise in exasperation. If such frustration is to be minimised, much thought must be given to the methods of communication that will be utilised, so that the online environment fulfils the human desire for social interaction. McInerney & Roberts (2004) posit:

> …asynchronous communication may not give the immediacy that is required for successful social interaction. The lapsed time that can occur between question and answer may not assuage the tyrannies of distance, time zones, and isolation from which learners may suffer…” (2004: 73).

The inability to intermingle freely with other students may exacerbate feelings of loneliness and not provide an ideal environment for successful study. The College has emplaced a number of procedures, both at management and programme levels. These include the incorporation of protocols and guidelines for social interaction into the learning concepts of the online environment (Curry, 2000) and can be utilised to minimise the feelings of ‘aloneness’ that can disturb many students.

**From Online to Blended Learning**

Several definitions of blended learning exist. One frequently cited definition is the mix of traditional and interactive-rich forms of classroom instruction with learning technologies (Bielawski & Metcalf, 2003). Other authors offer the definition of an integrated approach utilising strategically planned instructional or non-instructional approaches for fostering learning and performance (Rosett, *et al*, 2003). For this study and indeed for the College, blended learning is defined as the appropriate mix and use of face-to-face instructional methods and various learning technologies to support planned learning and foster subsequent learning outcomes.

The blended learning model has the potential to house a gradual modification of understanding in the theory and practice of mobile learning from a techno-centric perspective, focused on the characteristics of the technology, to a learner-centered perspective focused on the mobility of the learner (not just space and time, but also...
access to people and resources) and settings (Kukulska-Hulme et al, 2018). This model informs our uptake and delivery as well as resourcing.

The Experience

The first area of concern in deciding to move to blended learning was the College’s capability for encouraging students to attend online teaching sessions. The overall College attendance captured in April 2020 was 80.03%, followed by 72.91% in September 2020 semester. In both instances the College experienced significantly higher attendance rates, compared to attendance rates in traditional teaching semesters. Survey results conducted with students over the two terms complements these results. An exceptional 99% and 100% students in the final teaching week of April 2020 and September 2020 semesters respectively, responded that they found it easy to join the online classes. The lowest response of 91% in this regard was captured in the first teaching week of the April 2020 semester.

When the students were asked to register their overall experience in attending online teaching sessions, the satisfaction rates captured were also at exceptionally high levels (99% in April and 100% in September).

The second and third areas of concern that the College had to address carefully related to assessment: in particular, how to encourage students to submit assignments on time and to achieve a satisfactory pass mark, when opportunities for face-to-face tutoring were limited. In both categories the College found that performance results improved significantly when compared with results obtained in the College’s traditional mode of teaching.

Conclusion

The data is conclusive. The learning is centered around feedback from students studying from remote locations. The online model is extraordinarily popular with students, allowing virtual contact with College academic staff. Certainly, staff are supportive and have adapted well to a regime of working from home.

The future of the College looks strong, albeit utilising a greater reliance on online teaching and learning, much to the pleasure of our main stakeholder, the student.

References


Theory for and as Social Practice of Realizing the Future: *Implications from a Transformative Activist Stance*\textsuperscript{12}

Anna Stetsenko\textsuperscript{13}, PhD

Abstract

There is a pressing need today for alternative models of science – at the intersection of theory, methods, and practice – that abandon claims to “objectivist” scientism with its notion of knowledge as a mirror-reflection of reality and its belief in “raw” facts disconnected from human practices. The challenge, at the same time, is to move beyond postmodernist approaches marked by relativist indecision, self-defeating skepticism, and lack of activist positioning. This article offers steps in elaborating such an alternative in building and critically expanding on insights from Vygotsky’s project. What is suggested is a model of science as a nonneutral, transformative activist endeavor that transcends the separation between theory and practice while embracing human agency grounded in political imagination and commitment to social transformation.

**Key words**: Transformative; Activist; Social Practice; Sociocultural

\textsuperscript{12} In private correspondence with the author, the article has been updated from the original, published in The Wiley Handbook of Theoretical and Philosophical Psychology: Methods, Approaches, and New Directions for Social Sciences, First Edition.

\textsuperscript{13} Professor at The Graduate Center, City University of New York (CUNY)
Introduction

Central to a transformative activist stance is the shift away from the notion that people are merely situated in the world, and in need of adapting to it, as recipients of external stimuli, or passive hosts of brain chemistry and information processing, or products of culture shaped by social structures and processes. The alternative broad premise is that people are agentive co-creators not only of their own lives and development, but also of the very world which they collaboratively create just as they are themselves interactively created, in a dynamically recursive and bidirectional process, by their own creative and agentive acts of collaboratively realizing the world. The deliberate, goal-directed, and purposeful transformation of the world based in a commitment to social change, therefore, is taken as the foundation for human development, encompassing processes of being, doing, and knowing.

What lies beneath this conceptual shift is a strong refutation of the ethos of adaptation (so far not sufficiently challenged within sociocultural scholarship) that takes the “givenness” of the world for granted and assumes that individuals have to fit in, each on one’s own, with its status quo while competing with others for its resources. The alternative model, termed “transformative activist stance” (TAS) (see Stetsenko 2012, 2010, 2008 and for application, Vianna and Stetsenko 2011) is premised on the sociopolitical ethos of solidarity and equality that counters principles of adaptation as the core grounding for human development. In place of adaptation, the TAS predicates ontology and epistemology on the notion of moving beyond the status quo and enacting the future through agentive contributions to collaborative practices carried out across the dimensions of the past, the present, and the future at the intersection of individual and collective agency. In capitalizing on social transformation and activist agency, the TAS revives the abiding urgency of the struggle for a better future and, moreover, theorizes such a struggle as ontologically and epistemologically central to all forms of human being, doing, and knowing. This approach follows with the critical tradition that connects theorizing with politically engaged activism (e.g., Freire 1970; for details, see Stetsenko and Arievitch, 2004) and joins in with the efforts to provide an antidote to the cynical relativism and political quietism.

Landscape

There have been many important advances in recent critical scholarship encompassing feminist, critical race, (dis)ability and post-colonial theories, critical literacy, postmodernist, hermeneutical, and Marxist frameworks, sociocultural and Vygotskian approaches, critical pedagogy and participatory action research, among others. One of the central achievements of this diverse scholarship, in fact conceptually unifying its various strands (their differences at other levels notwithstanding), contests the centuries old objectivist canon according to which the pursuit of knowledge is a value-neutral endeavor independent of practices, histories, and contexts of its production. Common to many of these perspectives indeed is the premise about the entanglement of knowledge with the practices of its production, inclusive of dimensions such as
historically evolved power differentials, culturally situated interests, political values, and ideological positions.

However, there remain ambiguities and tensions, especially pertaining to the question of how knowledge claims can be evaluated in terms of accuracy, reliability, and validity. The continuing conundrum is that, on one hand, it is clear (after decades of work in critical scholarship) that a one-to-one correspondence between reality and knowledge posited by objectivist science leads to intractable problems. On the other hand, the position that knowledge is situated within practices, organized by discursive resources, and therefore contingent, contextually relative, and historically specific, has come to be associated, especially in postmodernism, with the view that it is impossible to discern among competing knowledge claims and justify choice among them to ground social actions. Although groundbreaking and progressive in many respects, various strands within critical scholarship lead to relativism and radical indeterminacy that are ontologically mute and politically indecisive. Most critically, these works do not provide grounds for how knowledge claims could be justified if it is understood that they are not impartial and instead, de facto, always pursue specific interests and agendas. As a result, insofar as researchers accept that values, interests, and power dynamics permeate knowledge, they still are facing (and themselves grapple with) the charge of ideological partiality that is considered to be incompatible with the traditionally understood “objective” science.

Emblematic of this conundrum is that the notion of experience used as central in many perspectives is too strongly tied to what is going on in the present and does not sufficiently engage future-oriented dimensions of human practices. Experience and related notions of interpretation, dialogue, and situativity of knowing have been important in challenging traditional “objectivist” models and accounts. Yet these notions require further critical elaboration to more resolutely break away from the idea that individuals need to adapt to what is “given” in the present in order to develop and learn. The notion of participation (Lave and Wenger 1991) only partly revo
ces this connotation because it implies similar dynamics of persons being situated in present community practices, rather than transforming and transcending these practices in creating a different future.

Moreover, many researchers, including those in the Vygotskian tradition, have been reluctant to ally themselves with any explicit political position (for examples, see Prilleltensky 1997; Stetsenko and Arievitch 2004), apparently believing that this would tie them to dogmatic approaches. As a result, critical approaches are still often ridden with anxiety that adopting goals (teloi, endpoints) may lead to “partisan politics” and thus, not meet the expectations of stakeholders (Penuel and O’Connor 2010). Ambiguity is evident in that researchers are often merely satisfied to accept that our knowing is from a perspective, calling on researchers to articulate and pay attention to what is seen as partialities presumed somehow to saturate or even “pollute” research and knowledge. The assumption is that researchers
cannot escape perspectival “blind spots” and have to live with what is understood to be an unavoidable limitation imposed on knowing and doing research.

In order to provide strong foundations for nonneutral positions, since “objective” foundations and warrants for knowledge are rejected, a radically revised ontology and epistemology, and a general worldview that embeds them, are required. Critical scholarship that wants to pursue social change and action beyond those of interpretation, description, and deconstruction, requires a worldview that implicates knowledge as perspectival (not value and politics free), yet provides grounds for adjudicating among knowledge claims while legitimizing how people come to form accurate and veridical, albeit neither disinterested nor incontestable, knowledge of the world.

Vygotsky's Project

In many ways, Vygotsky's project – conceived and implemented in the crucible of a radical revolutionary project in Russia in the early 20th century – predated many of the later developments in critical and postmodernist frameworks. In fact, it remains unique in the history of psychology for its clear grounding in dialectical materialist philosophy and its commitment to ideals of social justice and equality directly embodied in its theoretical tenets, methodology, and practical applications. The profound saturation of Vygotsky’s project by these ideals and the sociopolitical ethos at its core (often ignored in contemporary interpretations) makes it relevant and applicable within current struggles, of great urgency given the current sociopolitical and economical crisis, to improve social practices, especially in education.

The unique vision on human development, mind, and learning developed within the cultural-historical school has radical, and quite contemporary, implications for theory and methodology that resonate with critical scholarship today. In particular, this project evolved as a value-laden, collaborative endeavor immersed in the sociopolitical practices of its time, came to embody these practices, and ultimately contributed to them through its participants’ civic-scholarly activism. Indeed, rather than being confined to an “ivory tower” of purely academic pursuits, Vygotsky and his followers were directly engaged in practical endeavors, first and foremost in policies of reorganizing the national system of education and devising special programs for the homeless, poor, and children with special needs. This engagement situated Vygotsky and his colleagues directly at the epicenter of highly charged sociopolitical practices of the time, as immediate participants and actors (Vygodskaya and Lifanova 1996), turning their pursuits into a unique blend of theory, practice, ideology, and politics (Stetsenko and Arievitch 2004). Participants of this project worked not on abstract ideas, but rather, on developing theory in the midst of advancing new approaches for a society that itself was in the process of being created – under the aegis of an emancipatory agenda rooted in ideals of social justice and equality (the subsequent retreat from this agenda notwithstanding). One of the immediate goals
was to provide equal access to education for all children, especially those with special needs and from underprivileged backgrounds.

This goal was directly coupled with the stance of solidarity and egalitarianism—an unwavering belief in fundamental human equality that knows no boundaries imposed by nature yet requires cultural supports and mediations interactively provided by others for it to be realized. It is likely the embedding of this project within the highly turbulent context of an unprecedented sociopolitical turmoil and transformation—spanning two revolutions, World War I, and a civil war—that opened up the opportunity for its participants to take a uniquely activist stance attuned to immediate realities of human struggles and dramatic expressions of human agency at the nexus with historical change. In actively and agentively contributing to ongoing social transformation, in a direct link to creating new radical alternatives in the conditions of social existence, especially education, this project de facto challenged traditional models of science steeped in the ethos of adaptation.

Participants of this project did not explicitly address ideological-political issues and the embedding of their project within transformative social practices of their time, nor how their own commitments, values, and ideology were parts of their theory and methodology. Yet, Vygotsky elaborated a number of critical elements for a new model of psychology premised on activism and the ethos of solidarity and equality. These elements included (by way of a brief account for a lack of space): (1) insistence on cultural-historical origins of mind in shared and collaborative, culturally mediated activity and on psychological processes being co-constructed by interacting individuals relying on historically evolved cultural resources within the ever-shifting and dynamic zones of proximal development, (2) the notion of disability as a socially constructed phenomenon contingent on access to requisite cultural tools for development, and (3) the positing of practice to be the linchpin of knowledge and science. In this conception, the mind and its products, such as knowledge (and other forms of human subjectivity traditionally understood as an inward “mentation”), were conceived of as forms of social activity—initially always intersubjective, that is, carried out as interactions that only gradually are turned into intrasubjective actions that have their antecedents, constituents, and consequences in material social practice. Also remarkable was Vygotsky’s nontraditional model of experimentation that eschewed a moral order of disinterestedness and distance central to so-called “objective experimentation” (cf. Morawski 1994). Instead of copying reality and striving to disclose it “as it is,” this model actively and intentionally created artificial conditions to co-construct the very processes under investigation in order to study them in the act of co-construction via cultural mediation. The radical crux of this approach was captured by Leontiev, whose words were conveyed by Bronfenbrenner (1977: 528), a scholar directly and profoundly influenced by Vygotsky’s project, in concluding remarks of his influential work:
It seems to me that American researchers are constantly seeking to explain how the child came to be what she is; we [however]...are striving to discover not how the child came to be what she is, but how she can become what she not yet is. (emphasis added)

This approach thus posited a number of principles and above all, directly embodied and enacted in its own realization, a model of science that does not fit with the exclusively positivist goal to provide a naturalistic account of human development based on a “view from nowhere.” Instead, its paramount goal can be interpreted to be about overcoming the separation between scientific exploration, on one hand, and an ideological-critical orientation and emancipatory action, on the other. In this work, theory and methodology were developed in close (though implicit) alliance with an ideology and an ethics of social justice and equality in order to make possible a practical intervention into the course of human development as the pathway to social change. This project, in other words, laid the grounds for a novel type of psychology with a new mission. This was a psychology devoted not to pursuit of knowledge per se, but to creating knowledge as part and parcel of larger scale projects that self-consciously commit to and participate in creating new forms of social life and communal practices.

**Transformative Activist Stance**

Vygotsky’s project thus outlined a number of conceptual premises that can be used in elaborating models of science attuned to activism and social change. Moreover, coupling these premises with an account of how this project came to be enacted in its own implementation as an activist contribution to radical social change suggests a number of ways to advance a model of science as a transformative endeavor of an activist nature. In articulating and furthering this approach, the transformative activist stance elaborates an ontology and an epistemology that put a premium on the broad goals and visions of what researchers aim to achieve and contribute to – as their **endpoints**. The notion of endpoints represents an important addition to that of standpoints (Harding 1991; for further discussion, see Stetsenko 2008).

Central to transformative ontology and epistemology is the notion of the dual and ceaseless dynamics at the **shifting nexus** of people collaboratively transforming their world while bringing it into existence through the very process of agentively contributing to collaborative and communal modifications of existing realities. Although the notion of transformation is very familiar to scholars in the critical tradition and especially honored in Marxism, its radical implications at all levels of theorizing, including about the process of knowledge production and its warrants, have not been fully addressed. Working out this premise is fraught with difficulties – philosophical as well as political and ethical ones. Many critical and postmodernist scholars associate this premise with the legacy of perpetuating oppressive social structures and policies. This requires that conditions for reinstating this premise within a dialectical-transformative worldview (rather than a mechanistic and even a contextualist-relational one), underpinned by notions of social change and activism and by ideals of social equality and solidarity, be carefully worked out.
The suggested twin assumptions of the TAS that expand on Vygotsky’s project are that, first, the world is dynamic, fluid, and constantly changing (this assumption is broadly shared in critical scholarship); moreover and most critically, the world is understood as changing through people’s own activities and activist contributions to their communities and practices. The world therefore is a continuous process that is turned into an actuality through human action (Stetsenko 2012) and made real to the extent that it is realized (to borrow the expression from Castañeda 2002) by people themselves, in their day-to-day lives, struggles, and pursuits. Therefore, human beings are agentive actors who co-create their worlds and their futures, the very reality they live in as they transformatively realize (enact and embody) this reality through their own acts and deeds, thus always incurring changes in the status quo, rather than merely adapting to what exists in the present.

Second, in collectively realizing changes in the world, human beings themselves come into existence precisely through these very acts of their social agency and activism, that is, in and through them coming to matter in the world understood as a dynamic flow of social practices.

*Ontologically*, the assumption is that the world is not just “given” in its status quo, as a fixed and static structure “out there” that exists independently of us and unfolds on its own grounds, no matter what we do. Instead, the world is seen as historically evolving, that is, continuously changing and constantly moving because of what people do in their collaborative practices and enactments of social life.

Thus, the world is understood as being “in the making” and moreover, not on its own, but in the making by people, that is, as composed of collaborative practices to which all individuals qua social actors contribute in their own unique ways. Reality, therefore, is seen as an *arena of social practices*, enacted through individually unique acts and deeds that, at the same time, are profoundly social. A related assumption is that human beings do not preexist social transformative practices to then join in with and adapt to them. Instead, human beings are “always already” constituted by social practices that are formative of their lives and development, yet by those practices as they are carried out and constantly transformed by people themselves in their own pursuits and efforts at becoming.

*Epistemologically*, the process of knowing is understood to be contingent on activist involvements in, and contributions to, collaborative transformative practices. This is in line with the well-known Marxist maxim that in order to know the world, we have to change it. This maxim is extended by highlighting that because change is impossible without an orientation to the future, a commitment to a destination of one’s projects and pursuits indelibly colours the process of knowing in all of its dimensions and expressions. Thus, knowing is fully reliant on how we position ourselves vis-a-vis ongoing social practices and their historically evolved structures and conflicts (reliant on our knowledge of these practices and their histories).
Yet such positioning is possible in light of how we imagine the future and what we take “ought to be.”

Human development, in this approach, is a constant work-in-progress by people who simultaneously create the world and, in and through these creative acts of change, also bring themselves into existence. In other words, development is a collaborative achievement of an activist nature in that it relies upon people forming and carrying out their future-oriented agendas and projects of social transformation. These agendas centrally involve taking an activist stance grounded in a vision, or “endpoint,” of how present community practices ought to be changed and, thus, what kind of future ought to be created. The key point is that our practices and therefore our reality (coterminous with our own becoming) is already shaped, or tailored, to a future that is sought after and posited as desirable and necessary – and not as an abstract notion, but rather, as something one commits to and brings into reality. The future, therefore, never simply awaits us, but instead, is created by our own actions in the present – through even seemingly mundane deeds by common people in their ordinary lives (implying that actually no deed is completely mundane, no person completely common, and no life completely ordinary). This horizon of where people strive to get to, this “yet to come” reality, therefore, is taken as no less real than anything going on in the present.

The transformative ontology and epistemology posit that we live in the world that we ourselves create, through social practices and while relying on cultural tools, always in relations with other human beings and in view of the goals and endpoints that we imagine and also to which we aspire and commit. Therefore, knowledge too – embedded in and derivative of social practices, in the presently existing conditions and their contradictions that are only understandable in light of their historical unfolding (as broadly acknowledged in critical scholarship) – is at the same time, and most critically, premised on and constituted by a projection into the future. That is, knowledge is constituted by our activities not merely in the “here and now,” but at the intersection of the past, the present, and the future. Knowing, as all forms of social practice, is understood to be ontologically determined by acts of transformation in the connotation of creating novelty and moving beyond the given, of transcending the status quo, rather than by passive processes of people being situated, merely dwelling in, or experiencing the world (as the ethos of adaptation implies).

The suggested approach of the TAS bears some similarity to, yet is not identical with, other notions that also tap into the future such as addressivity (Bakhtin 1986) and prolepsis (Cole 1996) that both draw attention to the future as already existing in and affecting the present. The difference, however, is that whereas both prolepsis and addressivity highlight that the future is anticipated and even posited as if it already obtains, the TAS notion of commitment to the future, predicated on what one believes ought to be, is more agentive and purposive.

The focus on commitment suggests that persons do not so much expect or anticipate the future, but
rather, _actively work and struggle_ to bring this future into reality through their own deeds, even if the future is not anticipated as likely and instead, requires struggle and active striving, often against the odds, to achieve it. This refers to persons and communities struggling for their ideals, for what “ought to be,” thus bringing the future into the present in spite of the powerful forces that are pulling in other directions, that is, while resisting and overcoming the present in its status quo, power hierarchies, and contradictions. The notion of commitment, therefore, is agentive and ethically valuational because it entails _struggle for the future_ rather than merely its anticipation.

The resulting model follows a long tradition in critical scholarship that links understandings of human development to value-laden conceptions about self and society, exemplified in Freire’s works. The TAS highlights that it is precisely the envisioned endpoint of social practices – such as fundamental human equality and equal access to resources – that forms the key to the model of human development and sciences that study it across dimensions of theory, methodology, and practice. The complex dialectic implied in this premise is that it is impossible to imagine a possible future unless we have located ourselves in the present and its history; however, the reverse is also true in that we cannot locate ourselves in the present and its history _unless_ we imagine the future and commit to creating it.

Marx treated knowledge as inherently related to the practical realization of human ideals, with pursuit of each serving the other. While the implication about close ties, and in fact an ontological blending, of theory and practice is one aspect of this position, its other emphasis is on the centrality of ideals, or endpoints. To highlight this, it is useful to return to the unique blending of theory and practice within Vygotsky’s project to address how in fact this blending was made possible by this project’s reliance on overarching ideological commitment and endpoint.

The ideological vision at work in Vygotsky’s project had to do with a commitment to creating psychology for a society in which all individuals are fundamentally equal and where each one attains freedom and autonomy in and through contributing to the freedom and autonomy of others, thus blending one’s self-realization with that of others in a truly collaborative and solidaristic endeavor.

Two interrelated themes that can be inferred from his works are important here. The first one is Vygotsky’s passionate egalitarianism – the idea about the inalienable and profound equality of people, including the implication that all students have unlimited potential to learn with no rigidly preimposed “natural” constraints or _ceiling_. No limits, putatively imposed by some “indomitable nature,” such as believed to be expressed in genes, are in principle set on the outcomes of development and learning in advance of learners engaging with the world and in disregard of them getting access to (or being deprived of) _adequate cultural supports_. Although individual differences exist and are especially pronounced by the time children get to school, these differences result from interactions with the environment and are thus contingent on what the environment has or
has not offered by way of cultural mediation and support. Because development and learning are thoroughly contingent on cultural tools provided by society, no biological endowment (natural predispositions) can be evoked to account for, let alone justify, failure or success in development and learning by either groups or individuals.

The second theme is the imperative of a dynamic connectedness and ineluctable sociality of people as beings who only come to be through collaborative endeavors conducted together with, and through, the merged efforts with other human beings — as implied in the notions of shared practices and cultural mediation. Vygotsky was involved in the radical project of creating theory and research for a new society that was supposed to create conditions for setting individuals free. Yet freedom was seen as coming about, in line with the Marxist ethos, only if individuals are provided with the social and cultural tools for their development and only if they achieve their own freedom through contributing to the larger societal project of achieving freedom for all. Thus, individual freedom was seen as a condition that can be attained only together, in tandem and collaboration with other people, while using tools that society provides, and on the condition of coordinating the goals of individual and collective freedom. In thus placing egalitarianism and solidarity together, Vygotsky, like Marx before him, can be interpreted to associate human freedom with our dependency upon each other for our very existence and development, while inserting the quest for equality and solidarity right into the midst of the active project of seeking freedom. In this sociopolitical ethos, the concepts of freedom and solidarity are coordinated and rendered simultaneously political, ontological, and epistemological.

It is arguably this ethos that underlies and marks the uniqueness of Vygotsky’s project. Most remarkably, this notion of equality (still radical by today’s standards) is used in a dual way, serving as both a presupposition for, and a product of, research and theory building. On the one hand, it is derived from an ethical-political commitment to social equality taken as an ideal that underwrites and guides theory and explorations into human development and learning. On the other hand, this ethos and its principles are arrived at in the course of a systematic study of human development along dimensions of history, phylogeny, and ontogeny. These dual aspects in utilizing the notion of equality are not in contradiction because studying how things are is taken to be possible under a commitment to how things should be; that is, while overcoming the infamous “is” versus “ought” dichotomy.

Such an approach, counterintuitive from the standpoint of the traditional experimentation paradigm, is consistent with Vygotsky’s notion that the methods and objects of investigation are always intimately linked with one another, whereby the methodology of research and its knowledge products are not ontologically separate but indivisibly merged as tools and results (Vygotsky 1997; see Newman and Holzman 1993, for a related but not identical interpretation). From this position, methodological tools, strategies, and techniques result not in the uncovering of facts “as they are” at the present
moment, but rather, in constructing phenomena and processes in nonneutral ways in line with researchers’ epistemological and ideological commitments. The resulting broad dialectical framework itself is developed precisely with an intention for it to be part and parcel of practices, policies, and research grounded in ideals alternative to social Darwinism with its malignant belief in inborn inequalities and its emphasis on competition for resources in place of solidarity, coupled with a “testing mania” of educational strategies steeped in assess-and-control ideology.

This approach, therefore, does not take the ideal of equality as an abstract notion. Instead, it takes a stand on, and commits to, matters of equality as the first analytical step that leads all other methodological strategies and theoretical choices and, thus, attempts to realize equality in the process of knowledge building – with theory and knowledge themselves understood as not opposed to, nor separated from, larger sociopolitical practices and projects. This approach, therefore, consists in privileging the act of taking a stand on matters of sociopolitical and cultural-historical significance.

In this approach, the questions “Who is talking?” and “What is the location from which one is talking?”, highlighted as central in all critical scholarship, are augmented by the “What for?” question that addresses the purposes, goals, and endpoints as central to doing science. This is the question as to what our scientific endeavors “do” in bringing about the future. These questions are embraced in elevating the demand to explicate and reflect upon the endpoints and goals of science, which is understood as a facet of transformative practice, a form of doing that participates in the enactment and transformation of the real.

The strategy, in other words, is not to test the assumption of equality in some abstractly neutral, detached and “objective” sense but instead, to undertake efforts to provide conditions for making this assumption true, including at the level of supportive theoretical construction, as one of the steps in the overall project of creating equality in education (see Rancière 1991, on a related though not identical view). This approach departs from the traditional standards of objectivity as a study of “naked,” brute facts disconnected from the histories, contexts, and practices that spawn and give them meaning. It also departs from understanding equality as a self-executing “given,” attending instead to the need to bring about equality through continuous efforts of supporting, sustaining, and achieving it, including efforts at the level of theory building. That is, the approach is not so much to prove that all human beings are equal, as to work out a theory of human development and learning within an explicit quest to achieve equality and create conditions in which this can be done under the assumption that equality ought and can be achieved. This strategy epitomizes the TAS in its claim that the taking up of a stance on matters of social and political significance is the key ontological step and an inherent dimension in any investigation – as the foundational principle for human being, doing, and knowing.
The role of knowledge and theory, in this approach, is radically recast as they are turned into instruments of social practice imbued with activism and transformative change whereby research is carried out not with the neutral goal of uncovering what is “out there” in the world and somehow posited to exist independently from human practices, but rather, with the goal of creating and inventing new forms of social practices and human development. Knowledge is never about getting “impartial” facts about how things are, as broadly acknowledged in critical scholarship. What the TAS helps to clarify in addition, is that this is because things are already and constantly changing by the mere act of our presence (especially because our presence is never “mere”) and even more so, by our investigations, our posing questions and especially by envisioning things being otherwise and acting on these visions. Thus, our “access” (if this term is appropriate at all) to reality, being carried out through and in the form of active engagement that creates the world rather than mirrors it, is infused with our subjectivity – with goals, hopes, expectations, beliefs, biases, and commitments. That is, because we always act in pursuit of goals rather than mechanically react to the world as it “impinges” on us as if we were passive recipients of outside stimuli, the production of knowledge is profoundly contingent on what individuals and communities consider should be while actively realizing these commitments in the present. Moreover, because knowledge is seen as but one dimension within the ceaseless flow of social practices that constitute no less than reality itself, entwined with processes of being and doing, producing knowledge is always an act of creating reality and inventing the future.

The TAS offers a way out of conundrums spawned by the rigid dichotomy of relativism versus objectivist fundamentalism and absolutism. Instead of this dichotomy, the methodology charted on the basis of Vygotskian and other activist scholarship such as Freire’s, suggests how to relativize relativism itself – a fair move given that relativism insists on relativity as the supreme lens and thus should itself be subjected to its major prescription. According to the TAS, people are “flagrantly partisan” (to use Deweyan expression) and so too is truth flagrantly partisan. But this does not make truth relative in any traditional sense, that is, not in the sense of various viewpoints and positions all being equal because they are all “equally relative,” that is, all partial, situated, and subjective. Instead, truth is historically and politically relative if viewed on the scale of infinite dynamics of human history, yet robust and concrete within a historically particular epoch, as defined by its specific predicaments that are determined, in no uncertain terms, by concrete sociocultural and political-economical conditions. These conditions are immediately accessible to anyone living in their midst, because these are processes that are carried out by people themselves in their own ongoing struggles and strivings, with these activities constituting no less than the fabric of human development and of the world itself. The truth about these contradictions and conflicts is therefore positively (not positivistically) and, in historical terms, concretely
(not universally) determinate. Truth is relative vis-
a-vis practical projects and agendas of resolving existing conflicts and contradictions, such as a struggle by disadvantaged groups for equal access to resources. Yet within these historically concrete conditions, truth is far from relative; instead, it is strongly determinate and robustly concrete. For anybody experiencing first-hand or merely sharing and witnessing the plight of disadvantaged groups and individuals – and it is hard not to witness this plight given its powerful presence for anyone willing to see and feel – there is nothing relative about its urgency and truth and not much relative about the need to take a stand and a commitment on one or the other side in the struggle to overcome this plight.

Claims to knowledge and its validity are as determinate and robust as it gets, though only within the practical-political projects – defined by goals and visions for a better future – that spawn this knowledge and which purposes knowledge serves. This does not make claims to truth and warrants for knowledge any less valid – in the sense that this position constitutes not a relativity of truth but, on the contrary, a truth of the relative (cf. Deleuze and Guattari 1994), such as the truth of struggling against inequality. That is, while any struggle is always historically and politically specific and contingent, it is also determinate and concrete within a given historical epoch that each “knows” its own truth (to use Sartre’s (1968) expression).

It is widely acknowledged in critical scholarship that knowledge is contextually and historically situated, and that only if we have gained insight into the kind of historically situated reality to which knowledge is tied can we raise questions about its relevance and validity. To this claim, the more radical critical scholarship, including feminist writings (e.g., Harding 1991), adds that it is the subjugated who, through experiences of oppression, produce knowledge that is privileged to unmask the truth, such as prevalent social injustices. The TAS offers one addition to these important directions, namely that knowledge claims are contingent not only on presently existing conditions and their histories (hence the value of standpoint epistemology and historical ontology, the latter claimed by Foucault, cf. Chapter 11); knowledge claims are also, and perhaps most critically, contingent on the future-oriented projects that aim to overcome existing conditions and their injustices, carry out changes in the present community practices, and thus enact the future and realize it the present. Therefore, to interrogate knowledge claims in terms of their validity, it is imperative to interrogate and validate sociopolitical projects and movements that spawn and necessitate knowledge in the first place.

Thus, the critical matter in validating knowledge claims is to interrogate them in terms of what kind of a future they contribute to and whether they contribute to creating a society in which individuals are free to create themselves in pursuit of solidarity and equality. In this approach, truth is taken to be an essentially practical rather than purely philosophical matter. However, an additional specification is crucial. For pragmatists too, truth does not have to do with copying but rather, with coping with the world (Wood 2000).
Within the TAS developed on the grounds of Vygotsky’s project, as suggested herein, this position can be accepted on a condition that coping with the world is recast away from connotations of adaptation to the status quo. Instead, coping needs to and can be replaced with the notion of activism as the process through which people actively and deliberately transform circumstances and conditions of their life in simultaneously creating their world and themselves.

It is within this radically revised notion of transformative social practice as the foundation of human existence that the warrants for knowledge and truth can be recast. In this perspective, truth is not established, nor found, but instead created in the course of ethical-political endeavors – including endeavors of research and theory building – of concretely realizing socially just conditions of life. Again, there is no place for relativity of truth in this approach – truth is not relative although it is not obtained through a direct correspondence with some putatively independent reality. Truth is obtained in, and as the process of, creating the world in overcoming its status quo. Knowing therefore is about neither copying the world, nor coping with it, but instead, about creating the world and getting to know its truth in the very act of bringing about transformative and creative change – in the act of making a difference in communal forms of life and thus mattering in them, and through this, of us coming to be and to know.

Conclusions

The model of science built on transformative ontology and epistemology steers a course between detached objectivism with its myopic rejection of human subjectivity and agency and blind faith in “naked” facts, on one hand, and relativism in which all is interpretation and no claims to validity of knowledge exist, on the other. The transformative activist stance is intentionally and consciously devised (hence the term stance) in ways that start from a set of values and goals (endpoints) and proceed to exploration and theory building under commitments to realizing these values and goals, as an intervention into the status quo.

Vygotsky (2004, 343) expressed an important insight when he stated that to master the truth about persons and persons themselves is impossible before humankind masters the truth about society and society itself. In further developing this view from the TAS, it can be argued that mastering truth about society and ourselves requires that we figure out our stake in society and its practices and commit to changing them.

References

Bakhtin, Mikhail. 1986. *Speech Genres and Other Late Essays* (Carol Emerson and Michael Holquist, eds.). Austin, TX: University of Texas.


Guidelines for Contributors

Introduction

The JCD&MS seeks to accommodate the interests of individuals at all levels in the Higher Education sector. A key aim is to provide opportunities for all parties interested in Higher Education to submit and publish work in a peer-reviewed academic journal in respect of issues relating to Contemporary Development, Business and Management, Health and Social Care and Education and Skills. Individuals interested in submitting work for publication in the JCD&MS may do so, using a variety of forms. [Details, see pages 3-5.]

The JCD&MS Editorial Panel seeks to expand its remit and focus beyond London Churchill College. To that end, the Principal Editor is particularly committed to providing opportunities for academic and service staff in UK private Higher Education Providers (HE) and/or those individuals engaged in collaborative arrangements, including UK Universities and other HE Awarding Bodies to produce and to publish individual and collective research results and academic papers in the Journal.

Categories for Submission

Guidelines on the categories for submission are set out to assist authors in selecting the most suitable format for their submissions. [See 'Presentation Requirements' below.]

- Academic Articles
- Research Reports
- Reviews
- Letters
- Monographs
- For Debate Articles
- Commentaries
- Editorials
- Book Reviews

Academic Articles

Academic articles are original, scholarly outputs that report findings which represent advances in the understanding of a significant problem. Academic articles can have far-reaching implications for the advancement of knowledge in a specific field.

Abstracts

Academic articles should have an abstract, separate from the main text, of up to 300 words. This is not referenced and does not contain numbers, abbreviations, acronyms or measurements unless absolutely essential. Abstracts should be understandable to readers outside the discipline.

The abstract should contain an introduction to the field; a brief account of the background and rationale of the work; a statement of the main conclusions [introduced by the phrase 'Here we show' or 'From this research...' or equivalent]; and finally, 2-3 sentences putting the main findings into general context; so that it is clear how the results described in the paper have moved the subject area forward.

Any numbers provided in the abstract must match exactly those given in the main body of the text or tables. With quantitative studies involving statistical tests, abstracts must provide p values or effect sizes with confidence intervals for key findings. The conclusion of the abstract must state the key findings of the research undertaken.

Keywords

A list of up to eight keywords should be included to identify the contents of the paper.

Structure

Academic articles should open with an introduction of around 500 words, before proceeding to a concise, focused description of the findings. Discussion and analyses of results are required.

Word count

The normal length for academic articles is 3,000-5,000 words, excluding abstracts, tables and reference lists. The word limit can be increased to 7,000-9,000 words in cases where research findings contain extensive qualitative or quantitative results.

Subheadings

The text may contain a few short subheadings. Subheadings should not be more than 40 characters in length (less than one-e line of text).
Figures and Tables

Academic Articles typically have 5 or 6 display items [figures and/or tables]. All tables and figures should be inserted into the main body of the text. The source of the information, whether it be the author’s own work or the work produced by another author should be cited immediately below the table. Legends should include keys to any symbols.

Note: In the full-text online edition of the JCD&MS, figure legends may become truncated in abbreviated links to the full-screen version. Therefore, the first 100 characters of any legend should inform the reader of key aspects of the figure or table.

References

Academic articles normally contain up to 50 references. Authors should ensure that the introduction and discussion sections of academic articles cite the most recent relevant literature and not just literature from a single research group, region or country. Academic articles may include systematic reviews and one or two of the pivotal studies that have been summarised in a particular reference.

Research Reports

Research Reports are papers reporting original findings from individual studies [or groups of studies]. The study or studies may be qualitative or quantitative and may involve experimental or non-experimental designs.

Authors of research reports should aim for no more than 3500 words excluding abstracts, tables and references. Clinical trials and studies with complex methods/analyses may require greater length to ensure full reporting of all relevant aspects of methods and results. Consequently, the main text of qualitative manuscripts may be up to 4500 words in length, including tables, to facilitate the inclusion of direct quotations.

Literature Reviews

Reviews draw together a body of literature to reach one or more major conclusions. It is expected that reviews will be ‘systematic’, which means they will set out very clearly the search strategy [including key words where appropriate], the selection criteria for the articles included, and the basis for integrating findings. A review may be up to 4000 words in length, excluding the reference list.

Letters

JCD&MS publishes solicited and unsolicited letters. They may express opinions about articles published in the Journal, report on a development, or comment on some issue of potential interest to readers. They will normally be refereed. Letters do not report new findings, unless they extend findings of a paper published in the JCD&MS. Letters should normally be no longer than 500 words with up to 20 references. If a letter comments upon a paper already published in the Journal, then this should be cited at the beginning of the letter. The author of the paper cited will be given the right to reply.

Monographs

JCD&MS will publish occasionally monographs of 4,000-10,000 words, excluding titles, abstracts, tables, figures and reference lists. Monographs constitute major pieces of substantive writing and in-depth analyses and syntheses that cannot be expressed within the normal word length limits. Monographs might include extensive systematic reviews of major topics or investigate critically a series of linked studies addressing a common research question. They are expected to provide robust theoretical underpinnings to support the primary thesis.

Authors who are interested in submitting such a piece are advised to contact the Principal Editor of JCD&MS in the first instance, as the Principal Editor will only accept monographs which are of substantial importance and aligned with the JCD&MS remit. Thereafter, decisions regarding publication will be based on outcomes of the peer review process [See the Review Process, pages 7-8.] There are no grounds for appeal where decisions have been taken by the JCD&MS Editorial Panel to reject a monograph. However, authors may elect to submit papers to the Journal written in one of the other eight formats, based upon monograph material.

Authors wishing to submit monographs for consideration should submit in the usual way, but should add a note on their cover page explaining that they would like the submission to be treated
as a monograph. [See Presentation requirements, pages 5 - 7.] Monographs should carry structured abstracts [no more than 300 words] and include headings similar to those described for Academic Articles, Research Reports or Reviews.

'For Debate' articles

'For debate' articles are opinion pieces up to around 3500 words in length. They synthesise research in a way that adds important new insights. They should be written in an international context and make one or two key points that are more in the way of opinion rather than fact. The point[s] will normally challenge existing thinking, raise an issue that has been neglected, take an issue forward that is currently being considered, or reinforce one side of a debate that is currently underway. 'For debate' articles can investigate matters of policy, treatment, assessment/diagnosis, theory or methodology and should be written in a lively and engaging style. 'For debate' articles should follow the abstract and article guidelines required for reviews.

Interested parties may submit commentaries about ‘for debate’ articles in subsequent issues. If commentaries are accepted for publication, then the author of the ‘For Debate’ article will be given the opportunity to respond to any commentaries made.

Commentaries

A commentary should add a further perspective or point of view to a particularly important item published in the JCD&MS. Rather than being a review of the article, authors should use the findings as a stepping stone to make one or two points of wider relevance to the field. A commentary will normally be between 500-1000 words in length, with up to 20 references. When commenting upon an item published previously in the Journal, a direct reference to the title and the author should be included at the beginning of the commentary and cited in the reference list. There is no abstract, but commentaries should begin with a one or two sentence summary setting out the main points.

Editorials

Editorials appear at the start of every issue of the JCD&MS. They are significant pieces of academic writing that differ substantially from academic articles, reports or reviews. Their purpose is to stimulate debate, identify issues and push ideas forward. An editorial should make one or two key points that are more in the way of opinion rather than fact. The point[s] will normally challenge existing thinking, raise an issue that has been neglected, take a current issue forward, or reinforce one side of a current debate. Editorials should be cautiously optimistic but provocative in approach. As is the case with ‘For debate’ articles, the focus is most commonly placed on matters of policy, treatment, assessment/diagnosis, theory or methodology. They should be written in a lively and engaging style with the point[s] very clearly stated and take international perspectives into account. Editorials should be no more than 1500 words in length and contain no more than 20 references. There is no abstract but editorials should begin with a statement of one or two sentences setting out the key points to be made in the work.

Book Reviews

Book reviews should place the book in the context of other literature deemed to be relevant in the field, rather than summarising the content. Books selected for review should be selected on the basis of their general relevance to contemporary developments and/ or management studies. Authors should endeavour to make them a ‘good read’. Authors should identify what is good and worthwhile in the book for JCD&MS’s varied readers. In cases where a negative appraisal of the book must be made, then the critique should be rendered in a professional manner. Book reviews should be no more than 1,000 words in length. Up to ten references may be cited.

Presentation Requirements

Front sheet[s]: applicable to all forms of submission.

Front sheet[s] should always include the title, a list of authors (including their affiliations and addresses), the word count [excluding abstract, references, tables, and figures], and a profile of the contributor of about 300 words. If applicable,
declarations of competing interest and clinical trial registration details should be provided.

**Presentation style.**

(Note: contributors not meeting requirements may be asked to resubmit their work.)

- Papers must be submitted in Microsoft WORD 2000 [or higher version].
- Margins (normal): 2.54 top and bottom and left and right.
- Alignment: justified.
- Title: Arial 12-point font and in bold capital letters.
- Names of Authors: 12-point font.
- Headings and sub-headings: Arial 10-point, Bold, with 1.5 line spacing
- Main text: Arial 10-point (normal), with 1.5 line spacing
- Paragraphs: left margin alignment
- Long quotes: indented, Arial 9 and single spaced
- Reference list, individual entries: single spaced
- Pages: numbered

**Referencing.**

Appropriate in-text citations should be used, and a full reference list should appear at the end of the paper. Authors are expected to use the Harvard Referencing system [Author, date] for listing references. If any author is unsure of the reference listing style please contact *JCD&MS*. In the reference list, contributors should include the names of the first six authors for a single work; thereafter, use the term et al. The name of the last author should also be included if this person is the senior author for the paper. Issues/parts numbers should be included. Pertinent citations to conference abstracts and/or unpublished work are welcomed, providing they support claims made in the submission. Additional information is provided in the *JCD&MS* Guidelines for Harvard Referencing.

**Submission**

Manuscripts should be submitted in a single Microsoft Word file. Files in submitted in other text versions, for example, PDF or Apple will be returned to the contributor who will need to resubmit the manuscript in the appropriate file format. Manuscripts should be emailed to journal@londonchurchillcollege.co.uk, copy to t.anderson-ajaquest@londonchurchillcollege.co.uk within the time frame advertised under the ‘Call for Papers’.

**Defamatory statements**

Authors should refrain from making defamatory statements about specific individuals or organisations, whether or not they believe such statements are justified.

**Permission to reprint source material**

If a paper uses all or parts of previously published material, the author must obtain permission from the copyright holder concerned. It is the author’s responsibility to obtain these permissions in writing and provide copies to the *JCD&MS*.

**Histograms**

Do not include histograms with three-dimensional blocks or shading as this can make interpretation difficult.

**Colour illustrations**

Authors are expected to pay the full cost for reproducing colour artwork in hard copy publications. Therefore, if there is colour artwork in the manuscript when it is accepted for publication, then the Principal Editor of *JCD&MS* will require authors to defray such costs before the paper can be published in hard copy.

**Electronic figures for publication**

Please contact the Principal Editor of *JCD&MS* for instructions regarding any high-quality images that are included in the submission.

**Supporting information**

Additional material of comprised of lengthy appendices [e.g. extensive reference lists or mathematical formulae/calculations], deemed to be relevant to a particular submission but not suitable or essential for the print edition of the Journal, may also be considered for publication in the on line version.

**English-language editing**

If English is not the first language of authors, they are advised to have their manuscript edited by a
native English speaker prior to submission. Wherever possible, the Principal Editor of JCD&MS will try to accommodate papers from authors in countries where proofreading resources in English are not available. However, if the meaning of the text provided in English is unclear, then the Principal Editor will return the manuscript to the contributor and request the contributors to re-submit work at a suitable English standard.

**Non-compliance with requirements**

A manuscript that does not comply with journal requirements will be returned to the author.

**Ethical Principles**

*JCD&MS* supports ethical principles. As such, when submitting papers online, authors will be asked to state that:

All authors have been personally and actively involved in substantive work leading to the report and will hold themselves jointly and individually responsible for its content;

All relevant ethical safeguards have been met in relation to patient or subject protection, or animal experimentation, including, in the case of all clinical and experimental studies review by an appropriate ethical review committee and evidence of written informed patient consent

Papers will be returned that contain sexist, racist or other non-acceptable language.

**Declarations of interest**

Any declarations of conflicts of interest should appear after the list of authors and addresses. Declarations of interest do not indicate wrongdoing, but they must be declared in the interests of full transparency. For example, any contractual constraints on publishing imposed by an organisation or private party that has funded the research must be disclosed. The time window for declaring such financial links is normally within three years of the date of article submission.

If an undeclared conflict of interest comes to light, the Principal Editor reserves the right to withdraw the paper from the *JCD&MS* production process.

**Plagiarism**

Plagiarism involves using someone else’s work without appropriate attribution. If sections of text numbering more than 10 words have been copied verbatim these must be put in quotation marks and a full citation given. Copying more than a few lines verbatim is not normally acceptable unless a specific reason can be given and permission has been obtained from the owner of the copyright [and the author, if different]. We will treat plagiarism as serious professional misconduct and respond accordingly.

**The Review Process**

**Review Stages**

Each manuscript is screened initially by the Principal Editor. Those deemed to be inappropriate for publication *JCD&MS* will be declined without going to full review. In those cases, authors will receive an explanation as to why the manuscript has been declined.

In addition, the Principal Editor will also return manuscripts to contributors that require substantial re-writing, because the text is unclear, the material has been poorly organised, or substantial errors in written English exist that could have been remedied had the contributors proofread their own material and conducted spelling and/or grammar checks. The initial screening process may take up to three to four weeks. Contributors who are asked to re-submit work will be given extra time to do so.

Manuscripts that pass this stage are sent to two Reviewers [who may be *JCD&MS* Editorial Panel members]. Reviewers may return the manuscript un-reviewed if a serious limitation is identified; otherwise, both reviewers will provide feedback about each submission to the Principal Editor, who will communicate the recommendations made by the two reviewers to the authors. The process should take no more than two weeks but could take up to four weeks.

If authors are invited to revise and resubmit a manuscript, then they should submit the revised version by the due date set in order to meet issue publication deadlines. An extension may be granted, if requested. A decision on the revised version may be taken by the Principal Editor or she/he may consult an Editorial Panel member or
put the revision through another full review process, depending on the nature and extent of the revisions that have been requested. A decision on the revised version should normally take less time than the original review process.

Evaluation Criteria

- Work submitted for publication in the *JCD&MS* is evaluated according to the following criteria:
- Degree to which the contribution fits within the remit of JCD&MS;
- Appropriateness of the analysis;
- Evidence of original thinking, including new ideas and insights;
- Significance of the theoretical and methodological contributions, if applicable;
- Appropriateness of the literature review, if applicable;
- Implications for practitioners, academicians and scholars;
- Quality of the discussion and interpretation of the results;
- Organisational structure;
- Coherence and clarity of text;
- Professional standard of writing (grammar, punctuation and spelling);
- Appropriate use of the Harvard referencing system.

Reviewers' Disclosure

Reviewers have the option of disclosing their identity to the authors by adding their name to the bottom of their review comments. The Editorial Panel encourages this in the interests of transparency.

Appeals

Requests for appeal will usually be considered only where the author makes a case that one or more Reviewers have clearly made a substantive mistake. Appeals will not normally be considered in cases where there is a difference of opinion about the importance of the findings nor in cases where the author believes that issues identified by the reviewers can be resolved if s/he presents a revised version.

It is important to bear in mind that the comments received by authors are primarily intended to help authors make revisions, either for publication in the *JCD&MS* or submissions elsewhere.

Occasionally, the decision not to publish an article will be made on grounds of priority given the pressure on space within a particular issue of the Journal. In those cases, individuals will be informed of opportunities available to resubmit their work at a later date.

Proof-reading and Corrections

Authors are responsible for all statements made in their contributions. Therefore, it is essential that contributors ensure their work has been carefully proof-read prior to submission. All manuscripts will be proof-read by a member of the *JCD&MS* Editorial Panel, but the *JCD&MS* will not accept responsibility for any statement or textual errors appearing in the published work that the author has failed to correct prior to final submission.

Copyright

It is a condition of publication that authors grant copyright to the *JCD&MS* for all submissions, including abstracts and illustrations, but permission to publish work in other sources is normally granted, providing requests are made to the Principal Editor.

Authors are responsible for obtaining permission to reproduce copyright material from other sources.
**Introduction**

Tommie Anderson-Jacquest, PhD, Principal Editor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Contributors</th>
<th>8</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tommie Anderson-Jacquest, PhD, Principal Editor</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Editorial. Surviving and Transiting 2020: A Year like No Other Years**

Nick Papé, PhD

**The Immoral Superego: Conscience as the Fourth Element in the Structural Theory of the Mind**

Donald L. Carveth, PhD

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>The Colonial Politics of the Plague: Reading Camus in 2020</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Nasser Amin</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Globalization and the New Realities in the Muslim World</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mohd Abbas Abdul Razak and Sayed Sikandar Shah Haneef</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Literature Review: The Use of Technology in International Markets**

Sisi Wang, Mehfuzul Haque and Golam Faqruzzaman

**Literature Review: Challenges and Opportunities of Entering International Markets**

Sohel Rana

**Literature Review: Evaluation of Delivery Strategy Standardization; Adaptation within the Framework of International Strategic Marketing**

Md Shohidul Islam Rajeb

**Literature Review: Talent Management**

Sraboni Sikder and Don Dulari Wijesuriya

**Literature Review: Education and Social Class, A Focus on Marxist Ideology**

Golam Faqruzzaman and Tasnim Jahan

**The Perceptions in France of Higher Education Programmes Taught in English**

Nicolas Verger

**Transformation Experiences During the Covid-19 Pandemic: Higher Education Institute (HEI) Case Study**

Nick Papé PhD, Rahaman Hasan and Mazharul Islam

**Theory for and as Social Practice of Realizing the Future: Implications from a Transformative Activist Stance**

Anna Stetsenko, PhD